National Library
of Canada

Acquisitions and
Bibliographic Services Branch

395 Wellington Street
Ottawa, Ontario
K1A 0N4

Bibliothèque nationale
du Canada

Direction des acquisitions et
des services bibliographiques

395, rue Wellington
Ottawa (Ontario)
K1A 0N4

Your file Votre référence

Our file Notre référence

NOTICE

The quality of this microform is heavily dependent upon the quality of the original thesis submitted for microfilming. Every effort has been made to ensure the highest quality of reproduction possible.

If pages are missing, contact the university which granted the degree.

Some pages may have indistinct print especially if the original pages were typed with a poor typewriter ribbon or if the university sent us an inferior photocopy.

Reproduction in full or in part of this microform is governed by the Canadian Copyright Act, R.S.C. 1970, c. C-30, and subsequent amendments.

AVIS

La qualité de cette microforme dépend grandement de la qualité de la thèse soumise au microfilmage. Nous avons tout fait pour assurer une qualité supérieure de reproduction.

S'il manque des pages, veuillez communiquer avec l'université qui a conféré le grade.

La qualité d'impression de certaines pages peut laisser à désirer, surtout si les pages originales ont été dactylographiées à l'aide d'un ruban usé ou si l'université nous a fait parvenir une photocopie de qualité inférieure.

La reproduction, même partielle, de cette microforme est soumise à la Loi canadienne sur le droit d'auteur, SRC 1970, c. C-30, et ses amendements subséquents.

Canada

UNIVERSITY OF ALBERTA

CAN SCHOOLS BE USED AS A TOOL TO TRANSFORM A SOCIETY? DISCREPANCY BETWEEN POLICY AND PRACTICE IN TANZANIA

BY

NIZAR K. RAJABALI

A THESIS SUBMITTED TO THE FACULTY GRADUATE STUDIES AND RESEARCH IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

IN

INTERNATIONAL/INTERCULTURAL EDUCATION
DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATIONAL FOUNDATIONS

EDMONTON, ALBERTA

SPRING, 1993

National Library
of Canada

Acquisitions and
Bibliographic Services Branch

395 Wellington Street
Ottawa, Ontario
K1A 0N4

Bibliothèque nationale
du Canada

Direction des acquisitions et
des services bibliographiques

395, rue Wellington
Ottawa (Ontario)
K1A 0N4

Your file Votre référence

Our file Notre référence

The author has granted an irrevocable non-exclusive licence allowing the National Library of Canada to reproduce, loan, distribute or sell copies of his/her thesis by any means and in any form or format, making this thesis available to interested persons.

L'auteur a accordé une licence irrévocable et non exclusive permettant à la Bibliothèque nationale du Canada de reproduire, prêter, distribuer ou vendre des copies de sa thèse de quelque manière et sous quelque forme que ce soit pour mettre des exemplaires de cette thèse à la disposition des personnes intéressées.

The author retains ownership of the copyright in his/her thesis. Neither the thesis nor substantial extracts from it may be printed or otherwise reproduced without his/her permission.

L'auteur conserve la propriété du droit d'auteur qui protège sa thèse. Ni la thèse ni des extraits substantiels de celle-ci ne doivent être imprimés ou autrement reproduits sans son autorisation.

ISBN 0-315-82243-0

Canada

THE UNIVERSITY OF ALBERTA

RELEASE FORM

NAME OF THE AUTHOR	NIZAR RAJABALI
TITLE OF THE THESIS	"CAN SCHOOLS BE USED AS A TOOL TO BRING ABOUT A TRANSFORMATION IN SOCIETY? DISCREPANCY BETWEEN POLICY AND PRACTICE IN TANZANIA."
DEGREE	DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY
YEAR THIS DEGREE GRANTED	SPRING, 1993

Permission is hereby granted to THE UNIVERSITY OF ALBERTA LIBRARY to reproduce single copies of this thesis and to lend or sell such copies for private, scholarly or scientific research purposes only. The author reserves other publication rights, and neither the thesis nor extensive extracts from it may be printed or otherwise reproduced without the author's written permission.

(signed) N K Rajabali

PERMANENT ADDRESS:

106B - 16344 - 109St.

Edmonton T5X 2T4.

Canada.

DATED 19/4/93

UNIVERSITY OF ALBERTA

FACULTY OF GRADUATE STUDIES AND RESEARCH

The undersigned certify that they have read, and recommend to the Faculty of Graduate Studies and Research for acceptance, a thesis entitled **"Can Schools Be Used as a Tool to Bring About a Transformation in Society? Discrepancy Between Policy and Practice in Tanzania"** submitted by **Nizar K. Rajabali** in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in International/Intercultural Education.

.....
Pro. J. Young, Co-Supervisor

.....
Dr. M. Assheton-Smith, Co-Supervisor

.....
Dr. P.Saram

.....
Dr. P. Rowell

.....
Dr. D. Gill

.....
Dr. F. Walker

.....
Dr. J. Jacob, External Reader

Date: 5th. March, 1993

ABSTRACT

Tanzania embarked on a socialist path to development twenty five years ago, and hoped the revolution would be carried out through the schools to inculcate Nyerere's philosophy of "Ujamaa", and produce new socialist Tanzanians. In the years that followed, substantial interest was created among the international community - both in the academic and political arenas - in this unique African experiment in self-reliance. As a result considerable research was undertaken to assess the performance of the Education for Self-Reliance (ESR) policy which was an off-shoot of the main socialist policy expounded in the Arusha Declaration.

The various research studies conducted to assess the success of this socialization process through education established that relatively insignificant fundamental social change had taken place in schools or society directly as a result of the kind of exposure and experience offered by ESR. What had taken place, in reality, as a result of the policy changes could be categorised as mere cultural expansion rather than cultural transformation. It was realised that establishing the reform effort for a socialist transformation did not automatically lead to an understanding and appreciation of the key steps associated with its popularization, adoption and successful implementation.

Analysis of the exogenous and endogenous causes for the inefficacy of the socialist transformation in schools therefore became essential in order to rectify the situation. This study then is a modest attempt at identifying some of the salient obstacles that resulted in the lack of success of the ESR in Tanzania. Research was concentrated on the three key stages of the socialist experiment: the ideological stage, where Nyerere portrayed the collectivist and egalitarian roots of traditional African society; the strategy formation stage where the bureaucrats were given the formidable task of translating the lofty ideals into a working reality; and the implementation stage, where a new set of actors was given the task of carrying out the `directives' sent out by the higher authorities among the bureaucratic elite.

At a more theoretical and philosophical level, Nyerere's attempts at harnessing the schools for a structural and attitudinal transformation of egalitarian socialism is seen in the light of the largely instrumental view of education that permeated the minds of most of the parents and students. Thus what is examined in this thesis is the imperfect fit between the image of the society posited by the founder and the actual environmental and organizational conditions in existence at the time in Tanzania.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

I would like to express my sincere gratitude to Professors John Young and Marilyn Assheton-Smith for their supervision and guidance during my thesis work. I am thankful to my supervisory committee members, Professors Patricia Rowell, Paul Saram, Foster Walker and D. Gill for their critical review and helpful suggestions. Sincere thanks also go to Professor Jacob of the University of Calgary for his critical comments during the final oral examination.

My special thanks go to my family members and friends, without whose support, love and selfless assistance it would have been impossible to achieve my goal. To my sister Tazim and brother-in-law, Faizal and their three wonderful sons, Shakeel, Khalil, and Kamil, I say "Asante Sana" (many many thanks) for your patience, generosity and kindness shown to me during these difficult years of hard work; to my sister Nasim in Tanzania, brother Karim and Suzy who helped take care of my affairs back home, thank you very much. My sincere appreciation and gratitude go to Ashyana Kassam, Firoz Mohamed, Mansoor Punja, and Aftab and Shamim Jessa and Fern Ness for their assistance in the computer work. Last, but by no means the least, my deep gratitude goes to Alnoor Jamal, the Director of Tanganyika Motors, Dr. Horowitz and Bruce Caldwell of the International Center for their valuable support in making this research possible. And for helping all of us, thank God, and keep up the Good work with the other students!

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Chapter

I INTRODUCTION

1.1 Prolegomena 1
1.2 The Problem 2
1.3 The Significance of the Study 4
1.4 The Methodology 5
1.5 The Organization 7

II BACKGROUND: SOCIAL HISTORY OF PRE-COLONIAL TANZANIAN SOCIETY

2.1 Prolegomena 11
2.2 Physical Environment 13
2.3 The Inhabitants and Their Social Environment 14
2.4 Social Classes and Equality 17
2.5 The Economy and Society 20
2.6 Political Organization 23
2.7 Traditional and Colonial Education 25

III TANZANIA'S SOCIALIST IDEOLOGY AND ITS IMPLICATIONS FOR EDUCATION

3.1 Prolegomena 33
3.2 Theoretical Perceptions on the Choice of Development Strategies 35
3.2.1 Equilibrium Paradigm 35
3.2.2 Marxist and Neo-Marxist Theories 37
3.2.3 The Two Socialist Camps in Tanzania 38
3.2.4 Alternative Explanations 39
3.3 Tanzania's Socialist Ideology 41
3.3.1 Absence of Exploitation 44
3.3.2 Control Over the Means of Production 44
3.3.3 Democracy 45
3.3.4 Equality 46
3.3.5 Obligation to Work 48
3.3.6 Purpose of Development 49
3.3.7 Self-Reliance 50
3.4 Role of Education in the Development of Socialism & Self-Reliance . . 51
3.4.1 Background to ESR 51
3.4.2 Conceptual Justification of ESR Policy 53
3.4.3 Consistency Between Arusha Declaration and ESR 57

IV STRATEGIES AND POLICIES FOR A TRANSFORMATION IN SCHOOLS

4.1 Prolegomena 61
4.2 Goals of ESR Policy Revisited 63
4.3 Strategies and Policies 64
4.3.1 Strategies for Implementing the Policy Outside Schools 68
4.3.2 Strategies for Implementing ESR in Schools 72
4.3.2.1 Curriculum Reform 74
4.3.2.2 Democratic Participation 76
4.3.2.3 Strategies Proposed for Curricular Reform 77
4.3.2.4 Strategies for Reducing Inequality 78
4.3.3 Strategies for Other Innovations and Subsequent Directives . . . 79
4.4 Genesis of Strategy Formation And a Preliminary Critique 80

V IMPLEMENTATION OF EDUCATION FOR SELF-RELIANCE IN SCHOOLS

5.1 Prolegomena 90
5.2 Changes In Curriculum 93
5.3 Self-Reliance Projects in Schools 98
5.4 Terminal Basic Education For the Majority 101
5.5 Diversification And Vocationalization of Schools 104
5.6 Role of Examinations 108
5.7 Integration Between School and Community 110
5.8 Inculcation of Socialist Values and Attitudes 113
5.9 Decentralization, Participation and Democracy 115
5.10 Reducing Inequalities 118

VI EVALUATION AND CRITICAL ANALYSIS OF THE EDUCATION FOR SELF-RELIANCE POLICY

6.1 Prolegomena 124
6.2 Critical Interpretation of the Ideology 127
6.2.1 A Re-examination of African Socialism 127
6.2.2 Ideological and Theoretical Evaluation of ESR. 130
6.3 Evaluation of Strategy Formulation 132
6.3.1 Critical Review of Policy-making Style 132
6.3.2 Central Direction vs Local Participation 135
6.4 Analysis of The Execution of The Policy 138
6.4.1 Introduction 138
6.4.2 Self-Reliance Projects in Schools 139
6.4.3 Changes in Curriculum 139
6.4.4 Terminality and Relevance of the Curriculum 140
6.4.5 Diversification and Vocationalization 141
6.4.6 Role of Examinations 141
6.4.7 Integration Between School and Community 142
6.4.8 Changes in Values and Attitudes 143
6.4.9 Reducing Inequalities 144

6.4.10 Democratic Participation 145
6.4.11 Meeting Human Resource Needs 146
6.4.12 Overall Efficiency 147

VII CONCLUSION

7.1 Prolegomena 149
7.2 Exogenous Factors Contributing to the Inefficacy of the ESR 149
7.3 Endogenous Factors Contributing to the Inefficacy of the ESR 152
7.3.1 Problems at the Ideological Level 153
7.3.2 Problems at the Strategy Level 155
7.3.3 Problems at the Implementation Level 158
7.4 Final Considerations and Recommendations 162

Selected Bibliography 164

LIST OF TABLES

TABLE		PAGE
1.1	Tribal Size Variations in Tanzania	14
4.2	Tanzania Ministry of Education's Expenditure	84
4.3	Aid to Tanzania 1981/82 to 1987/88	84
5.4	Primary Education Leavers and Form One Selection	96

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

1.1 Prolegomena:

A generation has passed since African leaders began advocating their commitment to socialism as an alternative path to development. Few leaders in Africa could ignore this call to African Socialism since it not only addressed itself to the developmental concerns of rapid economic growth but also linked it to equitable distribution of wealth and avoidance of class formation. Moreover it gave the new regime a level of popularity among the masses and a legitimacy in certain sections of the international community.

Of the 52 independent African countries today seven opted for a self-proclaimed Marxist-Leninist leadership while eleven embraced some other strand of socialism. What seemed to be characteristic, however, of all the experiences thus far was the gap between rhetoric and reality. (Munslow, 1986:56). In spite of the initial optimism of the leadership in Africa, the task proved to be herculean and the results meagre (Roseberg and Callaghy, 1979:1). Albeit there were some dynamic innovations and successes in certain spheres like social welfare and literacy, economic failures (particularly in the vital agricultural sector) circumvented and overshadowed all the other achievements in these countries. Socialism,it was found, could not be built by redistributing scarcity and poverty. Even the resource rich socialist countries like the Soviet Union and China had to give due recognition to the importance of the economic and technical efficiency aspects of their development efforts in order to establish the legitimacy of their ideologies as viable alternatives to capitalism.

In most of these revolutionary societies education was seen as a fundamental instrument of change. In addition to rapid expansion for increasing the skills and reducing inequalities of access, education in transition societies was expected to play a key role in the transformation of social relations. This role was conditioned by the ideal of making educated labour the keystone of a more productive, modernised and participative economy based on a collectivist or socialist ideology (Carnoy and Samoff,1990:63). In other words education was seen as paramount in developing the material and ideological conditions for a transformation of the structures of the state and society and for the creation of a politically conscious worker-peasant dominancy. Since schools were considered the chief loci for the reproduction and inculcation of the ideology in society, by reorienting the educational system the schools were expected to help fulfil the four major goals of socialist development in Tanzania, namely, the economic goal of providing the skills and training for creating an indigenous labour force; the political goal of creating an ideologically committed and conscious populace; the social goal of creating a non-acquisitive, non-arrogant, communalistic (Ujamaa) society, and the pedagogical

goal of creating a critical, problem-solving, self-reliant and liberated citizenry. However the conventionally cherished relationship between formal education and economic development seemed to have been misconceived. Scepticism turned to pessimism when education still showed to be promoting the very thing it was supposed to be eliminating, namely social inequalities. In many cases it continued to remain largely irrelevant to the aspirations of the general masses in rural areas(Cooksey and Ishumi, 1986:Chapter 3). Socialism in Tanzania heralded a new era of development marked by the publication of the three major policy papers, The Arusha Declaration (AD), Education for Self-Reliance (ESR) and Socialism and Rural Development (SRD), which led to a substantial number of far reaching structural and institutional changes. Over the last 25 years observers have voiced their criticisms over the country's development strategy in the light of the performance of the national economy1.

The general critique of the policy shortcomings was replicated in the educational sector, specifically in relation to the attempt made at building a socialist educational system based on the ESR. Nyerere had clearly seen the pivotal role of education in bringing about a socialist revolutionary transformation of both, the schools and society. However most research on the subject shows that schools in Tanzania failed to fulfil the objectives set for them by the politicians (ibid). This was confirmed by the founder of the policy, the former President Julius Nyerere, who said:

> The gap between policy and practice is glaring, however.... we in Tanzania either have not yet found the right educational policy or have not yet succeeded in implementing it or some combination of these alternatives (Nyerere, 1974: 4).

> On the 10th anniversary of the AD Nyerere proclaimed in his celebration speech that(as yet) Tanzania had neither become socialist nor self-reliant (Nyerere, 1977:1).

Various studies revealed the shortfalls of practice vis-a-vis the policy. Self reliance had become a form without a critical function serving neither the modernisation nor the social transformation agenda. Instead of incubating socialists, Tanzanian schools continued to reinforce inequalities as they had done in the colonial period, and retained their role as midwives to the reproduction of the status quo. The pertinent question then was, why did these sincere and noble efforts towards improving society and schools fail to produce results?

1.2. The Problem.

This study attempts to identify the possible causes of the failure of the schools in Tanzania to successfully implement the ESR policy. It is an attempt at explicating the inefficacy of the policy in order to crystallize the possible causes

of the discrepancy between educational policy and practice.

The study is conducted at four distinct levels. First, it briefly examines the ideology itself and the historical and sociological basis of its formulation. Second, the level at which it was comprehended, interpreted and translated by the various groups, including the bureaucrats and technocrats who were responsible for transforming it into an action plan. Third, it examines the implementation of the policy in schools in accordance with the explicit roles delineated to each of the groups of participants. And finally, a critical analysis of the data gathered is undertaken in order to identify some of the key causes of the inefficacy of the policy.

Amongst the questions the study attempts to address are:

- to what extent was a situational analysis and a needs-assessment undertaken in order to evaluate the feasibility of the policy in schools?
- how were the operational goals established and with what priority?
- were alternative approaches to the ideological preference and implementation strategy explored, keeping in mind the cost-benefit analytical framework?
- were the various motivations for the execution of the policy sufficiently delineated?
- were provisions made for formative and summative evaluations of the policy practice?
- to what degree were democratic channels of communication and feedback established within the hierarchy as part of the official participatory policy?

Dunn (1981) cautions us over the complacency that sometimes accompanies popularly accepted policies and insists that even they need to be evaluated against the criteria of effectiveness, efficiency, adequacy, responsiveness and appropriateness to the society and period in question.

Some of the moot, macro level questions that are pertinent but not addressed in this thesis are: Can education be used to build a socialist society in a country such as Tanzania? How do societies in transition change and what accelerates their growth?

By scrutinizing the expectations, assumptions, actions (and contradictions there in) of the key participants involved at various stages of the transition, it is hoped this study will help crystallize the causes that made Nyerere's ideal unrealizable.

1.3. The Significance of the Study..

In spite of the commendable efforts in many developing nations at expanding and transforming the educational systems, schools in this transition states have continued to be characterised by formality, hierarchy and elitism. There is a universal concern over the failure of the educational system to bring about either rapid economic growth or greater equality and participatory democracy. It thus seems imperative to systematically analyze and understand these developmental experiences of the third world countries in order to better understand the phenomena of societal change and the role of schools in bringing it about. If the ultimate findings sound more critical and prescriptive than laudatory, it is because there is more to be gained from trying to diagonise shortcomings than from celebrating successes.

The significance of this study lies in three main areas:

1. It will hopefully generate new insight into the available knowledge on the ability of schools to satisfy the needs of its various clients within the third world perspective. In particular it hopes to shed some light on the work that needs to be done as a pre-requisite to the institution of massive interventions in essentially orthodox institutions like schools.

2. It further hopes to highlight the need for balancing the political and social goals of schooling with the economic and personal needs in order to ensure the success of its envisioned objectives. The popular Chinese concept of walking on two legs with the "red" and "expert" getting an equal share of resources seems applicable to all concerned with developmental issues. This realization would provide an important feedback for policy makers, politicians and administrators to the harsh realities of practical life as against the ideals cherished by the philosophers and politicians.

3. Finally, the study's significance is seen at the methodological level. The Tanzanian experiment has been often analyzed at either the ideological level or only at the implementation level. Sectoral and intersectoral studies abound but few, if any, comprehensive studies have been conducted that deal with the total process of change from inception through results. No study, to the author's knowledge, has focused on the systematic chain of discrepancies that existed at every phase of this socialist enterprise. It is this approach at examining the nexus of inconsistencies between rhetoric and reality that give significance to this study for its spectrum of coverage.

For those within and outside Tanzania interested in its development, this macro top-down approach towards a comprehensive understanding of the process of change, from the birth of the ideology to the post-implementation syndrome experienced by the present day Tanzanians, is a useful exercise for action and future

work. Since the author has been an active participant in the capacity of a student, faculty, and research evaluator during this entire period of transition, it is hoped that some of the insights gained in this research will have an added authenticity accruing out of personal experience and critical thought.

1.4. The Methodology.

The methodology employed in this research has been determined by the nature of the problem studied, and the various levels at which it was to be examined. The key task was to focus on the performance of the schools in bringing about a socialist transformation and underline some of the salient causes and constraints that led to the failure of the fulfilment of this national effort.

The methodology therefore consisted of a logical analysis of the stages of development of the experiment using qualitative research. Predominantly, the study therefore entailed a close and a critical examination of documentary materials on intervention in the Tanzanian educational system since 1967, and an evaluation of the performance of schools in implementing the socialist educational reforms.

There were at least six distinct sets of authors consulted during the collection of the data: Independent commentators (mostly non-Tanzanian) who had either published books or articles in various academic journals, and who included Goran Hyden (1979,1980), A.L. Gillette (1969), D.R.Morrison (1976), Joel Samoff (1979,1981,1990), Grol-Overling (1969), John Hatch (1972,1975).

The second group, comprising again of non-Tanzanians, but who was directly involved in the implementation of the policy either through the University of Dar-es-Salaam or some other government institution at various times during the last twenty five years. These included Budd Hall (1975), David Court (1973,1975), Cranford Pratt (1979), R.H.Green (1980), John Saul (1973), Walter Rodney (1972,1974).

The third group consisted of Tanzanian scholars involved in the experiment in their various capacities as planners, policy-makers, administrators, teachers etc. These included Abel Ishumi (1974,1984,1987), I.M.Omari (1982,1984), Marjorie Mbilinyi (1976,1977,1979,1980), H.J.Mosha (1990), Issa Shivji E. and J.Pendaeli (1983,1988).

The fourth source of documentary data was derived from the various international organizations, like the World Bank, the UNESCO, the ILO etc. whose studies proved useful, although caution was exercised against the possible hidden biases that such reports may be prone to.

The fifth source of data was the Tanzanian Government documents and publications including the extensively publicised writings of the former President,

Mwalimu Julius Nyerere, which provided a rich primary source of research material, especially for the chapter on the ideology.

Finally, there were the various unpublished dissertations comprising of field and documentary research studies conducted by both, the Tanzanians and the non-Tanzanians, during their academic studies in the various international educational institutions.

Thus the following forms of written materials on the subject were examined:

1. Books and monographs
2. Journal, periodical and newspaper articles.
3. Dissertations
4. Government reports and publications.
5. International organisation studies and reports.

In order to place the Tanzanian version of socialism within the global context, a brief discussion on some of the other major theoretical paradigms that had some relevance to Tanzania's developmental ideology of "Ujamaa" was undertaken. Thus along with an exposition of the Tanzanian Democratic Socialism, the Marxist, neo-Marxist and non-Marxist ideological orientations were also touched upon.

An eclectic model using a number of theoretical postulates seemed, in this case, a fitting approach to adopt since the Tanzanian policy was influenced by both the equilibrium and conflict paradigms at different periods of its historical growth. Furthermore, in order to better understand Tanzania's policy-making style, it became necessary to examine it within the context of the various policy-making models developed by well-known authorities in the field like Dror(1968), Dye(1978) etc.

A very limited field research was also conducted in Tanzania where a small number of respondents chosen from each of the key groups of participants in the implementation of the policy, were interviewed. Specifically, a Minister, a Member of Parliament, a Regional Education Officer, a Head of a Teacher's College, a Headmistress, a Ministry Official, and a Student were interviewed. Unfortunately the founder of the socialist experiment in Tanzania, Julius Nyerere declined to be interviewed. Obviously his input in this kind of a study would have proved to be of immense value.

The daily newspapers of Tanzania (Swahili and English) provided a fairly rich forum for the on going debate on the issues of development and the role of schools, and thus were used to obtain views and insights of a broad cross-section of the society.

For background information on Tanzania various historians and sociologists like D.R. Morrison(1976), Cameron and Dodd (1970) among others proved valuable sources of information. The Tanzanian government sources were useful for statistics, policy and legal aspects of the schooling process.

As for research material on the actual implementation of the policy, more than a hundred studies by way of articles,theses etc. were examined. These can be categorized into sectoral studies (Akwenye,1975; Malekela,1977; Lema,1972 and others); intersectoral research studies (Gillette,1976; Muncie,1973; Vacchi,1973 among others) and comprehensive studies (Carnoy and Samoff,1990; Ishumi and Cooksey,1986; UNESCO Educational Report,1989 etc).

Lastly, a brief sketch of the author of this thesis seems in place in order to situate his background and role in the Tanzanian educational experience.

The author was a student at the University in Dar-es-Salaam at the time of the pronouncement of the policy. The university academic staff and the sutdents were very actively involved in the on-going ideological debate, that formed an essential part of the course work, too. The author participated in these debates and the demonstrations that followed the pronouncement of the policies.

After graduating from the university, he spent the next twelve years in the country's educational system, as a teacher, actively involved in implementing the policy of Education for Self-Reliance in schools. After his Master's degree from Stanford, in 1981, he joined the bureaucracy at the Ministry of Education's Headquarters in Dar-es-Salaam, where he worked as a research co-ordinator together with others in the Research and Evaluation Division.

He returned to teaching in 1984 and remained there until he decided to pursue his Doctrate in International/Intercultural education at the University of Alberta, in 1989.

Coming from an ethnic minority of an East Indian Origin, brought up in an African cultural milieu, educated in the Western colonial system of formal education, and practicing the Islamic religious traditions, the author hopes to use this rich multicultural exposure and experience as a source of strength, objectivity and empathy rather than weakness and prejudice.

1.5. Organization of Chapters.

The thesis is organised into six chapters. The first chapter has five sub-sections: the prolegomena, the problem, the purpose, the methodology and the organisation of chapters.

The second chapter consists of the background and context of the problem. It is basically a social history of the Tanzanian society and the role of schooling prior to the political independence. The traditional African societal beliefs and practices are examined in this chapter to help verify Nyerere's version of its values and belief systems as they formed the basis of the country's new philosophy. This socio-historical background therefore also serves as the groundwork for chapter three which examines Nyerere's philosophy of socialism and his concept of schooling within it.

Besides elaborating on Nyerere's philosophy of development, chapter three also includes a literature review of the relevant paradigms that constitute the theoretical framework of the study. Tanzania's post-independence development efforts were strongly influenced by the Western theoretical paradigms of the day, and accordingly, in its first post-independence phase the political elite leaned towards the equilibrium paradigm, mainly the human capital and modernisation theories. AD however marked a shift in the ideology towards the alternative camp of the conflict paradigm consisting of Marxist, neo-Marxist and other socialistic oriented theories. One group of Marxist commentators on Tanzania saw dependency as the most pertinent theoretical framework for comprehending underdevelopment in Tanzania, whilst another school (that included Nyerere) saw the country's new ideology more attuned to the principles of Democratic Socialism as against any Marxist or neo-Marxist ideology. The last decade however has seen a revival of the apolitical technocratic modernisation approach to development whilst still retaining a cosmetic cover of the now largely depleted socialist rhetoric. The broad theoretical framework conceptualized in this chapter therefore is developed into an eclectic model that encompasses a number of different theoretical perspectives as they applied to Tanzania at different periods of its development.

Chapter four investigates the strategies developed to translate the ideology into action. It explores the degree of consistency between the principles of socialism and the methodology applied in practice to realize the vision. It was deemed important to devote a complete chapter to strategy formation style in Tanzanian politics since much of the discrepancy between policy and practice was believed to have been caused as a result of the method and type of strategy formation that Tanzanian bureaucrats resorted to in order to transform Nyerere's vision into a reality.

Chapter five deals with the implementation of the policy in schools. This chapter inevitably leads us into an analysis of the constraints faced by the implementers in the four major areas, namely, socio-cultural, political, economic and environmental/physical. Material for this chapter is largely derived from various research studies conducted to evaluate the performance of schools in implementing the ESR policy and the problems faced thereby. Both external and internal constraints have been scrutinized in order to arrive at the real causes of the

subsequent failures. Chapter five also includes the research findings of the data collected during the field research undertaken in Tanzania for this dissertation.

Chapter six constitutes the most crucial part of the study, namely, an analysis of the documentary and other data collected so far. The various questions posed in the statement of the problem above are addressed here in the light of the findings from the research undertaken so far. This chapter helps decipher the causes of the failure of schools to implement the ESR policy and it is hoped that here we shall arrive at some tentative conclusions and new insights vis-a-vis the educational problems faced by Tanzania in the last quarter of a century.

The final concluding chapter enumerates the exogenous the endogenous factors discussed and analyzed at length throughout the thesis It ends with a concluding statement on the entire experiment and some recommendations from the author for future planners and policy makers.

END NOTES

1. According to the latest Unesco report (1989) on Tanzania, since the mid. 1970's the Tanzanian economy has experienced a significant deterioration and the country is now facing its worst economic crisis since independence in 1961. In real terms production and capital stock has declined steadily in all sectors. The annual inflation rate has averaged between 26-36% leading to a greatly reduced consumer purchasing power (1989:4).

CHAPTER 2

BACKGROUND: SOCIAL HISTORY OF PRE-COLONIAL TANZANIAN SOCIETY.

2.1. Prolegomena.

Although Tanzania played host to the very first chapter of the human saga when a remarkable team of pre-historians, Louis and Mary Leakey, made their pioneering discoveries in unearthing the remains of the hominids who lived during the Miocene epoch, 15 million years ago, at the Olduvai gorge (on the edge of the Serengeti plains), the Republic of Tanzania itself is less than 30 years old and came into being when the people's Republic of Zanzibar merged with the Republic of Tanganyika in 1964. The human history of Tanzania dates back to about 10,000 years ago when the Khoisan speaking hunters settled in some parts of the land.

The great East African Rift Valley served as a highway for immigrants including the Bantu and the Cushitic speaking people. There was a constant movement and mixing of peoples between the 10th and 16th centuries and thus it is difficult to trace the cultural origins of the present day Tanzanian ethnic groups (Yeager, 1982:7). The last great migration took place in the 1840's when the Southern African Ngoni crossed into Rukwa and mixed with the other tribes.

In Africa, oral traditions was the only form of reporting and if history were mere reporting then oral tradition would have been taken as history. But if, as Collingwood (1961) claims, history includes a spirit of cautious verification and a technique of analyzing data, then oral tradition cannot be accepted as history without running into serious difficulties. Although historical evidence does not depend strictly on the written word, history as analysis and verification of data continues to rely overwhelmingly on the literate historian. African history began to be recorded with the white persons' arrival on the black continent. Unfortunately, therefore, pre-colonial developments were not acknowledged by the early historians. It was then the history of white people in Africa, where the natives became a footnote to the movements of the Europeans and other foreigners. Furthermore only selective aspects of history were emphasized at the expense of others. Thus most progress had to do with the Christian missionaries while the effects of the various Arab and Islamic cultures on the language and way of life of the Africans was largely ignored. Some modern historians however have acknowledged the role of the medieval Islamic civilization in influencing the architecture, literacy, economy,government administration and communication links among the African coastal towns.

Over time, a collection of myths about Africa came into being and different viewpoints tended to draw their sustenance from it. The emergence of modern anthropology, with its reiterated cautions about ethnocentricism and the growing sensitivity among the international community, has done away with the crudest and most negative of the myths and have reshaped the Western view of Africa. With this cultural decolonization some positive myths about the traditional African society have been reinforced or combined with Western ideologies whist others have been reinterpreted in new terms. We thus witnessed the building up of cultural history whose vocabulary remained essentially Western.

Another factor to bear in mind when examining the history of traditional African societies is that there has never been a single traditional African culture. Nor were these societies static enough for us to be able to legitimately attribute an aspect that remained with them throughout the pre-colonial period. A particular way of living cannot be confused with equilibrium nor adaptation with the absence of contradictions and change. It is however very difficult to determine how exactly, the various pre-colonial African societies differed from each other and how much were they changing, mainly because of the extreme paucity and unreliability of the sources of information.

Pre-colonial Tanzania was just a geographical area and not a social unit, much less a "national" whole. The units under which effective social action took place were the different pre-colonial societies (Koponen, 1988). Tanzanian societies at the end of the 19th century were a product of both the continuity of structure and the change imposed by the more recent historical factors.

The complex interaction of forces that moulded the pre- colonial society could, in the present terms, be demarcated into ethnic, political and economic aspects. However, functionally and institutionally speaking there were no differentiated sections in society such as economic, social, political and religious, and no separate institutions or functionaries existed to be in-charge of these various aspects of the traditional society. This helped give the societies solidity and a holistic approach to the problems facing them.

It must be admitted that there is much we do not know, and may be, will never know about the concrete workings of the societies and their processes of production and reproduction. But we do have sufficient documentary evidence to prove the existence of both, war, pestilence and poverty on the one hand and peaceful co-existence, biological and social defences, political and cultural systems, and societal harmony on the other.

In this chapter, instead of undertaking a chronological analysis of the socio-historical development of pre-colonial and colonial Tanzania we shall only selectively examine certain crucial highlights of the period under various headings

in order to acquire some modest insights into the traditional African society that are relevant to the present study. For more detailed accounts of pre colonial and colonial Tanzania we need to refer to those authors who have written at length on its socio-economic and political history, like Bennet (1971), Cameron(1939), Harlow and Chilver(1965), Kimaro and Temu (1969), Moffett(1968), Hatch(1972), Morrison(1976) Sayers (1980)etc.

2.2. The Physical Environment.

Tanzania is a tiny economy with an area larger than England, France and West Germany put together, but a population that is less than ten per cent and an economic output that is less than one-half of one percent of these countries.

Tanzania has some unique geographical features that set it apart from other African countries. The second largest and the second deepest lakes in the world are situated here and the world's longest river starts from Kagera. The highest mountain in Africa, the Kilimanjaro, is situated to the north of the country. One of the world's most luxurious collection of wild life in its natural habitat is found in the Serengeti and Ngorongoro game parks. Tanzania is bordered by the Indian Ocean and eight states: Kenya, Uganda, Rwanda, Burundi, Zaire, Zambia, Malawi and Mozambique. A million years ago the earth faulted to form a spectacular sixty-mile-wide valley that extends to the Dead Sea and the Jordan Valley outside Africa. Of its total area, only 20,000 square miles is arable. Half the country is tse-tse fly infested woodland and the rest is made up of grassland, mountain vegetation, semi-desert and desert.

In geographical terms East Africa forms a unitary region in which the political boundaries have little meaning since the later were artificially created and imposed by European imperial states at the turn of the century. In fact Tanzania's geographical, cultural, ethnic and economic separation from the neighbouring countries was quite arbitrary which only helped to divide a people into political entities leading to their present irreconcilable differences.

More than in many other countries, Tanzania's population concentration is determined by the climate, water supply and soil quality. Thus another unique feature of this country is the very uneven geographical distribution of population varying from 1.3 persons per square kilometre in Mpanda to 170 persons in Ukerewe. Two-third of the entire population lives in one-third the area. A complex climatic pattern prevails the land due to the variations in altitude, distance from the sea, distribution of land mass and nearness to equator. However the most certain thing about the climate of Tanzania is that it is highly uncertain.

2.3. The Inhabitants and their Social Environment.

Tanzania is predominantly a rural economy with a population of over 23 million in 1986, growing at an average annual rate of 3.4%. Ninety nine per cent of the total population comprises of black Africans and the remaining one per cent is made up of Asians, Europeans and Arabs. At independence there were about 120 distinct tribes, each with its own dialect and traditional culture. However, unlike Kenya, the absence of any dominant tribal group has had its positive political implications. The pattern was, what Coleman describes as "dispersed tribal societies" or "autonomous local communities" (Coleman, 1960:254). An indication of the tribal complexity can be gauged from the following Table:

TABLE 1: TRIBAL SIZE VARIATIONS IN TANZANIA

No. of Tribes	% of Population
10	43
13	23
97	34
120	100

SOURCE : United Nations Annual Report, 1976.

At independence just over 5% of the population was recorded to be living in urban areas in the country. By 1980 it was 12% of which 57% was in the capital city of Dar-es-Salaam. The various tribes had little political or social communication between them (Hundsdorfer, 1982:1). This constellation was due to the geographical, ecological and political circumstances that had conditioned the process of societal development for the last few centuries. The pressure on areas with good soil and sufficient regular rainfall led to the splitting and separation of tribal groups and scattered structure of indigenous societies.

From the beginning of the 19th century, as much as 50% of the population in many of the villages was taken as slaves or perished on their way to slave-markets. Early contacts with foreigners were characterised by humiliation, exploitation and exposure to a whole new way of thinking, behaving and developing. Domination started with the slave-trade and continued during the German and British colonial period.

The social organisation of the tribes was largely determined by the ability of the tribesmen to interact with nature and the degree to which they could master its forces. Most tribes lacked centralized authority and clear-cut differences in rank and wealth. Division of labour was organised along gender, age and tribal specialization. The family served as the basic social unit due to the dispersed settlement pattern that was imposed by the ecological circumstances. It served not only as the unit of production and consumption but also as the centre for recreation and cultural transmission. It was the home where social control was put into practice and it was here that the child learnt all that the tribe cherished, be it sacred or profane.

The responsibilities assigned to each head of family to feed those under his care, the collective labour necessary for new land clearing and the division of other communal responsibilities required a complex system of social communication and administrative structures that bound the entire tribe through lines of descent and clans (Meister, 1966:18). On the horizontal level tribal cohesion was insured by the unity between individuals in the same age group and on the vertical level each age group acceded to greater powers and responsibilities as they moved up the age level. Councils of elders exercised powers more than the individual chiefs, and positions were seldom inherited in the election of council members.

These councils of elders handled all disputes between groups and settled litigations between families. Decisions were normally unanimous and those who disagreed were free to leave the clan. Nyerere referred to this feature of the traditional African society when he said that democracy was natural to them, where people sat under a tree and "talked and talked" until they agreed. Unfortunately, when one-party state became politically necessary or desirous the consensual ethos of traditional Africa could still be emphasized without the freedom to "talk and talk". The consensus became so important that it drowned the preliminaries of discussion (Mazrui, 1972:17).

Tradition was expressed through the voice of the elders and the entire social organisation was structured to maintain the respect and authority of the ancestral customs. The continuity of the group was symbolized by the elders who formed the link between the living and the dead or between the future and the founders of the tribe.

Elements of this tribal principle are seen in the later day ideology Nyerere propounded as the spokesperson for the millions of Tanzanians who, true to their traditional customs, declared a obedient approval of his policies. The elders served as priests of a primitive religion based on the totality of the tribal legends, rites, rituals, taboos and experiences of life.Incidentally, this feature of non-questioning conformity to customs and beliefs was to conflict with the Western tradition of enquiry and criticism, and was to be the chief cause of break up of the stability

within families and between various age groups in the clans.

The social structure was such that the system ensured a place for each individual and no one was isolated. The ceremonies and rituals served to strengthen the cohesion of the group. However, the commitment towards mutual help and community tasks made it also impossible to live a private life within a clan in a situation where the affairs of one were in reality the affairs of all. The individual did not become free even in marriage, which only reinforced the ties between more families. Polygamy, a practice to correct the imbalance between the numbers in gender groups, allowed single families to further multiply their alliances. A strong sense of belonging and security resulted from mutual help, cultural rites and rituals, synonymity of religion and tradition, in spite of the stratification along gender and other lines.

A system as complete and totalitarian as this undermined the role of the individual and his personal initiative in favour of communal concerns, where innovation and critical thought was perceived as dissent and, therefore, vehemently condemned. Psychological mobility of the individuals was virtually non- existent and this tradition of total obedience to those in authority seems to have had its impact on the people long after independence.

The generally accepted thesis that village society was traditionally communal, democratic and non-acquisitive ran into serious problems when some anthropologists like Igor Kopytoff made systematic attempts at conducting empirical studies of some African tribes and found that the "Socialist" interpretations did not square with empirically discovered reality. According to these relatively recent anthropological studies, traditional African societies were more complex than some myth-makers has assumed and varied significantly in different tribal settings throughout the continent. (Kopytoff,1964; Sprinzek:1973 629-647). Kopytoff tried to refute both the diagnosis of the past and the prognosis of the future. More will be said about this in other sections of the chapter but suffice it to say here that there were definite stratifications in some of the African tribes and that not all societies practised communal ownership of land or maintained the egalitarian character that is so easily claimed by many African heads of states. African ideologists today are ready to recognise that within the kinship group there was no complete equality. Some societies developed "castes" and others "aristocracies". Many African societies had individuals with private property that put them in the well-to-do group as against the poorer sections of the tribe. The ideologists have also acknowledged the existence of functionally differentiated and privileged groups such as elders, chiefs, warriors, priests and soothsayers.

In this section we have just taken some selected highlights of the social organisation in the traditional African society and some of the problems arising out of an analysis of the African past.

2.4 Social Classes and Equality.

Some African political leaders have felt the need to transcribe into legend certain facts of history, at the risk of masking certain realities to elevate into myth certain lofty goals that were necessary to create a social climate of enthusiasm while at the same time presenting a populist philosophy that set it apart from the colonial world of classes.1 The favourite myth propounded repeatedly is that traditional African society was homogeneous and unstratified. This extended kinship spirit served as a mantle for the unfortunate. For a long time this hypothesis remained unchallenged and rarely was any systematic attempt made to examine it analytically.

A policy document published by the Republic of Kenya on African Socialism reiterated the beliefs expressed by Nyerere, Toure and others on the subject of 'classes' by claiming that the profound class divisions that prevailed in Europe had no place in African socialism and no parallel in African society, past or present. It further claimed that there were no class problems in traditional African society and that there were none among Africans today (Government Sessional Paper 10,1965). The three principles of traditional African society, the paper claimed, were: every member was respected and equal, irrespective of his socio-economic status in society; secondly, there was the concept of "mutual social responsibility" which was an extension of the African family spirit to the nation as a whole, where every member had a duty to work and leaders had the responsibility to ensure equal opportunity, elimination of exploitation and provision of some social services. The third element of African traditional life was to follow a strict moral code for the community. The present reality in Kenya however is quite different and an analysis of the above vis-a vis the historical reality has clearly shown that the above was a mere rationalization for introducing Africanisation in the existing socio-economic institutions (Mohiddin,1981:79).

According to Nyerere there were no classes (in the Western sense of the word) in traditional Africa, the proof of which, was in the fact that the word "class" had no equivalent in African languages. This simplistic logic can be easily dismantled by innumerable examples of reality in existence before concepts and terminology for them had developed. For Kenyatta too, the Marxist theory of class struggle had no bearing on the situation in Africa. (Reporter, July 2, 1965). The romanticization of the memory of traditional society by Nyerere and others and the accent on equality seems to be a reaction against the terrible inequalities in living standards among the various racial groups and between the colonizers and the colonized during the colonial period (Meister, 1966:166).

Besides the African ideologists, some Western authors went along with this unverified thesis. An early school, exemplified in the work of Peter Lloyd, argued that class concepts cannot be employed at all in Africa and instead propagated the

theories of elite and social stratification (Lloyd,1969). Strong critiques of this argument followed and the importance of applying class analysis to study African Societies, in most cases, became a firmly established approach (Munslow, 1986:12). Having said that, it must be understood that the existence of classes or any other form of inequalities cannot be compared to the European class structures and as such the African ideologists are partially right in refuting the existence of a European comparison. Another fact that needs to be remembered is that in the African context classes are in the process of being formed, with complex trends and directions being the rule in contrast to the established social structures of Western developed capitalist societies. Class identifications had not yet emerged sufficiently to structure political conflict in most African states.

It is largely realised now that traditional African society was never simply a homogeneous collection of like beings, but that it varied greatly in size, customs, languages, degrees of stratification and other complexities ranging from the so-called "acephalus" societies (literally without a head or leaderless) to the great states of West and South Africa. Life in acephalus societies was based on kinship and descent, and social and political roles were determined by sex, age, personal characteristics, abilities and achievements. A high degree of democracy prevailed and societies were relatively unstratified. (Blackmore and Cooksey, 1980:11). Social inequalities based on ownership of land, slaves, livestock, occupation, heredity or political roles were relatively underdeveloped.

Since social stratification that might ultimately lead to the creation of classes often depended on the creation of "wealth" in the form of agricultural surplus, material goods, ownership of land or other liquid assets, and since none of the above was feasible on a large scale in pre-colonial Tanzania class formation was inevitably stunted in its growth. Moreover, development of agricultural surplus or surplus material goods required a certain degree of some or all of the following: specialization, a certain level of technology, the development of exchange labour, a medium of exchange for the various transactions, a market, a commercial infrastructure and incentive for accumulation. None of these were in existence in any developed state in Tanzania during this time. However, it is known that chiefs and elders did appropriate some of the labour of others and accumulate stores of grain, livestock and other prestige items. Storage was limited by the perishability of the agricultural surplus at hand. An argument is made by some scholars that the position of the elders and chiefs made them a social "class" or stratum that "exploited" women, young men and residents of the local area.

Not only was a part of the female and young labour force appropriated by chiefs and elders but also that rights to children were always transferred to the men's kinship groups regardless of whether society was patrilineal or matrilineal (Meillassoux,1981:75). Nyerere claimed in his writings that the wealth the elders appeared to possess was not theirs, personally; it was only theirs by virtue of the

fact that they were elders of the group which produced it and that they were mere guardians (Ujamaa,1968:165). It is known, however, that certain conqueror-chiefs and other leaders had grown autonomous in the use of the wealth they had acquired in this way, although no long-term material accumulation was taking place. Gluckman argues that the spirit of generosity prevailed among the Africans and also that in such societies it was not possible to use goods - even productive tools- to raise one's own standard of living and there was no point in hoarding. As long as there were limited ways of converting the surpluses produced (mainly food and drink) into something more durable there were limits set to the use of them and little possibility of long-term private accumulation. Moreover, goods produced were considered more a "social" wealth than an economic wealth and more amenable to reproductive rather than productive accumulation. This wealth could be used to create new social relations like marriages and client relations. The hypothesis of a wholly classless society is very hard to substantiate. There is no evidence in history of a classless and conflictless ideal age. One could argue that most African societies in the past were collectivist, but not many were truly egalitarian.2 Each society in Africa had developed its own unique social and economic pattern as a product of the unique circumstances facing it and thus while some were egalitarian to a greater degree, many had combined collectivist characteristics with definite elements of status and hierarchy. (Mohiddin, 1968:136). It seems however reasonable to argue that the concept of class, in its Western sense, would be inapplicable and unintelligible to traditional African societies. And further, there seems to be also some truth in the statement that contact with the western world sharpened those differences even before the period of intensive European conquest. And yet never did these differences become so acute as to compare with the arrogance, hostility, and cruelty witnessed in many parts of Europe or even Asia during the heyday of their class struggles.

Nkurumah, a pioneer ideologist of African socialism clearly admitted in his later writings that the phrase "African Socialism" seems to espouse the view that traditional African society was classless, imbued with the spirit of humanism. Such a concept of socialism, he said, made a fetish of the communal African society. He emphasized the fact that colonialism was never preceded by an African Golden Age or paradise and that to desire a return to pre-colonial society was not worthy of the ingenuity and efforts of the African people (Nkurumah,1966:4).

In summary then, this analysis leads us to conclude that the picture of a classless African society is a rather emotional nostalgia for an ideal that was never a proved reality and the only reason it was tenaciously adhered to by its propounders was either to legitimize a new ideology or to prove the superiority of Africans and win political popularity and legitimacy amongst its people.

2.5 The Economy and Society.

In order to understand any economic system two fundamental features can be examined: firstly, the size of the economic surplus, its distribution and utilization and the social relations that determine that size. Within the social relations we need to analyze both the conditions of production and the relations of production. Secondly, we need to study the relations that govern the adaptation of the society to changing social conditions (Baran,1957). Within this framework the traditional economy of Tanzania can be analyzed.

Before colonization Tanzania consisted of independent producers involved in pre-capitalist mode of production where the producers were clustered in various socio-cultural groupings called clans or tribes. It is difficult to make a general characterisation of these units because of their heterogeneity and the paucity of available information about them, although a few highlights can be discerned. Firstly, the village community formed the dominant productive unit, whose members constituted the working "owners" of land. These small peasant cultivators sustained their independence by their mutual relationships as members belonging to a community with a need to safeguard common land for common purposes. The condition that made them eligible for land was their membership in the community. Those who appropriated land within these conditions could consider the allotment made to them as their own as long as the land was beneficially utilized. This guaranteed the security of tenure (Dobson,1955). Thus land tenure system was characterised by the right of every individual within a socio-cultural group to the following: productive use of land, the prohibition of its perpetual acquisition (land was eventually communally owned) and thus the overlapping of rights of land and its products among individuals and groups.

Within this mode of production the community continued its existence with a semblance of equality among its autonomous, self-sustaining producers. At the same time their individual labour ascertained the continued existence of their "property". It is this feature of the society that accounted for the frequently quoted absence of classes in the traditional African societies. The predominant system of production was not pronounced by class distinctions or wage labour, which is the pre-condition for capitalist accumulation. The production relations were such that each peasant had an objective existence of his own that was independent of his labour while at the same time he was not separated from his land. The economy was not geared to surplus production and hence there was no room for substantial economic development. The purpose of work was not the creation of surplus value but the maintenance of family and community as a whole (Dalton, 1969).

In a society whose ethos was not acquisitiveness but mostly egalitarianism or communalism and sharing, the need for surplus production was not felt; its main pre-

occupation was not rapid economic development but self-sufficiency (Mohiddin,1968:133).

Market forces had not developed and the medium of exchange was not money. The bulk of the means of subsistence was self-provided and thus market exchanges were peripheral to economic organisation. Primary factors of production - land, labour and capital-were never traded and land was distributed through kinship,chiefs etc. Labour was appropriated through marriage, kinship, friendship and reciprocity, being expressions of social obligation, social affiliation, and social right. Labour was not treated as a commodity allocated to the highest bidder, nor did individual peasants lose control of the work process to those owing capital. Work was seen as part of the social obligation to family, friends, community or rulers, and not for the production of value. In short, there was no alienation of the worker from the means of production and the system was not dependent on the impersonal market forces. Moreover social relations and values formed the most important determinants of work organisation and economic goals were subordinated to wider objectives of societal consolidation and security.

Obviously there were limitations to the growth that this kind of a closed system imposes. One of them was that the material level of life remained very low and technical changes and innovations were minimized. Lack of competition and absence of the profit motive meant the efficiency of production and newer ways of producing things were minimized too. This was implicit in the social structure itself which failed to reward innovators, thereby hampering growth and accumulation. In some cases it was essential to conform to the existing ways of doing things in order to retain the communal citizenship. Destructive forces of nature were accommodated in the life cycles rather than fought and controlled, and diversification in economic activities was largely unknown. Societal needs were minimal and tribes seemed wrapped up in themselves.

Besides the village communes, there were other modes of production where social relations differed from the above mode. These included the pastoral mode, prevalent in the drier areas; the artisans and traders' mode and the banana culture of the Kilimanjaro and Usambara regions, where the emergence of perennial culture led to social differentiations based on land holdings. Here the artificial scarcity of land created a struggle for its control which manifested in the gradual emergence of feudal oligarchies in these areas of Tanzania. The Nyarubanja system of land tenure in West Lake is a case in point where the peasants (Bailu) were deprived of their land by the ruling elite who extracted both produce and services in return for security (Rweyemamu,1973:Chap.1).

Pre-colonial societies therefore were not undifferentiated communal entities but complex systems characterised by several modes of production. While there is evidence of differentiation, the economy did not exhibit signs of dependency

relations.

Slave-trade seems to have had disastrous effects on the country, which was drained of some of the most active section of the population. This seriously undermined the stability of the traditional economy by reducing the productivity. Slave (and other) trade led to the development of a system of stratification more complex than the hitherto existing chief lineage\commoner system. Although the chiefs often adapted to the slave and ivory trade to shore up their traditional status with wealth and power acquired thereby, the nature of chieftainship changed in the process. The religious base for political power gave way to military base or wealth as the basis of that political power (Kaplan,1978).

The impact of trade and commerce on traditional African societies was revolutionary. Besides the political, 19th century trade had other effects on the social system of these societies. Prior to the increase of trade, the highest status was accorded to the free cultivator, the hunter and the ritual specialist. These were now replaced by the traders. Successful traders could invest in plantation, hire workers (or buy slaves) and produce surplus food to buy support from others. They even acquired imported goods and guns, both of which enhanced their prestige.

The colonial period was one of European exploitation of the population and raw materials. Both German (1884-1918) and British (1919-61) colonization was characterised by:

1) The establishment of a plantation system.
2) The introduction of metropolitan-oriented cash crops among the African peasants with the resultant changes in labour relations.
3) The development of a financial infrastructure and communication system to serve the new production structure.
4) The establishment of foreign trade with a metropolitan "centre", whose "periphery" served as an "overseas economy" of the colonizing metropole.

The colony provided land, labour, raw materials and market for finished goods. Colonialism imposed exclusive spheres of influence while at the same time restricting the colony to terminal activity in production, where the colony's specialization was in producing the raw materials and importing a few of the finished goods. Colonisation reinforced traditional societal stratification and also developed new ones linked to capitalist exploitation. With the commercialization of agricultural activities an African merchant class was beginning to be formed. European colonization also created an auxiliary class of privileged people that exploited the peasants. With it emerged a salaried African class. The stratification was based on the newly acquired economic, social and political power by the local people.

It is against this background that the struggle for independence was initiated which finally culminated in the country gaining its political independence in 1961. Some Marxist academics believed that the development of Tanzanian (like other developing countries) economy and society under the colonial regimes led to the development of underdevelopment (Shivji,1976; Rodney,1972).

2.6. Political Organization.

In considering the political aspects of pre-colonial African societies a distinction needs to be drawn between the Western concept of what was 'political' and the traditional African concept. If the definition of "political" is derived from the Weberian concept of state, where the state claims "the monopoly of the legitimate use of physical force....within a given territorial area" (Parsons,1964:154) then it would be difficult to find much that we can call political in these societies. Furthermore, even the struggle for the exercise of "power" in the European historical context seems irrelevant here. It would be safer to regard as "political" those organisations that provided a platform for the advancement of the common interest of a wider group of people, like a council of elders, a descent group or an age set. In this way the pseudo-borderlines created by the classical evolutionists between "states" and "non-states" can be superseded.

From the middle of 18th century onwards principle tribal groups in Tanzania were coalescing and settling down as small agricultural and pastoral groups linked by custom, religion and language. These groups often combined to form larger entities and from time to time outstanding chiefs emerged who extended their suzerainty, protecting their people and imposing some degree of order and government (Cameron and Dodd,1970:31). This kaleidoscopic pattern of constant grouping and disintegration continued leading to occasional rise and fall of minor empires. However by 1880's no single chief or ruler could claim to be powerful enough to dominate even a fraction of what came to be known as Tanzania. Thus there was no central government and therefore no centralized political organisation. Although the functions of individual chiefs were not as elaborate as those of the present day governments their roles were wider than merely "political".

Our interpretation of what constitutes as "political" in the traditional African society helps us to accommodate "ritual" as part of the political. The main purpose of the political institutions in pre-colonial Africa was to maintain order and cohesion in the society and securing the conditions for its reproduction. Thus the political actions taken to fulfil this purpose always had a strong ritualistic and religious dimension embedded in it. As Radcliffe-Brown (1970) claims, it was "often impossible to separate, even in thought, political office from ritual or religious office" (Preface:pagexxi)

In these unpredictable ecological conditions of Africa with a low level of productive forces of the pre-colonial period, political organisations seemed to require the collaboration of supernatural forces which were believed to be in contact with the natural forces. In rural societies these were mainly the spirits of ancestors and natural spirits. In fact ritual responsibility was both a function and a major base for political power. However the forces that propelled political development were in the area of economic and social change, conditioned by ecology, that gradually created the need for a more elaborate control of the society through a political organisation. Political leaders had, besides the ritual, other roles to fulfil, namely economic and judicial. This was achieved by intervention in production and the division of output between direct consumption and storage. It was also their role to adjudicate disputes between individuals or groups.

Political power is normally built on the twin pillars of force and consent (Godelier, 1980:609-616). However the two are not mutually exclusive and in the Tanzanian context the emphasis seemed to have remained more on consent derived from real or putative common interests and their symbolic representations, produced in public rituals. The leaders' role extended even to issues like control of witchcraft, the maintenance of land fertility and the ritual procedures known as "rain-making".

Far too little is known about the actual long-range historical development of the politically defined societies in the traditional Tanzanian context. The advance of political concentration was slow and uneven and political units in the pre-colonial Tanzania generally remained small. It was long-distance trade that seemed to have been responsible for both the break-up and unification of the polities (Koponen,1988:202).

During the colonial period from 1887 to 1945 and to 1961 African political development became an axillary to the European politics and many chiefs became agents of the European colonisers. German colonial rule, was largely concerned with the "pacification" of the country and its people. There was little predetermined policy and little conformity throughout the country, the overriding concern being military rule. The Maji Maji rebellion led the German government to make a complete re-appraisal of its colonial policy. While the policy of the German administration was one of direct rule by largely rejecting chiefs and sub-chiefs, the British adopted the policy of "indirect rule", where traditional indigenous authorities were given the local powers. New "Native Authorities" were created with three areas of power and control.

Firstly, they had executive powers of promoting peace, good order and welfare. Secondly, they had judicial powers exercised in native courts. Thirdly, they had financial powers exercised through native treasuries which drew their revenue from hut and poll taxes, court fees and cess on local produce. This policy

adopted by Cameron was criticized as an obstacle to modernisation. The perfectly credible attempts to graft modern local government on to the stock of traditional rule were doomed.

The British policy emphasised financial self-sufficiency in its colonies. This policy of "self-reliance" meant that poorer colonies like Tanganyika could not better their facilities. Sir Donald Cameron as the governor attempted to improve the conditions and it was under his governorship that the basic pattern of central government took shape. At one time a union between Tanganyika, Kenya and Uganda was envisaged and as long ago as 1898 Lugard had toyed with this idea (Cameron and Dodd, 1970:44).

The second World War marked the end of an era, with three new features in the post-war period that paved the way for the ultimate termination of the colonial empire. These were the rise of Africans to political power, the further intrusion of the outside world into Tanzanian affairs and a new concept of education and its role in the economic and social development. Cameron's idea was to localize political activity around traditional indigenous institutions and then guide and control them from the centre. In every field he wanted the natives to stand on their own. However, the native authorities failed to deal with the burning local issues and expressed no confidence in the African organs of the government developed by the British. Local political parties began taking shape after the war and TANU (Tanganyika African National Union) fought, from 1954 onwards, a winning and bloodless battle for independence. In September 1960 Nyerere became the Chief Minister and 15 months later the country became independent.

2.7. Traditional and Colonial Education.

We are cautioned by some of the commentators on Tanzania's past, over the dangers of attempting to be too specific about education in traditional African society for at least three reasons: firstly, because of the absence of contemporary written records of its nature and evolution, secondly, because of the lack of homogeneity amongst the various groups of Bantu people that constituted the African society and thirdly, because of the foreign perceptions in most written records available on traditional African education.

Durkheim, a French sociologist, defined education as the systematic socialization of youth by which they learn religious and moral beliefs, patriotism and collective opinions of the society, thereby integrating the individuals into the wider community (Blackmore and Cooksey,1981:16). This, in its broad sense, seems to be applicable to all societies including the pre-colonial African. Both formal and informal education seem to fit into this broad definition. If the purpose of

education is to pass on to the future generations the attitudes, skills, values and social understanding and practices of the society they belong to, and to socialize them to usefully and harmoniously fit into their respective communities, then one wonders what the difference is between formal and informal education. This question is deliberately avoided by some writers like Malinowski, for instance, who describes schooling as a somewhat restricted part of education provided by professional educators under their tutelage in organised institutions of learning. This distinction is unfortunately limited by its emphasis on the outward characteristics rather than the basic function.

Be as it may, there seems to be a scholarly consensus over one central issue: before the coming of the Europeans there was education in Africa(if not schooling), and its purpose was to pass on to the younger generation the values, beliefs and some skills in order to maintain the society's identity and continuity (Zanolli, 1971; Camaron and Dodd, 1970, Gillette, 1979). As to the form it took and the medium it used to impart that education we need to examine the available records to recognise the distinction between traditional education and modern schooling.

In pre-colonial Africa the child's learning began with the immediate and extended family, then through the compounds and fields of its neighbours and peers and then to the members of the larger society (Zanolli,1971). The physical, emotional and intellectual growth of the young was not the responsibility of a single body appointed specifically to fulfil that function. Parents, siblings, extended family and the whole village community thought it their duty to contribute whenever necessary towards the growth and development of the children in African society. Almost any adult in the village could play the parental role in instructing, disciplining or rewarding the village children.

The methodology of imparting knowledge took basically three forms: skills acquired largely by imitating the elders where adult roles were accomplished through the process of learning by doing; a short period of formal training that preceded all initiation ceremonies; and the oral tradition of transmitting knowledge through the use of legends, folk tales, lullabies, riddles, proverbs and other traditions that encapsulated much of the inherited wisdom of the society. The link between education and work was more direct than in formal education and this characteristic of its close relevance to life made it both functional and limiting at the same time. Education was undifferentiated from other spheres of activity and this integration of life and learning, whilst limiting in some ways, was one of the strongest positive aspects of traditional African education.

The amount of contact time between parents and children was far more than where children went to formal schools. Girls stayed with their mothers most of the time and boys with their fathers as much as their ability permitted. In this way the oral tradition was further reinforced and ideas and information were passed on at

all times. Thus, in effect, the household, the fields, the playground and work places all served as places of learning and communication. This also helped in creating stronger emotional and physical bonds between the various age groups.

Another important feature of the socialization process was the emphasis on group activities. Peer group ventures included role playing for anticipatory socialization and practice into adulthood roles. Games were geared towards developing co-operation, competition, team spirit and physical dexterity; and collective participation in rites and rituals was encouraged for communal solidarity and psychological development. Kenyatta gives examples of little girls plaiting baskets of grass and grinding corn, like their mothers, and cooking imaginary dishes (Kenyatta, 1959:101).

Spiritual and moral beliefs were normally inculcated through folklore, rituals, tribal legend, songs and dance. In the evening some adults gathered the children of the compound and taught them laws and customs, especially those governing moral code and rules of etiquette and behaviour in the community.

Sex roles were clearly demarcated in the educational setting and while boys were prepared for becoming warriors, hunters, fishermen, builders or farmers, girls were given domestic, child rearing and productive agricultural roles with training in the social function of their becoming wives and mothers (Cameron and Dodd,1970). The effects of sexual stratification were clearly seen in the ready acceptance of their different social, productive and political roles in society. In preparation for marriage the girls were instructed to be agreeable to the other wives of their husbands, to work hard and be obedient and respectful to their husbands, and the in-laws (Castle, 1966:42). The inferior status accorded to the women was reflected in their low participation in decision-making and public affairs and also in the exploitation of their labour power. This form of blatant inequality in the traditional African society was part of a solidly legitimized and culturally accepted set of stratified privileges that seemed to have been missed by the egalitarian ideologists in their romanticization of African societies.

Having discussed some of the main aspects of education in relatively unstratified societies we can now consider educational arrangements in societies with higher levels of stratification. There were certain societies in Africa with specialist occupations with marked inequalities in the distribution of wealth, status and power that tended to have a more differentiated educational system and more formal education than the simple agricultural and pastoral systems.

Among the Nupe of Nigeria, for example, there were guilds for blacksmiths, miners, glassmakers, weavers, builders, carpenters and butchers. Most of these were hereditary occupations making up a specific social class which only rarely admitted new members (Nadel,1942:286). The occupation remained strictly in family hands

(Moumouni,1968:27). Certain crafts were female monopolies like dying, pottery-making etc. In the Nupe society, weaving at a loom was restricted to upper class women, who passed on the skills to their daughters (Blackemore and Cooksey, 1981:20). Other highly stratified societies were the Buganda (Uganda), Ashanti (Ghana) and Bahaya and Boha (Tanzania).

There were certain definite drawbacks of the pre-colonial education that need to be mentioned here and reference to it will be made again in the later chapters.

Firstly, there was content differentiation between the sexes (and ages). Generally the treatment given to women and their role in the political and social life of the community was unjustifiably discriminatory. Secondly, corporal punishment was meted out to all forms of disobedient learners. Thirdly, non-conformity was severely condemned and so was questioning, arguing and disobeying. If extra effort and initiative was put into farming by the new learners and a surplus created as a result, then those concerned were frowned upon (Zanolli,1970). In extreme cases crops would be stolen or destroyed and the concerned family temporarily isolated. Fourthly, the education given was very limited and failed to trap the mind into doing its own thinking. Since criticism was not encouraged, progress was stifled. As a result, these societies seem to have changed little in centuries of their relatively static existence. From that point of view colonialism brought brutal but positive revolutionary changes in these societies.

On the positive side, education in general was successful in maintaining the harmony and continuity of these fairly closed scattered societies such that the organic integration of education and society survived a hundred years of British and German colonial rule. Education did not alienate its recipients nor did it misplace them as far as their future work in life was concerned. Children learned by doing and everything they did had meaning and functionality; and this maintained the interest and enthusiasm of the learners in the educative process. However, it seems unrealistic to call for a return to pre-colonial tradition however much we may wish to romanticize those societies and condemn colonialism.

In pre-colonial Africa therefore we find a wide spectrum of educational arrangements from informal socialization in individual homes and compounds to formal craft apprenticeships, Islamic schooling and elaborate initiation ceremonies.

Lastly, we need to very briefly examine colonial education in Tanzania.

The main function of traditional education was socialization and enculturation - lifelong processes by which individuals were incorporated into the clan and imparted the knowledge and skills to behave and respond in ways expected by the society according to age, sex and status. However, with the advent of

colonisation and the introduction of formal education in Tanzania, there was a drastic change in the form, content and function of education.

Formal non-indigenous education did not begin either with European missionaries or the first colonial power but with the Arabs (Cameron and Dodd,1970:50). For centuries now Islamic education through the Koranic schools had been part of Tanzania's educational scene. Unfortunately, very little attention has been accorded in history to their importance and influence, partly because of the biases of the missionaries and historians, who were Christian, and who deliberately underestimated or ignored the impact of this rival faction of influence in a common territory (ibid : 50). Even during the German and British periods Muslim expansion went unabated. As early as 1924 there were on the mainland alone, 700 Koranic Schools with an enrolment of over 8000 students. Islam had no difficulty in coming to terms with the indigenous traditional cultures with its tenets of universal brotherhood and equality. Islamic schools were essentially religious, and largely limited themselves to the reading of Arabic and memorization of the Quran. Universities like Al-Azhar in Egypt and other reputed academic institutions were established in Africa and the Swahili language enriched itself immensely by its adoption of Arabic words. It was long after these Quranic schools had been well established that Western type of schooling achieved levels of enrolment enjoyed by the former. The word "Swahili" itself comes from the Arabic "Sahel" meaning coast.

Christianity and Mission Schools gained their acceptance too, for secular reasons, like the fact that the Christian missions provided material support to Africans, who had, during this late 19th century, been passing through a period of great social distress and upheaval caused by the slave-trade, and a wave of epidemics. The first missionary schools were, besides being Baptismal centres, incipient theological colleges which produced some of the most able African politicians and priests of the time.

The African was seen as the "fallen man" who had to be redeemed and with him his society whose values and practices the Europeans found repugnant (Cameron and Dodd,1970:54). The missionaries therefore came with the ethnocentric and egocentric self-imposed role of being the sole agents of civilization and salvation. The Christian mission stations provided security and a new way of life in opposition to much that went on outside their walls. This alienation was reinforced through the colonial schools which became spearheads of uncompromising Westernisation. It was a traumatic experience for Africans to be so dominated by not only a foreign way of life but at the same time be faced with a total condemnation of all they believed and practised. By the turn of the last century and before the beginning of German rule there were about 600 mission schools with an enrolment of about 50,000 pupils.

The education system created the by German administration was from a

secular point of view, far superior to that of the missionaries. It was efficient, goal oriented and vocational in nature. The Germans, however, feared expansion of education for Africans since they feared losing the cheap labour that was required in their plantations. Some major drawbacks of the German system included not educating females, confining education to coastal areas, and emphasizing submissiveness rather than enlightenment among its recipients. Thus, there were gender, regional and curricular inconsistencies in the system although it achieved two major break-throughs: laying the foundation of a national language and establishing a purely secular system of education. The missionaries had favoured vernacular language instruction while the Germans had stressed on Swahili being used as a medium of instruction. And while the missionaries preferred co-educational schools, the Germans had preferred to school only boys. A common feature among many foreigners in Africa then was the need to dominate, control, advise and civilize (Zanolli,1970:100). The prevailing European conviction was that Africa's salvation lay in complete change. In 1903 an official circular spelled out the two major aims of the German educational system. To enable natives to be used for government administration and to inculcate a liking for order, diligence and dutifulness together with a sound knowledge of German customs. By 1914 Germans had established 60 primary, 9 central and 1 high school. After the German period (1884-1914) the British took over and ruled from 1919 to 1961.

The English quickly set about differentiating the educational system by race, religion, region and in some cases sex (Dubbledam, 1970). Access to schooling for the various groups was unequal since the system was basically designed to teach a few to dominate the rest (Morrison,1971). Segregation and discrimination by sex and region was so well pronounced that by 1947 not a single female had gone beyond the primary school (Cameron and Dodd,1970:104).

The British tried to localize the curriculum and introduce agriculture as a subject. This rural oriented curriculum was not unlike that proposed by Nyerere after independence. At both times however it failed to produce the desired results since the expectations of the parents and pupils were different from those of the colonizers and rulers. All the same, Agriculture was introduced in the curriculum, especially in the rural schools.

According to the parents the British policy of encouraging the use of localized curriculum seemed to restrict the African children to inferior alternatives in the country side. It is revealing, however, that the Africans no longer accepted to return to the traditional way of life in their traditional rural setting. This sudden desire to acquire Western type of formal schooling with its irrelevant and bookish curriculum, according to Gillette, was a sign of full internalization of alien values and behaviours in order to escape the inferior status imposed on the alternative type of education by the colonial society (Gillette,1977).

The perpetuation of colonial education included European work ethic, individualization, measurable merit and capitalist social relations in work. Since the colonial ideology and the language used were so intertwined with symbols of power and authority, most African countries tended to retain the colonial education system intact (Carnoy, 1974). Instead of transmitting the local culture the colonial system seemed a calculated approach at weaning the African School child from his own customs, culture and traditions (Busia,1964;Rodney,1972).

Some efforts were made to provide education within the context of the African economic and cultural life (Thomas, 1925). Two surveys in 1921 and 1924 were conducted to look into the possibility of providing such an education, and this led to the popular "Phelps-Stokes Report" which recommended that the education should, on the one hand, be consistent with the indigenous values and norms and on the other be a source of new skills and knowledge required for administration. Education was thus to serve to preserve and also bring about social change. However, these efforts were largely unsuccessful because of their unpopularity among the missionaries and among the natives (Morrison,1978:58).

History was to sadly repeat itself forty years later in a different context. As independence approached, demand for formal education increased but there were difficulties involved in both curtailing it and permitting its growth. The material conditions and reward systems were such that even vocational education failed to motivate parents to accept it full-heartedly. It is indeed unfortunate that the lessons learnt from these past experiences were not made use of when the Education for Self-Reliance Policy was launched in 1967.

On the eve of political independence in 1961 all the contradictions of the colonial education were finally handed over to the new African governments to resolve, when the latter took control of their schools.

END NOTES

1. A distinction needs to be made between 'class' and stratification in the traditional African context. Class in the Western sense of the word often has definite Marxian connotation of rank or order in society dependant on the socio-economic or hereditary status. Stratification on the other hand, in the African context, meant differentiations existing between members of the society or even within a family based on cultural beliefs and taboos.

2. Collectivist societies lived together sharing the same customs, laws, land and certain activities. But this did not necessarily ensure equality among its members.

CHAPTER 3

TANZANIA'S SOCIALIST IDEOLOGY AND ITS IMPLICATIONS FOR EDUCATION

3.1. Prolegomena.

With political decolonisation of Africa the new states were faced with the task of rapid economic development on the one hand, and creation of new values on the other. However, the immediate post-independence aspirations of Tanzania were the same as those of neighbouring Kenya and Uganda, namely to abolish racial inequalities of the colonial era, educate middle and high level manpower, Africanise the civil service and attract foreign aid. Education was to be used to create unity and help in the development of the new state.

Colonialism, it was believed, had not only disrupted and disoriented African economies but had also largely destroyed the traditional values and attitudes of the indigenous people. Moreover, nation-building was never the primary objective of colonial powers in Africa. Nyerere therefore faced the challenge of rekindling the traditional African values in the modern setting while at the same time incorporating the positive aspects of the alien cultural forms. Tanzania, like other African countries, was in the process of a second transition, in which it was faced with the challenge of searching for ways of combining the communal, protective and spiritual traditions of the tribes with the scientific, secular and individualistic ethic of the West (Stabler, 1979:33). This seemingly paradoxical desire of some of the states in Africa to modernize and revive the traditional values at the same time made the process of transition far more complex than it already was.

Julius Nyerere has been the single most influential leader in the history of Tanzania in affecting and shaping the country's development over the past four decades. Since his school days he had two major obsessions: an unshakable belief in the equality of all human beings and a passionate devotion to human justice. The three basic essentials for an ideal society for him, were: equality, freedom and unity. These values, he thought, were not new to Africa since they had been practised for many generations until colonial influence disrupted them. It was from this base that he developed a social philosophy, 'Ujamaa', which was both a philosophy and an ideological system. In 1962 he articulated his thoughts concerning the path the country should take in a paper entitled, "Ujamaa - The Basis of African Socialism." Unquestionably, the ideological orientation of the Party (TANU) and the style of politics that marked Tanzania's distinctiveness were due to Nyerere's intellectual commitment and political will (Mohiddin, 1981:50).

During the first decade of independence a number of tendencies in Tanzanian society convinced Nyerere of the need to evolve a concrete ideology and a vigorous

commitment to a strategy for the future development path Tanzania was to take for her growth. He had noticed a growing oligarchic and authoritarian trend within his own party leadership and increasing class stratification among the urban groups (Stabler, 1979:36). The government and Party had not yet evolved any systematic and long-range social and political ideology or policy. By 1966 Nyerere realized that "....we were drifting away from our basic socialist goals of human equality, human dignity and government by the whole people" (Pratt, 1976:229). Two attitudes in particular were identified within the government as being responsible for this trend: a belief that foreign assistance was the only way to economic prosperity and a growing political acquisitiveness among Nyerere's political colleagues and civil service.

Education was another factor that was widening the gap between the modern and traditional sector and creating an elite in the process. A final confrontation with the University students who marched in protest against the governments' decision to make National Service compulsory for them, proved to be the last straw calling for a major ideological pronouncement.1

It was these events that lay behind the two main strands of Arusha Declaration: those that emphasize self-reliance, opposing reliance on foreign aid and those that set forth a leadership code designed to curb the acquisitive tendencies of civil servants. In a lucid and vivid language, the 1967 Arusha Declaration gave a new definition to African socialism together with a new strategy of development. Poverty and ignorance were not going to be fought with the wrong weapon- money. The development of Tanzania was going to be brought about by people whose basis for development would be the principle of self-reliance.

Nyerere had been influenced by various writers, amongst whom John Stuart Mill, Karl Marx and Rene Dumont hold a prominent place. Dumonts' <u>False Start In Africa</u> had its impact in that Nyerere was impressed by the author who had warned African leaders of the dangers of elitism, prestige projects, the neglect of rural people, thoughtless mechanisation, imitative social values and education, together with corruption and indiscipline. Nyerere made the book required reading for all his ministers and other top civil servants.

In his introduction to <u>Freedom and Socialism</u> Nyerere stated in 1968 that there was no model that Tanzania could copy from for her development strategy. However, he admitted that it would be foolish to reject the lessons that needed to be learnt from the experiences of other countries and ideas of other people. Professor Svendsen called it an international credo of non-alignment vis-a-vis ideological schools.

It is significant to note that this national leader, who initiated the struggle for independence, fought and won it, then went on to critically examine the crucial

issues facing his country's development needs, and after extensively writing about it continued to sincerely follow its implementation to the day he voluntarily stepped down to make way for a fresh perception to development.

3.2. Theoretical Perceptions on the Choice of Development Strategies.

3.2.1. Equilibrium Paradigm.

When Tanzania became independent on 9th December 1961 it inherited its place in the international community from her colonial relationship. Political independence did not mean economic or cultural independence and the colonial hegemony coloured every aspect of the national life. Tanzania was strongly influenced by the modernization and human capital theories, where modernization, development and westernization seemed synonymous terms (Blomstrom and Hettne, 1984:145). The newly independent countries the world over were seeking the key to progress and modernity and since numerous studies had given credence to the above theoretical notions (McClelland, 1961; Harbison and Myers, 1964), Tanzania followed the precepts preached by the modernization gurus. The first important task seemed to be to modernize the primitive agricultural sector where 90% of the labour force was engaged. In accordance with the modernization paradigm, modern capital-intensive farms were favoured. The same thinking was reflected in the industrialization strategy, where each sector in the `modern' economy was foreign owned (Blomstrom and Hettne,1984:145).

The human capital theory, also called the cost-benefit or rate-of-return approach, gained unprecedented attention in the literature and research of the 1950's and 1960's. The focus was primarily on education's role in preparing and training skilled manpower, entrepreneurs, and innovators for socio-economic modernization in accordance with the western model. Huq(1965) illustrated this with an input-output model where an input of education led to an output of educated manpower in which the "citizenry is responsive and committed to national goals" having habits, attitudes and motivations "conducive to dynamic progress" (pg:107). Tanzania's early development plans clearly reflected the human capital approach and emphasis was put on higher education at the expense of the much needed expansion of primary education. By the end of 1960s, however, many underdeveloped countries had swung from manpower deficits to manpower surpluses without the accompanying economic growth or development.

The equilibrium theories faced severe criticisms in the 1970's by protagonists of the conflict paradigm who proposed fundamental changes in power relations as a prerequisite to educational reform. The concept of modernization in Tanzania was modified to, what Samuel Mushi aptly described as, "modernisation by traditionalization" (Mushi, 1971:13-69). Tanzania's first Five-Year Development

Plan (1964-69), based on the recommendations of the International Bank for Reconstruction and Development (IBRD) proved to be a total failure (Mohiddin,1981:53). It was during this time that Nyerere decided to critically examine the developmental priorities the country had so far pursued and as a result gave the people a new alternative perspective to follow in order to fulfil her developmental needs.

In contrast to harmony or equilibrium paradigm, conflict theories emphasized contradictions and change as unavoidable features of social relations and institutions - a struggle for dominance between competing groups.

Marx based his study on a materialist interpretation of history. A society's development can be analyzed by beginning with the process of production, which in turn contained two important aspects - the forces of production and the relations of production. The former include land, labour and capital and the later include relations between human beings during production, exchange and distribution of the material utilities. Both, the forces and relations of production form the mode of production which constitutes its economic structure.

All historical changes, according to Marx, originate in conflict between the forces and relations of production. When conflicts become too great a social revolution becomes inevitable. The old mode is replaced by a new one; and Marx mentioned several modes where feudalism was replaced by capitalism which in turn would be replaced by socialism. However, Marx doubted the possibility of less developed countries being capable of accomplishing this on their own, since, he thought, they were 'primitive' and incapable of starting a process of development by themselves (Blomstrom and Hettne,1984). He therefore thought that colonialism was a necessary evil for moving from pre-capitalist modes of production into capitalist mode. Nyerere found the basic Marxist logic intolerable.

> As prayer is to Christianity...so is 'class war' to the European version of Socialism... The European socialist cannot think of his socialism without its father - capitalism!....I find this contradiction quite intolerable. For it virtually says, without capitalism, and conflict (it) creates...there can be no socialism. African Socialism, on the other hand,...did not start from the existence of conflicting 'classes' in society. The foundation, and the objective, of African Socialism is the extended family..... Ujamaa, then, or Family hood, describes our socialism. It is opposed to capitalism, which seeks to build a happy society on the basis of the exploitation of man by man; and it is equally opposed to doctrinaire socialism which seeks to build its happy society on a philosophy of inevitable conflict between man and man (Nyerere, 1962:12).

Tanzania's brand of socialism created profound interest among the politicians, academicians and educators for several reasons. It was an ideology that seemed to be genuinely indigenous to Africa. There was no domination of material property looming large over the ideology and it was not a product of envy or even conflict between class enemies. The very basis for African socialism was distinctly different from the Marxist variety. It was a socialism that attempted to avoid both the exploitation that was inherent in capitalism and conflict that was central to Marxist socialism. Nyerere made a disquieting comparison when he equated communism with capitalism arguing that in both the systems it was the worker that ended up being exploited. Ironically both the systems had used extensive rhetoric placing the masses in the forefront as the central cause of all development.

3.2.2. Marxist and Neo-Marxist Theories.

Marxian socialism normally subscribed to some or all of the following propositions (Rejai,1970):

1. Material, economic variables were seen as the primary forces in any society, where the mode of production and the accompanying classes - constituted the mainspring of historical development.
2. Social and economic imperfections invariably would find expression in conflicts and contradictions among antagonistic class forces leading to a class war and revolution.
3. The driving force behind the revolutionary changes would be a small, highly disciplined group of party revolutionaries who would become the militant "vanguard" for a united proletariat.
4. To struggle against the bourgeois oppression and dictatorship would be the greatest pre-occupation of the party, which would function as the class instrument of the proletariat. The existing regime has to be overthrown and replaced by the dictatorship of the masses.
5. This revolution sooner or later would envelop the entire global society in its struggle against oppression (Rejai,1970).

Education for Marxists is seen as part of the ideological and political structure that the ruling class controls to maintain its dominance and privilege (Klucknikov,1977:40). Formal education is viewed as dependent on economic and political institutions and as such cannot serve as an agent of social change. As against this Nyerere firmly relied on the role of education to serve as an agent of social change. Marxists on the other hand note that it is through education that the values of the dominant class are internalized. Central to their thinking is the argument that public schools invariably tend to undermine their egalitarian promise and that they actually play an important role in reproducing an unequal society (Liston, 1988). Bowles views the school system as a 'recruiter' of a labour force

resigned to work productively in the setting of the capitalist firm and a 'gate keeper' regulating the quantitative growth of a work force, e.g. through credentials (Bowles, 1980: 215-8). Carnoy reiterates the same thinking and believes educational institutions tend to train workers to an ideology of compliance.

Critiques of the above hypothesis claim this analysis to be too deterministic since it ignores the relative autonomy that schools enjoy in their institutional setting. Since Tanzanian socialism is distinctively different from Marxist socialism we only need to examine the Tanzanian strand in order to get a clearer understanding of the basis of 'Ujamaa'.

3.2.3. The Two Socialist Camps in Tanzania

In the late 1960's Tanzania attracted to its university a number of able Marxist and neo-Marxist scholars from the West and East. As against these, a second group of socialist commentators whose sympathies and ideological orientations were more close to Nyerere's, also occupied a prominent place in the debate on Tanzania's development strategy. These two groups were variously branded as Marxists and non-Marxists, insurrectionary and constitutional socialists (Milibrand, 1974) or vanguard and democratic socialists. Amongst the most prominent of Marxist socialists commenting on Tanzanian struggle were Bienefeld (1982), Coulson (1979), Cliffe (1978), Saul (1979) Shivji (1975) and M. Von Freyhold (1979). The Democratic socialists included Mwansasu (1979), Mushi (1974) Pratt (1976), Hyden (1969,1980) and of course Nyerere.

As against the criteria or indices enumerated above(3.2.2) that distinguish Marxian socialism, democratic socialism which is more attuned to Tanzania's path, has the following salient features:

1. Identification and elimination of the sources of exploitation and other societal ills. Economic and other factors need not be interpreted along Marxist lines as manifestations of the existence of classes and class contradictions.
2. Emphasis on social, collective and communal values as against norms that were strictly personal and individual. However, since the collective was made up of individuals the purpose of development was the individual within a societal setting.
3. Public ownership and control of the means of production as an essential feature of this strand of socialism.
4. Absolute equality of all human beings as a fundamental value that ultimately developed into efforts at economic and social equality. Cooperation as the basis of accomplishing social goals without the use of coercion or

competition.

5. Explicit acceptance of the democratic principle in all societal processes and institutions together with a definite rejection of violence as a means of social change.
6. Unequivocal commitment to internationalism and humanism by joining in the universal struggle against all forms of exploitation, inequalities, oppression, coercion and other global societal ills.

The basic tenets of democratic socialism enumerated above seem to correspond very closely with Tanzania's socialist principles and we shall elaborate on some of them in the rest of this chapter. In essence, Tanzania's democratic socialism was a system of beliefs that emphasized large scale, peaceful socio-economic change through cooperative and collective (Ujamaa) methods and public ownership and control of all the basic communal wealth without ignoring the individual. The ultimate goal was a universal socialist community that would be based on egalitarian and participatory democratic practices with self-reliance as the persistent guiding principle.

3.2.4. Alternative Explanations: Dependancy or an 'Uncaptured Peasantry?'

Tanzania became an important centre in the 1970's for a theoretical debate on dependency and underdevelopment in Africa. The neo-Marxist group at The University of Dar-es-salaam had clearly defined views on Tanzania's dependence. Dependency theory emerged as a major alternative to the prevailing paradigm of the 1960's (Cheru,1987:9). The basic hypothesis was that development and underdevelopment are partial, interdependent structures of one global system in which the economy of a certain country was conditioned by the development and expansion of another to which the former was subjected (Santos,1973:109-18). Elaborating on the dependency thesis, Shivji gathered extensive data on the degree of dependency Tanzania was subjected to even after the inception of Ujamaa. As a result of this theoretical development, Tanzania's industrialization and other policies came under fire and a new 'self-reliant' approach was recommended in order to reduce dependency. Strategically important firms were nationalized and foreign aid was to be channelled to projects which increased domestic activity. Importation was confined to essential goods, and increased trade with other underdeveloped countries was encouraged to lessen the commercial dependence on the metropolitan centres. The dependency perspective became popular among scholars like Shivji, Rweyemamu and Thomas.

Shivji's (1976) Class Struggle in Tanzania proved a true milestone in the Tanzanian dependency debate in which he claimed that without a real class analysis, it was impossible to chart out a correct development strategy and formulate appropriate tactics (Shivji, 1970:2). This was the first time the country's socialist

development policy was criticized from a radical point of view. Shivji emphasized that despite the nationalizations, Tanzania was not moving toward socialism and there was a rapidly growing government bureaucracy that formed the basis for a new class stratification leading Tanzania further away from its egalitarian goals. A summary of the entire debate that followed Shivji's thesis is found in Omwony-Ojwok (1977).

Dependency theory, on the whole, inspired very few studies on education (Cheru, 1987:17). In the case of Africa, Walter Rodney attempted to show the linkages in which he saw colonial education as merely "education for subordination, exploitation, and the creation of mental confusion" (Rodney,1974). The metropole's domination over the periphery seemed prevalent in the spread of knowledge through schools and mass media, where values and attitudes that supported and maintained the interests of the developed metropolitan centre, were exported. Altbach, among others, claimed that the intellectual, educational and information systems maintained control over the periphery, creating a servitude of the mind through education rather than education serving as a liberating force (Altabach,1982:470). Formal education today, in spite of all the rhetoric and revolutionary gusto, is not much different from the colonial pattern found at independence thirty years ago in Tanzania.

Education for Self-Reliance was in part a response to the realization of the level of dependency that existed in all facets of Tanzanian life. Students in Tanzanian schools exhibited all the capitalist values while the official national ideology stayed socialist. The position of the dependency school in Tanzania remained unchallenged during the first half of the 1970's, although the mood at the University had started to change. The ensuing Marxist debate stayed at an abstract level and included no attempts at providing concrete explanations, let alone solutions, of African underdevelopment (Blomstrom and Hettne,1984;151). Gradually however a more 'African' critique of the dependency school emerged that was based on uniquely African experiences. One example of a particularly useful study was provided by Goran Hyden (Hyden, 1980) who was a professor at the University of Dar-es-Salaam during 1972-7.

Instead of looking at underdevelopment and the static situation of societies in Africa as purely a result of foreign penetration, Goran Hyden developed an alternative perspective of why social transformation had proved almost impossible in Africa. He claimed that this "peasant mode" was resistant and resilient to change and it ignored the modern development demands thereby providing a formidable challenge to both modernisation efforts and socialist transformation. It was this insight about the Tanzanian peasant that Nyerere seemed to have had overlooked. Unlike the convictions about the traditional African way of life, traditionalism in this case stood as a barrier to change and growth. The state in Tanzania, according to Hyden, had failed to capture the peasantry and its 'economy of affection.' Those

in control of the state therefore had not been in control of the society. The state lacked effective instruments of power to influence and expand the peasant's role in increasing agricultural production. This analysis comes closest to the view this study attempts to pursue.

Of all the authors referred to in this study hardly any give a central focus to the mismatch between Nyerere's vision and the reality that existed in the form of human, material and psychological preparedness to fulfil the country's socialist ideals. These included internal and external constraints that stood between Nyerere's vision and the achievement of the ideal socialist society.

Thus while the dependency theorists blamed the country's ailments on colonialism and neocolonialism, the Marxist critics emphasized internal causes. The economic crisis of mid-1970's resulted in the abandoning of the dependency perspective by many, largely because of the difficulty of being able to translate the theory into practical, usable policies. Dependency itself was to be broken by the mobilization of domestic resources but the expected agricultural surplus was not forthcoming. The dismal economic performance could not be ascribed to imperialism alone. It was finally realized that the real world was far more complex than the dependency school would have us believe.

3.3. Tanzania's Socialist Ideology

Tanzania pursued a strategy for a socialist transformation of the society that had as its main features an emphasis on greater equality, enhancement of citizen participation in socialist development and the provisions for the inculcation of socialist values. The leadership in Tanzania refused to see a conflict between the two major objectives: developing an egalitarian and participatory society and economic development. Basically Tanzania sought to pursue a development path that would avoid the entrenchment of severe income differentials, the generation of selfish acquisitiveness, the perpetuation of any form of exploitation, especially in the form of the emergence of a (powerful and dominating) bourgeoisie either as property owing class or as members of the state bureaucracy (Pratt, 1979:191-230).

Tanzania's experiment was relatively unique in its desire to accomplish a socialist transformation of its people for the following reasons:firstly,it was to be accomplished without coercion and with the cooperation of the whole society. This fact is of particular importance since the initial definition of socialist objectives, and the first major policy initiatives towards these objectives came entirely from one person- Nyerere. Secondly, Nyerere and his colleagues rejected the common Marxist proposition that a successful transition to socialism requires that a dominant role be given to a vanguard party of an ideological elite. The only political party, TANU, had remained an open mass party and Nyerere was ideologically committed

to democratic participation. Thirdly, Nyerere refused to see conflict and class struggle as the motivating force for a societal transformation . We shall come back to this issue in the later part of this discussion. Because of these differences in points of view regarding the concept of socialism, it is imperative for us to establish the legitimacy of the meaning attached to the word 'socialism' by the Tanzanian leadership.

Traditionally socialism has meant adherence to an ideology being held denoting a belief in the pre-eminence of certain values, such as equality, cooperation, collective welfare and internationalism (Crosland,1962:122) which contrasts with hierarchy, competition, individualism and elitism. Institutionally, the commanding heights of the economy were to be in the hands of the state on behalf of the workers; the economy was to be planned with the objective of acquiring maximum satisfaction for the greatest number and the legal and constitutional framework prohibited exploitation between members of the civil society.

However, if the common feature of socialists was the fundamental belief in equality and cooperation, the methods employed to implement the ideals had varied greatly. The most acute conflicts seemed to have been between democratic socialists and the orthodox Marxists or communists. The former claimed that the latter's methodology of reaching their goals hade so distorted their ideals as to often negate the three original great principles that Marx espoused. These were equality, which was betrayed to a rigid economic and political hierarchy in the pretext of the "dictatorship of the proletariat"; humanity, which was regarded expendable in principle and in practice in the interest of an illusionary future millennium; and the application of science in the economic and political fields, which had given way to dogma for the purpose of imposing discipline (Roberts,1964:81) and growth. Recent events in the Soviet Union have given an added credibility to the above claims and the most fundamental theoretical quarrel over the issue of the communist millennium or the perfectibility of the classless society and the withering of the state, having been all but disbanded, there is little justification left for communist intolerance, cynicism or sacrifice of its humanity.

Democratic socialists do not deny their profound debt to Marx's ideals but they do not accept his prognostications or his prescriptions as universally applicable (Roberts,1974:81). Communism has not proved to be the final synthesis of social conflict (as predicted by Marx) and it must await the scientific application of the universal socialist ideals. African socialism, therefore, in the pragmatic and scientific twentieth century is of more than just academic interest in the total historical growth of Socialism. And within this, Tanzanian socialism seemed particulary commendable for its unique features, that we shall presently examine.

The word 'socialism' carried so many European connotations that it could not appear distinctive in African context. Thus Nyerere chose an old Swahili word

'Ujamaa' to be used in a new context which gave it a strikingly African ring. All the subtle associations of bonds of kinship, tribal hospitality and the communal welfare obligations of the extended family seemed to be contained within this simple Swahili expression (Mazrui,1972:93). The relationship between language and ideology was also seen in the way African Socialism was accepted when being propagated in Swahili.

However, 'Ujamaa', suggesting the obligation of kinship and the extended family could be misconstrued or misused to legitimize being perpetually supported by one's relatives, thereby exploiting his hospitality. So Nyerere, adding to the 'Africanness' of his concept, used an old African adage to illustrate the ethic of work and of opposition to parasitism in Tanzania's ideology: "Mgeni siku mbili; siku ya tatu mpe jembe". [A guest is treated as one for 2 days; on the third, give him a hoe]. Kinship hospitality was now qualified with an anti-parasitic ethic (Mazrui, 1972:93).

On 5th February, 1967, Nyerere dramatically announced the Arusha Declaration and a month later published Education For Self-Reliance. Explaining the role of these documents a year later he said,

> The Arusha Declaration marked a turning point in Tanzanian politics. The ideology of the country was made explicit by it; also with the introduction of 'leadership qualifications', and measures for public ownership, began a new series of deliberately socialist policy objectives (Nyerere,1968:231).

The AD began with a detailed description of a socialist state, according to Nyerere, and at the outset reiterated the party (TANU) creed in which the first seven principles covered individual human rights, including freedom of expression and the last two defined the role of the state:

> In order to ensure economic justice the state must have effective control over the principal means of production. That it is the responsibility of the state to intervene actively in the economic life of the nation so as to ensure the well-being of all citizens, and so as to prevent the exploitation.....and to prevent the accumulation of wealth to the extent which is inconsistent with the existence of a classless society (Nyerere, 1968:231-2).

The following seven principles emerge from the declaration:

3.3.1. Absence of Exploitation:

A truly socialist state, was one in which neither capitalism nor feudalism existed. It did not have two classes of people, a lower class composed of people who worked for their living, and an upper class of people who lived on the work of others (Nyerere,1968:83). In discussing the concept of exploitation Nyerere moved beyond the conventional Marxist notion in terms of class relations based on ownership of the basic means of production, distribution and exchange. Here he meant one person or a group living on the proceeds of the work of others (Nyerere,1968:242). Nyerere gave examples of gender and regional exploitation where the wealth was produced by farmers and peasants but the social amenities like hospitals and paved roads were concentrated in the urban centres. When 400 university students demonstrated against the government's decision to make National Service compulsory for those receiving free education, Nyerere, in his rage and despair, said:

> All of us, me and you, we belong to a single class of exploiters. Is this what the citizens of this country worked for? Is this what we fought for.....In order to maintain a top level of exploiters...? You are demanding a pound of flesh; everybody is demanding a pound of flesh except the poor peasant (Pratt,1976:234)

For Nyerere the principle of 'each according to his capacity and to each according to his need' was a valid one and anyone or a group that argued that because they contributed more to the national income, that they should therefore receive an equivalent share to their contribution, was exploiting his fellow beings and displaying an antisocial, capitalist attitude of mind (Nyerere,1962:9).
Nyerere was determined to reduce the income differentials between people doing different kinds of work and the only people who could be dependent would be children, the very old and the handicapped (AD pg.16).

3.3.2. Control Over the Means of Production.

The second essential feature of a socialist state was the need for state ownership of, (to use Aneurin Bevan's phrase), the "commanding heights of the economy." These included all the major means of production, exchange and distribution like land, forests, oil, news media, communications, banks, insurance, import-export trade, wholesale trade, motor-cars, large factories, plantations etc.

On the issue of state ownership the AD stressed the fact that nationalization by itself was not a sufficient condition for the existence of socialism. Who actually owned, and in what proportions was an important question in theory, at least. Socialism implied the equality of all beings and the satisfaction of the basic needs of all.

So it was in the interest of serving the people best and not simply in the ownership of means of production, that the objective of socialism was achieved. In his essays on 'Ujamma' Nyerere said,

> Socialism is an attitude of mind. In the individual, as in the society, it is an attitude of mind which distinguishes the socialist from the non-socialist. It has nothing to do with the possession or non-possession of wealth (Nyerere,1962:1).

There would be no need for nationalization if people owning the means of production or any wealth, valued it only because it was to be used in the service of his/her fellow beings. However, said Nyerere, since socialist millionaires were a rare phenomenon and could hardly be the product of socialist societies it became necessary for the state to intervene in the distribution of wealth. He argued that the capitalists' claim that the millionaire's wealth was the just reward for his ability or enterprise, was not a valid claim because it was similar to the feudal monarch's claim over his wealth. Both were users and exploiters of the abilities and enterprise of other people:

> There must be something wrong in a society where one man, however hard-working or clever he may be, can acquire as great a 'reward' as a thousand of his fellows can acquire between them (Nyerere,1962:3).

Acquisitiveness, or the very desire to accumulate, for Nyerere, was antisocial since wealth tended to corrupt those who possessed it, and was an indication of a vote of no confidence in the social system to take care of them in the future. With a socialist attitude of mind there could hardly be any room for either parasitism or acquisitiveness. Socialism was essentially distributive, and acquisitive socialism was a contradiction in terms.

Individual ownership of land was also foreign to traditional African Society, in which land always belonged to the community. The African's right to land was simply the right to use it - disuse or misuse automatically revoked that right. Landlords usually were, according to Nyerere,in the same class as loiterers and parasites (Nyerere,1962:7). Thus land-hoarding was to be replaced with land holding.

3.3.3. Democracy

In order to be socialist, the AD asserted, the country must have its government and other public institutions chosen and led by the people themselves. Nyerere insisted that "True socialism cannot exist without a democracy also existing in the society" (Nyerere, 1968:234). Although no definition of democracy was

offered in the AD it did state the absolute necessity of the government to be chosen and led by the peasants and workers themselves (ibid). Democracy in its substantive sense presupposed human equality.

Another aspect of democracy that Nyerere emphasized was the people's participation in decision-making. The Presidential Circular No 1 of 1970 was intended to involve the worker in the process of production and those of decision-making. Socialism entailed more than a mere public ownership of the means of production. In order to reenforce the democratic principle the party leadership was continuously reminded of its responsibilities while the masses were reminded of their rights, and political consciousness. In an address at Cairo University on 10th April 1967, Nyerere further underlined the importance of democracy:

> The people must be and must know themselves to be sovereign. Socialism cannot be imposed on people; they can be guided, they can be led. But ultimately they must be involved.

Theoretically, he justified his support for it on the grounds that it was a heritage of the African traditional societies. Elaborating on this point he said that in past, political affairs were conducted by discussion, compromises, consent and unanimity. Society conceded political power to elders, who in turn reached communal decisions by collectively discussing 'under the big tree' and talked and talked until they agreed. (Nyerere,1966:104).

Nyerere insisted on drawing from the traditional heritage as many principles for his socialist policy as possible. He therefore claimed:

> We in Africa, have no more need of being`converted'to socialism than we have of being 'taught' democracy. Both are rooted in our own past in the traditional society which produced us (Nyerere 1962:12).

3.3.4. Equality.

Central to Nyerere's philosophy of Ujamaa, and the key to understanding his social philosophy was the concept of human equality. The AD begins boldly: 'The policy of TANU is to build a socialist state,' and then quotes the 'principles of socialism' from the TANU constitution. The first seven of these cover individual human rights, including freedom of expression.

It was on equality that he based his key concepts,namely freedom, justice and brotherhood. None of the above three would survive without equality, he claimed. He postulated that the freedom of expression and voting was only a facet of human equality (Nyerere,1968:22). For justice to prevail, each individual's position was to

be determined by his worth "as a person" and not by the worth of his possessions, intellectual ability or by the colour of his skin (Nyerere,1968:303). Problems of justice were ultimately problems of equality. Nyerere maintained that for social justice to prevail, "There must be a belief that every individual man and woman, of whatever colour....religion or sex is an equal member of society with equal rights in the society and equal duties to it"(Ibid)

From this profound conviction in the innate equality and equal worth of all beings he developed his socio-political philosophy with a concrete proposition of equal treatment for all. Unlike the 18th century European feudal system or even the Indian caste system, traditional African Society was neither based on fixed hereditary castes nor was it a purely meritorious society based entirely on merit (Okoh, 1980:27). For Nyerere, it was certain basic properties that all human beings possessed, like basic needs, rationality, vulnerability to pain and joy that was a proof of equal human worth. Although human beings were unequal in their capabilities and personality traits, socialism accepts "mankind as it is, and demands such an organisation of society that man's inequalities are put to the service of his equality" (Nyerere 1967:79) because each individual, in his own way, and according to his own capabilities is useful and also contributes to the welfare and well-being of the community. This philosophical premise is distinct from say, Locke who maintains that the differences in strength, intelligence, virtue, ability etc. compensate each other so as to make all human beings naturally equal. For Locke therefore, since all beings are born equal those who fail to make it have only themselves to blame.

Besides Nyerere's concern with formal and metaphysical equality he tried to demonstrate the inequalities in existence of the colonised people. At the United Nations Special committee in New York Nyerere proclaimed:

> Every man has equal right to a decent life before any individual has a surplus above his needs; has equal right to participate in government, and had equal responsibility to work and contribute to the society to the limit of his ability and to receive all the rights and privileges that the Society confers on her citizens (Nyerere,1968:325).

Thus, Nyerere elaborated these rights under racial equality, political equality and economic equality. In a paper on his research on the race problem in East Africa he claimed that the causes of racial hatred were more political and economic than cultural and thus suggested a redistribution of political and economic power and demanded a restoration of the rights of blacks on the African continent. But a disturbing reality jolted Nyerere's admirers when in the midst of all egalitarian rhetoric he announced that the ruling party, TANU should accept people based on colour and only black Tanzanians could become members. With simplistic rationalization he justified his action:

> The decision.....was a political decision necessary because of the prevailing lack of self-confidence in the African community..... For these reasons TANU became a racial organisation; yet it was the one which from the very beginning campaigned for racial equality (Nyerere, 1966:3).

In the same vein he expressed his apprehension for any government policies put forward as multiracial or non-racial policies on the grounds that it was what the majority wanted that needed to be done.

In his efforts at restoring political equality it was decided to have only one party and only two presidential candidates to choose from. To institute economic equality a decision was taken to nationalize all activities that made people rich, to the extent that even private butchers and bakers were to be prohibited to practice their trades. An attitude Nyerere wanted rectified was the distinction that was being drawn between mental and manual work and the arrogance and feelings of superiority that went with it. Nyerere emphasized that every person who had an education must work and serve. This idea was elaborated in his ESR and implemented in the new socialist curriculum for schools. Like in China, Nyerere introduced the idea of `workwhile you study' in all education institutions. We shall return to this concept in the final section of this chapter.

3.3.5. Obligation to Work.

Nyerere claimed that in traditional African Society everybody was a worker. Throughout independent Africa this was a major theme where the basic notion was that all people had an obligation to work so as to enhance the material well-being of society. Parasitism and idleness were abhorred and regarded as social sins. In Tanzania leaders often engaged in manual work on community development projects in order to impress upon the people the dignity of work.

Attacks on parasitism often referred to elements in society that were unwilling to work harder although there was potential for increasing production. Nyerere might have been right in stressing the traditional responsibilities towards work, however the practice of that precept then and now is at the opposite pole from what he earnestly envisioned (Friedland,1964:16). Traditional African society was not geared to surplus production and the major pre-occupation was self-sufficiency rather than economic growth. The concept of work traditionally held by most Africans was not propitious for capital accumulation. Thus historically, the reality was that with subsistence economies, most African societies did not see work as an ethic or a social obligation but rather a necessity for survival (Friedland, 1964:18).

Furthermore the obligation to labour is not simply a socialist idea. It is labelled socialist partly because classical socialism held that exploitation of some people by others was indefensible and that all must work, and partly because work in communist societies was held as a moral and legal obligation. In addition since wealth in these countries could not be accumulated for hereditary purposes every person had to work to survive. Therefore it might be more accurate to consider social obligation to work as an emergent feature of African socialism.

When Nyerere said everyone in the traditional society was a worker, he did not mean 'employed' by an 'employer', for that according to him reflected a capitalist attitude of mind (Nyerere,1962:6). He claimed that the employer-employee relationship was fundamentally an exploitative one. As for the elders who appeared to be enjoying what others were earning without themselves earning it, they were only 'senior citizens' earning their 'pensions' and the wealth they possessed was only held in 'trust' for the work they had done in their younger days.

In spite of political speeches and some informal sanctions, the population in Tanzania, generally, did not develop the systematic work habits necessary for rapid economic growth (Friedland,1964:18).

3.3.6. Purpose of Development.

The purpose of all social, economic and political activity, according to Nyerere, had to be the quality of human being. While the creation of wealth was a good thing it should never cease to be of service to people rather than being served by them (Nyerere,1967:93).

A society that neglected the centrality of people lost its purpose and its justification:

> Production is not the purpose of society; humanity's progress must be measured by the extent to which man is freed from the domination of the need to produce. When the demands of "efficiency" and "production" override man's need for a full and good life then society is no longer serving man, it is using him (Nyerere,1966:16).

Both capitalism and communism as the two major international socio-economic systems, according to Nyerere, were deficient in that they either undermined equality or violated individual freedom. Only Ujamaa, based on the communal spirit of traditional Africa maintained all the three principles (equality, freedom and unity) intact. The objective of all social activity should be the well-being of man , his growth, his health and his dignity - all subsumed under man's happiness. Nyerere rejected scientific socialism and found the glorification of

conflict repugnant (Karioki,1979:Ch.2). For Nyerere, economic development was important only if it served to promote the development of individuals to the full and thus was a means to an end rather than an end in itself.

3.3.7. Self-Reliance.

Self-reliance was a recurrent theme within Tanzania's development strategy. It was at the core of the rural development policy, the national investment policy and the educational policy, to name a few. Nyerere had been made painfully aware of the limitations of the flag independence while Tanzania continued to rely on the metropolitan centre countries for even the most basic needs. A more difficult struggle than acquiring political independence was to free the country of its suffocating dependency and neocolonialism. This dependency situation applied not only to material goods but also extended into cultural and social hangovers like western pattern of educational, legal, social and economic systems.

In the party guidelines, it was pointed out that the country had inherited not simply the colonial governmental structure but also colonial working habits and leadership methods supported by an exploitative hierarchy. The Party Guidelines of 1973 therefore castigated those leaders who were 'arrogant', extravagant, contemptuous and oppressive. Thus Tanzania chose the policy of self-reliance in response to an appreciation of the deleterious effects of dependency, and out of the realization of the sheer need to cultivate self-reliance in the face of the non-availability of cash, capital goods and certain skilled manpower. It further relied on its educational policy to cultivate and enhance the ethic of self-reliance. There were, therefore, economic, political and social/psychological justifications for opting for a self-reliant approach to development.

Nyerere realized that in order to rely on the resources available at home (land, labour and a good development strategy) he needed education as an investment. Also, invariably capital goods would be required in order to keep pace with the global development. He had therefore to lay down the rules for the acceptance of foreign aid and other forms of external help. It was realized that the temptation to acquire huge loans, technology, capital goods and to invite global corporate investment from the 'centre' had conditions attached to it that resulted in the curbing of freedom and the development of uneven economic growth.

The new measures were not meant to be applied as a blueprint for socialist transformation but rather as a process of disengagement through a dialectical progression from one phase (the peripheral economy) to another (socialist society). "Independence cannot be real if a nation depends on gifts and loans from another for its development" (Nyerere, AD:9).

Nyerere denounced the status money had come to occupy in the society. Instead of being regarded as medium of exchange only, it had come to be regarded as wealth itself without which nothing could be done.

> We have chosen the wrong weapon for our struggle, because we chose money as a weapon. We are trying to overcome our economic weakness by using the weapons....which in fact we do not possess....A poor man does not use money as a weapon (AD:5).

The Declaration stated that land and labour, and not money, were Tanzania's assets and so they were the realistic foundation for a self-reliant economy. It was this fact that made it inevitable to encourage rural development where 90% of the population lived. As a result, priorities for government spending were reversed, at least on paper, to concentrate on rural over urban growth.

Between money and people it was the people and their hard work that was the foundation for development and money was one of the fruits of that hard work (Nyerere,AD:17). Self-reliance was the only dignified way of building a nation since one needed to work for any sustained progress. In quoting an example he said, "We had a sea full of fish and yet we imported fish and we had eleven million head of cattle and we imported milk" (Nyerere in The Nationalist, July 8th 1966).

The Declaration stated that there were four essential ingredients of development: people, land, good policies and good leadership. It then proceeded to stipulate the conditions of development, namely, hard work and intelligence. Only through self-reliance, could Tanzanians achieve socialism and maintain their freedom and independence. Its author further stated:

> If every individual is self-reliant [then] the whole ward, the district, the region, and then the whole nation is self-reliant, and this is our aim (Nyerere 1968:248).

Lastly, Nyerere believed the policy of self-reliance would restore in the African the lost self-esteem and dignity it had prior to colonization.

3.4. The Role of Education in the Development of Socialism and Self-Reliance.

3.4.1. Background to ESR.

The conflicts and concerns which led to the publication of Arusha Declaration and Education for Self-Reliance (1967) were inextricably linked.

During the colonial era African education was severely restricted, and catered only to provide clerical and administrative jobs in the modern sector. Missionaries on the other hand, heeding the call of David Livingstone to uplift the moral and material standards of Africans, introduced formal education in order bring religion and civilization to the Blacks (Oliver,1952). It was, however, generally accepted by observers of African education that the colonial patterns of schooling were too European, too academic and too unresponsive to the needs of the countries they were supposed to serve.

However, other researchers on the subject brought to attention the fact that early missionaries and colonial governments had frequently referred to the necessity of adapting education to the requisites of the primarily agrarian societies (Weeks, 1969:49). Efforts were made to provide for "special" schools - vocational, agricultural and technical in order to make education more relevant and functional. These efforts however, failed because they were viewed by the Africans as deliberate efforts at hindering their modernisation process. For African parents and children, formal education seemed to be the only hope of avoiding a career in unreformed peasant agricultural activities, and being admitted into white collar urban jobs (Sheffield,1969:9).

With the coming of independence rural education was again pushed into the background as a result of the emphasis put on meeting the high-level manpower needs by the Ashby commission of the 1960's and human capital theorists of the time. This had led to a remarkable expansion of post-secondary institutions in Africa. By mid 1960's, however, it was realized that formal education was not a panacea to the problems of the third world. This issue relating education, employment and rural development was discussed at a number of international conferences and it was finally recognised that the existing Western-modelled formal schooling alone would not be able to effect a major change in the larger society. At the same time a re-emphasis was put on two important reforms: one, developing non-academic institutions to provide the primary school leavers with basic skills towards self-employment and developing adult education, and two, reform the academic curriculum of the existing schools so as to meet rural needs. It was in the light of these historical developments that Nyerere issued a crucial policy statement in March 1967 known as Education for Self-Reliance Policy.

By January 1967 the troubled President, burdened by the existing contradictions and dilemmas of development had conducted an extended tour of the mainland and the Party's Executive Committee met in Arusha to discuss the issues and develop a policy for the future. TANU'S new credo on social and economic development, based on the socialistic principles of equality and self-reliance, was finally worked out and published in February 1967, thereafter referred to as the Arusha Declaration. In the following month the President issued another policy paper on education, Education For Self-Reliance (1967) which expounded the new

philosophy as it was to be applied to education in Tanzania.

Among other things the AD contained a sustained attack on self-seeking behaviour among the elite and their tendency to see development in terms of foreign investment and aid. ESR put the blame on the education system for producing the individualism, dependent attitudes and capitalist tendencies amongst the students (Cooksey and Ishumi,1986). Accordingly Nyerere suggested a reorientation of the educational system in order to turn schools into vehicles of transformation of society towards a self-reliant, socialistic Tanzania.

3.4.2. Conceptual Justification of ESR Policy.

ESR became the most important document guiding educational development in Tanzania. Its purpose was to enumerate, first, the inadequacies of the system, then to set down principles of education which serve to further the socialist goals of Tanzania, and third, suggest some strategies for changes that would be required to achieve these goals.

In the ESR document Nyerere identified four basic ills of the system: Firstly, education was elitist in concept, designed to meet the needs and interests of a very small minority of those who proceeded to secondary education. In 1966, 85% of the primary school leavers had to be phased out of the system due to lack of available places in the secondary schools. Secondly, it divorced its participants physically and intellectually from the society it was supposed to serve. Thirdly, since the education given was purely academic, the students came out with the belief that only formal, academic learning was to be esteemed. And finally, it drained the country's financial and human resources by taking the poor nation's young and healthiest men and women out of productive work, while they contributed nothing during the time they were getting their education. Nyerere emphasized this point forcefully when he said:

> Not only do they fail to contribute to that increase in output which is so urgent for our nation, they themselves consume the output of the older and often weaker people..what is more, they take it for granted that this should be so (Nyerere, 1967:5).

Moreover the system encouraged exploitative and authoritarian relationships between teachers and students and it inculcated the spirit of competition rather than co-operation. The paper also lashed out against parasitism among the educated minority who had detached themselves from the communal and collective values as a result of the exposure to capitalist values in schools.

Pre-ESR education was consumption and privilege-oriented instead of being production and service-oriented, inculcating values and orientations which were antithetical to those of a socialist society. Subsequently an entirely new educational philosophy was to reflect the needs, aspirations and priorities of a society that was on a revolutionary path towards socialism and self-reliance. ESR, therefore, gave education a central role in the socialist construction.

The changes suggested in the document were designed to :

1. Reduce elitism and the tendency for schooling to accentuate social and economic inequalities that tended towards class formation.
2. Foster social goals of living together by integrating the school into the village community and visa versa.
3. Develop independent, self-reliant but participatory citizenry committed to socialist precepts of equality, human dignity and value of work.
4. Inculcate a sense of commitment and service to the community.
5. Provide a complete education within the primary and secondary schools.
6. Provide relevant education that was consistent with the realities of rural life.
7. Transmit from one generation to the next the accumulated wisdom and knowledge of the society they lived in.
8. Inculcate scientific and technological skills in line with the constantly changing society.

ESR therefore came with the (1) social aim of creating positive attitudes towards collective and co-operative endeavour; (2) economic aim of preparing young people for rural life and development through self-reliant methods; (3) political aim of creating committed, politically conscious and active participants of nation-building; and (4) psychological aim of developing confident, enquiring, creative and critical future citizens.

Specifically, strategies suggested in ESR, in the form of educational reforms to help rectify the contradictions, were in three areas: content of the curriculum, organisation of schools, and entry age into primary schools.

Curriculum:

The curriculum was to be changed towards a more rural bias. Primary education was to prepare the youth for rural life.

> We should determine the type of things taught in our primary schools by ... the skills he(the student) ought to acquire and the values he ought to cherish if he or she is to live happily and well in a socialist and predominantly rural society (Nyerere,1968:282).

Secondary education, too, was to prepare pupils for life either in rural areas or urban centres. There was to be also a total integration of school activities both academic and practical with productive work in the surrounding community. Thus self-reliance activities became part of the curriculum of all schools. Curriculum changes were suggested in all three main areas: form, content and scope. The methodology of teaching was to make conceptual use of problem solving, self-reliance, co-operative endeavour, learning by doing, participatory decision-making and serving others. The content was to be made more relevant and practical. Schools were to be given specializations in vocational subjects where farmers or other community "experts" would help in teaching students various job-oriented skills. Examinations were criticised for evaluating only the cognitive aspects of the pupils' total range of activities and it was suggested that students' attitudes towards the community and their involvement in nation-building activities be also assessed.

Book-knowledge had to be socially progressive and relevant. Memorizing alienating information about European affairs had to be replaced by material that had a bearing on the pupils' existence, their communities and their immediate environments. As a complement to the AD, education had to be consistent with Tanzania's social purpose at every level. The general effort was towards 'Tanzanianization' of education, which by extension meant its deanglicanization. Political education was to feature prominently in the school syllabus.

Organization of schools:

1. In this connection the ESR policy suggested three changes: All educational institutions were to be transformed into productive communities practising cooperation.

   > Schools must become communities. The teachers, the workers, and pupils together must be the members of a social unit (Nyerere,1968:282).

   Schools were to become part of the rural communities where learning and working blended perfectly. Due respect was to be accorded to manual work and practical skills and the curriculum would help every child become a productive member of the society.

2. Schools would have to become economically self-reliant in as far as was possible: The (school) community must realize... that their life and well-being is dependent upon the production of wealth. This means that all schools...must contribute to their upkeep (Nyerere,1968:283).

   The Policy however cautioned against establishing 'vocational' primary and secondary schools or just attaching an isolated self-reliance activity in every

school. Nyerere stated:

> This is not a suggestion that a school farm or workshop should be attached to every school....(but) every school should also be a farm....the school community should consist of people who are both teachers and farmers, and pupils and farmers (Nyerere,1968:284).

3 Participatory decision-making was to involve pupils, teachers and all concerned in the particular economic activities undertaken.Primary schools were to be intimately linked to the local community so that the pupils could remain an integral part of the family (or community) economic unit, especially if the pupils were very young and needed adult supervision. The school terms were to be changed to accommodate for the farming seasons. The examination system needed revision so that a more holistic evaluation system could be devised to assess the development and progress of the child.

Entry Age:

If primary education was to become terminal for the majority of the pupils then it was necessary that by the time they finished their studies they were matured enough to start a life of their own in the rural areas. In order to make that possible, the policy stipulated that the school entry age be raised from five or six to seven or eight. Psychological impact on the child's mental growth of delaying educational exposure till the age of eight was never given any consideration.

In order to reduce the incongruency between the new aspirations in the policy papers and existing educational system it was imperative that the latter undergo significant changes. However, a pertinent question that needed addressing to at the time, was whether there were any inconsistencies between the aspirations espoused in the two policy papers on the one hand and the aspirations and hopes of the parents and students on the other. This question is posed here but will be analyzed in the last two chapters. Furthermore in order to achieve the goals set in the ESR it was necessary that not only education but also other aspects of the societal life and structure - the economic, political and social institutions - undergo a transformation as was stipulated by Nyerere in the policy paper:

> This is not only a matter of school organisation and curriculum. Social values are formed by..the total environment in which a child develops (Nyerere,1968:290).

Another question that will have to be addressed in the later chapters is the level of involvement of the masses in the changes of the curriculum content and whether the policy allowed for it to happen. It is also essential at this point to keep

in mind the fact that although the tone for the educational reform was set and several policy recommendations offered, the implementation of the main restructuring was left to the Ministry Officials (Resnick, 1969:152).

In summary then, the ESR was aimed at creating socialist attitudes among students so that they would not become acquisitive and arrogant. Rather, they would perceive education as an investment by the society and a responsibility to serve their communities, who in the first place, made it possible for them to get educated. The commitment was to be aroused through political education and action. Nyerere had made it clear that the only true justification for secondary education was that it was needed by the few for service to the many. Thus the aims in AD were to be in part achieved by implementation of ESR policy. The ideology, as it pertained to education can be summarised thus: "Let our students be educated to be members and servants of the kind of just and egalitarian future to which this country aspires" (Cameron and Dodd,1970:240).

3.4.3. Consistency Between AD and ESR

ESR cannot be seen in isolation from the other major policy documents, namely Arusha Declaration and a third, Socialism and Rural Development (SRD); and together they attempted to spell out a coherent program for the development of a society based on the principles of Ujamaa and Self-Reliance.

Nyerere's lofty vision of achieving socialist goals depended on the 'factory' of schools to create these new socialists. All the major precepts within the new ideology were to be translated in the school system - equality, equality of opportunity, democracy, control at the grass root level, obligation to work, cooperation, communal living, self-reliance and participation. Socialist policies demanded the creation of a society where everyone contributed to the well-being of all; a society with no difference between the leaders and the led, between the educated and the uneducated, between academic life and the world of work and between mental workers and manual workers. This gap had to be filled in the school setting first, before it could be achieved at the societal level.

ESR was much more than a prescription for a curricular reform of adding vocational and agricultural courses to the curriculum - it called for a merging of the schools with the community such that the entire community became an educational arena and schools became socialist microcosms of the larger society (Sheffield,1969:10) where all the principles of Ujamaa were put into practice for a total change in attitudes and action. Since primary schooling became universal every child was expected to go through the compulsory primary education and so it was hoped that with active political socialization of every child, the new society would emerge in due course. In an eloquent denunciation of the colonial and elitist

educational tradition Nyerere clearly explained the role education was to play in a socialist society:

> And the truth is that our United Republic has at present a poor economy therefore this is what our educational system has to encourage. It has to foster the social goals of living together and working together, for the common good. It has to prepare our young people to play a dynamic and constructive role in the development of a society in which all members share fairly in the good or bad fortune of the group, and in which progress is measured in terms of human well-being, not prestige. Our education must therefore inculcate a sense of commitment to the total community, and help the pupils to accept the values appropriate to our kind of future, not those appropriate to our colonial past" (Nyerere,ESR:1967:6.7).

ESR was a revolutionary document in comparison with earlier educational policies for it was placed squarely within the context of a new envisioned socialist society and argued that education had to become an instrument for determining the new values, attitudes and skills which were needed to create not only a new society but a new Tanzanian person. Nyerere had an unshakable faith in the power of education to help create a classless society and individuals within it who were prepared to work for the common good (Stabler,1979:45). He was opposing a tradition dating from the colonial period in which parents and pupils looked to schools as a different kind of instrument- an escape from the rural life and a pathway to individual opportunity. Nyerere's philosophy was based on noble and moral grounds and whilst it was difficult to argue against its logic, the feasibility of successfully implementing it under the contemporary Tanzanian situation was doubted by many. The real questions that needed looking into were whether Tanzanian parents were ready to accept a radically different kind of schooling that was designed to prepare young people for life in the villages and not for white-collar employment in the cities (especially when some of the students were the children of the policy-makers, and implementers). Secondly, did Tanzania possess the material and manpower resources to implement the policy on a national level, given the attitudinal limitations of the post-colonial society. And lastly, the question concerning the fact that Nyerere had only proposed the discrepancies of the pre-Arusha Tanzanian society and made broad policy recommendations for correcting them; the real job of translating the ideology and implementing it was left to ministry officials. The question, then, was how well equipped and available were these officials in performing their part to fulfil the tasks at hand, considering the various constraints facing them at the time. It is to this that we turn our attention in the following chapters.

In this chapter we have examined the policy of Tanzanian socialism as it stood in comparison with Marxist and some other ideological paradigms. Further,

we elaborated on each of the principal tenets of the new Tanzanian philosophy of development. We then looked at the role education was to play in this vision of creating the new Tanzanian person. The ESR document was scrutinized and commented upon. In the next chapter we attempt to look at the strategy formulation that followed the pronouncement of the policy.

END NOTES

1. In October 1966, almost 400 University students demonstrated against the government's decision to make National Service compulsory for them. As a result, Nyerere decided to suspend them for two years. They were, however, called back after one year.

CHAPTER 4

STRATEGIES AND POLICIES FOR TRANSFORMATION IN THE SCHOOLS.

4.1 Prolegomena.

The objective of this chapter is to establish the link both, legislative and other, between ideology and implementation. In other words it will examine the strategy employed by the Party and government to translate the ideological goals, postulated in the various policy documents, into a reality. We shall use ESR and AD as our primary documents and a frame of reference to look into: 1) the methodology employed to formulate the strategy and 2) the key features of the strategy since our chief concern is to examine the policy as it was applied to schools we shall only briefly dwell on strategy formation in other areas.

There are a number of pre-requisites to be met and certain tendencies to be cautioned against before a major policy-making and strategy formulation exercise for any reform is embarked upon, and to prevent it from becoming sterile, mechanical and counter-productive. First, it is essential to conduct an objective assessment of the societal needs through a critical analysis of the special social formation and historical setting of that society. Second, it has to be kept in mind that identification of the core issues in the educational or any other system does not entail identification of the particular means by which they would be tackled. Neither does it imply that the state apparatus is attuned to overcoming the problems. Third, neither the policy-makers nor the planners happen to possess perfect knowledge of the societal needs or how to meet them through the educational institutions or through any other means at their disposal. Fourth, even where particular programs are designed to meet particular political or societal demands there is no guarantee that it will be possible to implement them. This can be especially true when the bureaucracy responsible for implementing the program happens to be "wasteful at best and ineffective at worst" (Offe,1975). Fifth, the government agenda for carrying out a policy is not always limited to the overt goals declared in the plans. There is a real possibility that the bureaucracy, for example, in order to retain its control (derived from legitimacy, political and coercive powers) may feel impelled to frustrate the national efforts. One of the ways this may occur is through obstructing the channels for participation by the masses (Offe,1975). Sixth, there is a strong tendency to rule out opposition or resistance when there has been instituted a major ideological exercise of the kind Tanzania was involved in (Dale,1982). In a top down approach, involvement and motivation are often hard to create when there is limited comprehension of what is being asked of the people and why. Lastly, justification of the ends by the means may not be provided by those instituting reforms. Accountability and evaluation may tend to play a less significant role than the initiation and perpetuation of the plans.

Educational reformers may tend to identify themselves as rational planners committed to making the system not only functional but also making it responsive and projective to the ever changing socio-economic conditions (Mukyanusi,1985). Corroborating on this point Merit and Coombs (1977:258) said that the adoption of educational reforms reflected the leaders' projections of the national interest as being identical with their own (Weiler,1981) made a similar observation:

> The very adoption of reform policies tends to identify an existing regime as forward looking, flexible and responsive to changes of modern society (Weiler, 1981:49)

The question of what it is that prompts reforms often times revolves around the issue of legitimacy of those in power. Legitimacy, according to Habermas, is "a political order's worthiness to be recognised" (1975:72). In our context, however legitimacy refers to: 1) the qualitative aspects of reforms and the extent to which they serve the needs of the majority 2) the evaluation methodologies applied in the selection of particular reforms as the best alternatives and 3) the extent to which a participatory approach is adopted during the process of initiating such reforms.

In many developing countries research as an important prerequisite component in the educational policy reform package has been given minimum consideration. In the Tanzanian context most of the major reform policies - ESR (1967), UPE (1974), Musoma Resolution (MR) (1974) and indeed Decentralization were all introduced without being preceded by scientific research or pilot studies (Mukyanuzi,1985:133). Thus the seeming ineffectiveness of the reforms could be attributed to the limited legitimacy of those in power Systematic strategies for implementation must be assessed and judged on the basis of manifested outcomes rather than on intentions. Nyerere had always believed that ideas and good intentions played a major role in socio-political action and that for any socio-economic development, four basic requirements for success were: land, people, good policies and good leaders. By the very act of the conceptualization and clarification of an explicit ideology for the nation, Nyerere hoped to motivate the people into mass mobilization and action for a collectivist and socialist transformation. He was convinced that ideology itself was an active agent for social change (Verba,1965:546), however, argued that explicit political ideologies were created when one wanted to create a political system that was not sufficiently supported by the implicit primitive beliefs of the population. If beliefs were in place there would be no need for ideology.Sjoberg described ideology as "a set of values and ideas that justify and rationalize the programs a system carries forward" (Sjoberg,1963). Nellis carried this point further in saying that ideas were not only structured by material social interests, but they in turn took on significance and often structured later experience (Nellis,1972:28). Thus ideology can be looked at as a systematic set of ideas with action consequences (Hall,1975). Schurman believed a total ideology served to motivate individuals towards commitment and

gave them a set of rational ideas to act on (1968:39). It had the potential for mobilizing the people while defining the personal role of the individuals in the system (Apter,1964:18-22). Thus, according to the above authors, besides creating an increased level of public consciousness it served as a guide to individuals and organisations in planning and implementing decisions or policies.

Nyerere made it clear in his report to TANU, on the progress during the ten years of independence, when he said that prior to AD the nation was "drifting without any sense of direction," and thus a clear statement on the path Tanzania was going to follow was the first step in the right direction. Having set clear ideological goals for Tanzania's development and having clearly defined the purpose of that development the next logical step seemed to be that of assessing the resources available and accordingly devising strategies for putting the policies into action. Whilst we can talk about ideals and ideology in discussing the purpose of development, concerns with resources has to be absolutely realistic and objective.

In clarifying the purpose of development Nyerere had clearly stated that the purpose of all social, economic and political activity had to be the human being. Between money and people it was the people and their hard work that was the foundation of development and money was only the fruit of that labour (AD:17). Just as people were the purpose of development, so people and their hard work were the key resource for that development. And these hard working people could affect development if they made use of the available land. Agriculture therefore was the key to development. Good policies emerging out of a good ideology were seen in themselves as resources for development. The stage was now set for formulating an explicit strategy for a major transformation.

4.2 Goals of ESR Policy Revisited.

It was the conviction of the founders of the ideology in Tanzania that education would ultimately provide the key to the development of socialism. It was recognised that colonial education had brought about a revolutionary change in attitudes, style of life and mode of production of a negative nature amongst Tanzanians. Now ESR created the need for another radical change to bring the educational system in line with the socialist goals of the nation.If it was accepted that schools could play a major role in creating subservient attitudes and capitalist behaviour patterns under an oppressive and authoritarian system, then under different conditions they could also play a liberating role of creating self-reliant, and socialist attitudes (Hall,1975).

ESR called for a psychological and moral change in values and attitudes from those that were inherited from colonialism. The values accepted had to be appropriate to Tanzania's socialist future. With nearly 20% of the government budget being spent on education (ESR:44) Nyerere wanted to make sure it did not

give rise to a new class of exploiters who saw their education more in terms of money, power and privilege. He had declared that Tanzanian education must:

1) promote the social goals of living and working together for the common good;
2) inculcate a sense of commitment and service to the entire community;
3) counteract the temptation to intellectual arrogance in a society of equal individuals;
4) integrate school and community by making schools an integral part of the community that practised the concept of self-reliance;
5) change values and attitudes inherited from colonialism and replace them with those based on the precepts of equality, human dignity and value of work;
6) make each stage of education complete in itself and prepare its recipients for life in rural areas (ESR:5).

ESR was a remarkable document in its primary emphasis on change in mental and social attitudes rather than on knowledge and skills. Schools in Tanzania were now required to instil in the youth "an enquiring mind, the ability to learn from what others do, and reject or adapt it to its own needs" (ESR:5). Schools were also expected to provide confidence in the youth and in their own position as free and equal members of a society that valued others and was valued by them for what its individuals did and not for what they obtained. Dignity was not pomposity and socialism did not interfere with the freedom of others. With this very brief re-visit we can now examine the strategies developed.

4.3. Strategies and Policies.

It is one thing to establish the nature and pervasiveness of the reform effort linked to socialist transformation in Tanzania and quite another to come to an understanding and appreciation of the intricate key steps leading to its popularisation, adoption and eventual outcome.

In order to appreciate the process of policy formulation in the Tanzanian context it is important to review some major theoretical models of policy formation to discern how quality policies are made and also how Tanzania could have overcome some of the shortcomings analyzed in the ensuring chapters.

Policy-making is essentially a political process. Dye (1978) differentiated policy from public policy by stating that a policy was a mere statement of intent. It only became a public policy after it had been universally adopted, implemented and enforced. According to Dror (1968) a quality policy had to undergo three essential stages in its design and implementation these were identified as meta-policy making, policy making and post-policy making stages. These stages were further divided into 18 phases. The essence of which was as follows: In the first

stage the major operations needed to design and manage the policy-making system as a whole and to establish the overall principles and rules of policy-making were delineated. The second stage involved the situational analysis and determination of needs. It was in this stage that the operational goals (with some priority order) were established, and alternative ways and means of implementing them examined. The cost-benefit analysis was also conducted at this stage, when choice was made between the best alternative, using acceptable criteria of excellence and allocation of resources. The third post-policy-making stage involved motivating the execution of the policy, evaluating the policy after it had been executed and establishing feed-back channels of communication.

A policy was normally an intervention in the social and political structure of the society. It was also a guide to institutional behaviour and action. In some ways the purpose of this chapter is to describe and analyze the dynamics of the policy intervention and an effort at understanding the behaviour of individuals and groups in the policy making and implementation process in Tanzania.

We shall now very briefly discuss the following policy science models highlighting the general laws they contain.

1) The Institutional Model: The government institutions play the key role here by authoritatively determining, implementing and enforcing public policy. This is made possible because government, by lending legitimacy to policies, makes them legal obligations whose application extends to all people in the society since the legitimate coercive authority is its monopoly. Because of this distinctive features of government policy-making process, Dye (1978) claims that individuals and groups in society tend to work for enactment of their preferences into public policy. Since many government institutions are charged with the implementation of policies they did not make, these institutional structures can hinder or facilitate policy outcomes depending on their commitment.

2) Group Model: Policy-making process here is seen as a struggle between interest groups which constitutes the central facet of political life. Accordingly public policy in this model is the result of equilibrium reached by the political system's management of group conflict by 1) establishing the rules of the game, 2) arranging compromises and balancing interests, 3) enacting these in the form of public policy and 4) enforcing them (Dye, 1978:21). The group model was largely inapplicable in the Tanzanian context as there was only one ruling party with no other major interest groups to confront it. From that point of view it is the institutional model that has relevance since the Party's central committee (NEC) formulates the policy, and the government, as the implementation arm of the Party, controls legitimate power. The model is also particularly relevant in that the

government bureaucrats who were asked to implement policies which they did not make, had at times the tendency to use their position to pursue their private agendas at the expense of the masses.

3) The Elite-Mass Model: This model is explained in terms of six 'general laws' (Dye 1978), whose essence is that society is divided into the few who have the power and the many who do not, and it is the values and preferences of this government elite that give shape to public policy. The masses do not decide public policy. The elites share consensus of the basic values and the preservation of the system. Public policy does not reflect demands of the masses but rather the prevailing values of the elite. Public officials and administrators merely carry out the policies decided upon by the elite.

All the above models come under the general heading of policy-science models while the policy-analysis models include 1) the pure rationality model 2) The satisfising model 3) The incremental model 4) The mixed scanning model and 5) The optimal model.

Policy analysis models are prescriptive or normative and are closely aligned to the idea of rationality, efficiency, knowledge inputs and maximization of outputs. A central role is give to experts in policy-making and the techniques employed are taken from management science and general research. These models reveal a concern for improving the policy-making process and performance by providing rational criteria for evaluation. In both the policy science and policy analysis models the policy-making process ideally includes five stages: identification of needs, policy development, policy choice, policy implementation and policy review.

Without elaborating on each of the policy-analysis models we shall briefly look at The Pure Rationality Model and The Optimal model for their relevance in juxtaposing against the Tanzanian approach.

4) The Pure Rationality Model: Dror alleges that most decision-making and policy making is based on the above model since it goes further than most other models in systematically breaking down decision-making into phases and into analyzing its own components (Dror,1968:132). Moreover it enhances the understanding of most other models, including the optical model and its assumptions are consistent with rationalism, positivism and optimism. This model includes six phases:

1. Establishing a complete set of operational goals.
2. Establishing a complete inventory of other values and\or resources with relative weights.
3. Preparing a complete set of alternative policies open for selection.

4. Having a valid set of predictions of costs and benefits of each of the alternatives including the extent to which each will achieve goals, consume resources and realize or impair other values.
5. Calculating the net expectation for each alternative.
6. Comparing the net expectations and identifying the alternative with the highest net expectation.

Dror however admits that with a few exceptions, pure rationality policy-making is in fact impossible although a start had been made in that direction during the time of his writing in 1968.

Tanzanian's policy-making and strategy formation, did not adhere to any of the above models. With a motto, "we must run while others walk" no time was spent on this kind of policy formulation analysis. In any case policy-making in Tanzania was largely the job of politicians whose criteria for decision-making were more moral and political rather than scientific and economic. The Pure Rationality Model requires the presence of the resources and data to identify policy needs, develop policy alternatives, and choose the most appropriate and efficient policy in a purely rational process, where the resources and data enable policy review to occur. All the above factors were largely absent from the Tanzanian policy-making and planning process (Omari and Mosha,1987:67).

5) The Optimal Model: This is among the most comprehensive of the policy analysis models. It includes the three major stages of meta-policy making, policy-making and post-policy making.

The optimal model, according to Dror (1968:130) was developed to satisfy three main conditions: to match reality well enough to enable action-oriented analysis and evaluation of policy making; to be systematic and comprehensive enough to be used for significant and penetrating analysis; and to be normative in establishing processes and structures whereby a maximum net output of whatever goals and values are desired can be achieved. Rational components in the model are supported by extra-rational processes as 'creativity', 'intuition' and 'judgement' in the inventive phases of policy development. The optimal model has all the five phases of policy making process: identification of needs, policy development, policy choice, implementation and policy review.

The pure rationality model and the optimal model provide us with a good contrast to the Tanzanian style of policy-making as we shall examine in the rest of this chapter. Unfortunately, policies are normally made at the political level while the planning and implementation takes place at the technocrat and mass level, and unless there is an excellent two way communication and feed-back system in place, obstacles are likely to

jeopardise the reform process. Commenting on planning in Tanzania, Peter Meyns said, "Needless to say, close coordination is called for between TANU socialist leaders and governmental technical experts throughout the process of socio-economic development and socialist construction" (Meyns,1973:66).

As mentioned earlier, Dunn (1981) emphasized the need for good policies to be evaluated against the criteria of effectiveness, efficiency, adequacy, responsiveness and appropriateness. Adding to this Ishumi (1988) argued that for a policy to be successfully implemented it had to go through the stages of awareness and motivation; and in order to gauge its merits and demerits, evaluation had to take place, and finally a trial by way of a small-scale implementation project needed to be instituted to ascertain the feasibility, workability and possibility of adoption, before it was applied on the national level.

The following sections contain a detailed explication of the form and content of the strategies developed to implement ESR in schools. Since the educational policy was part of the broader policy initiatives expounded in the AD we shall first briefly look at the strategies employed to implement the AD.

4.3.1. Strategies for Implementing the Policy Outside Schools.

Nyerere's strategy for the transition to socialism can be examined under four headings:

1. Promotion of Greater Equality.
2. Maintenance of Tanzanian Self-Reliance.
3. Creation of Socialist Environment and Attitudes.
4. Enhancement of Democratic Participation.

1. **Promotion of Greater Equality:** Nyerere can squarely be put in the populist tradition in his primary concern for equality and equality of distribution. Socialism for Nyerere was equality and fairness in the distribution of society's wealth. To that end Nyerere's strategy for action included the following:

> First, we have been making our taxation more progressive. Secondly, we have to put a stop to any future large-scale exploitation of our workers and peasants through the private ownership of the means of production and exchange. Thirdly, we have put a stop to wage and salary increases at the top level and have even succeeded in cutting their incomes (Nyerere 1976).

In the field of education universal primary education was given a top priority in order to provide equality of access to basic education. That access, in fact, was made compulsory. Policies were aimed simultaneously at reducing the privileges of the elite and improving the condition of the masses (Court,1984:269). Measures aimed at the former included elimination of luxury imports and application of a leadership code that severely curtailed supplementary incomes of public servants. Measures aimed at raising the living standards included channelling investments into rural development (to reduce disparities between urban and rural areas), particularly the policy of Villagisation1 and decentralization of finance and control. However, formidable obstacles impeded the successful reconciliation between some of the glaring inequalities in society.

2. **Maintenance of Tanzanian Self-Reliance:** The strategy proposed in AD to make Tanzania self-reliant was to take concrete steps towards breaking the dependence of its development on foreign assistance and control, and to alter radically the belief that modernisation brought about through massive importation of technology and know-how was the only way to the future sustained economic prosperity of Tanzania. It was, however, not a call to xenophobia or a rejection of foreign aid. It was an assertion that Tanzanians had to look primarily to their own efforts if their poverty was to be reduced.

In a speech cited in the Second Five Year Plan Nyerere stated the economic goals of Ujamaa's program for self-reliance:

> Basically, if all Tanzanians i) enjoy a healthy diet ii)are adequately clothed iii) enjoy acceptable housing conditions and iv) have access to basic education and health facilities, Tanzania will have achieved more economic success than many supposed-to-be wealthy societies (Nyerere,1969).

Education for Self-Reliance came as part of the general package of reforms which followed the Arusha Declaration. Thus Nyerere wanted the concept of self-reliance and work-by-all ethic practised at all levels of societal activities and at all ages. Self-Reliance also made necessary increased internal capital accumulation. To make that available the state had to secure a greater direct control over the economy. This was done by nationalizing the country's major means of production as a strategic outcome of the AD. Following that the rest was achieved through a straight forward act of legislation. However, it was soon realised that nationalizing property and creating institutions did not create socialists. A drastic attitudinal change seemed a first prerequisite. It is to this creation of environment and attitudes that we turn to now.

3. **Creation of Socialist Attitudes and Environment:** Securing a large part of the economic surplus by the state was just one aspect of the more complex inter-relationship between nationalization, socio-economic development and the creation of committed socialist attitudes. Many of the measures already identified had as part of their rationale the creation of a socialist environment in which attitudes could be moulded over time and a greater sense of communal responsibility built. This was true of all aspects of the reform process: creation of ujamaa villages, the efforts at limiting income inequalities, efforts at transforming the environment in schools and work places, the measures to increase citizen participation, the introduction of leadership code, the frequent use of mass rallies and processions, political gatherings, radio broadcasts etc. The hidden curriculum or agenda behind all these changes was the inculcation of the right socialist attitudes and the creation of a socialist environment.

   However, changing attitudes from acquisitiveness to altruism, from individualism to egalitarianism, from self-interest to communal interest and from dependency to self-reliance and hard work- and all this without either coercion or any strong incentives, in the face of extreme poverty, seemed like a great sacrifice for a society caught up in the midst of post-independence expectations. But Nyerere thought this was possible based on a romantic notion of the traditional past and the innate generosity of the contemporary Tanzanian.

4. **Enhancement of Democratic Participation:** People's participation was judged necessary in order to check abuses of power and bring about greater commitment and responsibility. People would not be coerced into socialism which would only come as the people embraced socialist values. Nyerere said:

> If the people did make a mistake, it is their right to do so.... it is arrogance for anyone to think that they can choose on behalf of the people better than the people can choose for themselves (Nyerere 1968:91).

At times it was difficult to differentiate between the policy pronouncement and the strategy of implementation, which in many cases was simply missing. And often the policy pronouncement and the implementation came simultaneously leaving no room for a carefully worked out strategy to be formulated. The following is an example of a Presidential circular that served both as a policy statement and an immediate directive for people to implement.

On March 20th Nyerere issued his Presidential Circular No.1 of 1969, in which he clearly stated that:

> No Department of TANU and no Ministry of Government is exempt from the requirement to participate and to contribute to the success of the policy.

Ironically, the same circular stipulated, in theory, the procedure that was to be followed to bring about the implementation of Nyerere's ideals. The Circular envisioned three phases in the implementation strategy. It would begin with the education and training of TANU and government leaders in the ideology, purpose and methods. Phase two would constitute taking the ideas to the people, to educate and help them see the relevance of this policy to their own desires and their own needs. Finally in stage three, the Regional and Area Commissioners and others, would give practical assistance as required. The emphasis throughout, at least at the rhetoric level, was on education and persuasion, organisation and advice. This was the ideal of the founders of the policy. However in reality serious divergences from this persuasive and preacher-strategy for action were observed (Mohiddin, 1981:139).

Democracy was an important pillar of the AD. Development had to be of the people, by the people themselves. It was in this sense that democracy, defined by Nyerere as participation in decision-making, occupied an important place in his philosophy. The Presidential Circular No.1 of 1970 laid down the strategy for achieving this goal. It spoke of establishing workers councils, board of directors etc. to involve the worker in the processes of production and that of decision-making. Since the worker was the ultimate purpose of production he/she would not be divorced from the decision-making process of that production, but rather be exposed to the problems of production and marketing.

The 1972 Act of Decentralization of Administration and of Decision-making and the 1975 Villages and Ujamaa Villages Act were all important measures to involve more people in the decision-making process. Schools were also asked to involve the students and support staff in their decision-making committees. However, there has been a pronounced tendency within the leadership and the bureaucracy towards authoritarian rule, and the socialist commitment did provide, from time to time, the rhetoric to rationalize a retreat to authoritarian means (Pratt,1979:219). The net result, as we shall examine in the next chapter, was that there was a clear discrepancy between Nyerere's rhetoric and the reality practised by the bureaucratic arm of the government bodies.

One of the most analytical and profound commentators on Tanzania's experiment, Professor Joel Samoff concludes:

> Organising the transition to socialism is an extraordinarily complex and difficult process characterised more by struggle than achievement (Samoff, 1990:244).

4.3.2. Strategies for Implementing the Policy in Schools.

For educational policies to become public policies, they had to be conceptually clear and the objectives explicitly delineated. Furthermore, systematic strategies for implementation had to be laid out and judged on the basis of their feasibility and manifested outcomes, rather than just good intentions (Mosha, 1990:59).

Some of the broad objectives proposed in the ESR, that required carefully worked out strategies and detailed realistic planning were:

1. Education had to be integrated with community life.
2. It had to become relevant and prepare its recipients for realities of rural life.
3. It was required to encourage the growth of socialist values.
4. It had to contribute significantly to the learning process through both, content and structure.
5. Education would now be required to contribute financially towards the schools upkeep by becoming partially self-reliant.
6. Henceforth it was to be looked at as an investment by the state for ultimate service to society rather than as a consumption item for individuals wanting to escape rural life.
7. Education had to be such that the elitist bias in it had to be removed, thereby replacing all tendencies towards developing arrogance in those who got this privilege.

Thus ESR had specific social, economic, political, psychological, moral and technical goals to fulfil. A fundamental objective of the reform was to instil in students new attitudes and values towards the functions of education, the importance of social service in relation to personal benefit, developing a sense of duty to the community and the value of self-reliance. It is clear from above that there was an assumption in Tanzania that the achievement of the objectives of Arusha Declaration depended, in significant measure, upon the transformation of the educational system.

In the process of dissociating itself from the colonial past and international capitalism, the stage was set for an educational strategy to carry the revolution that emphasized the urgency of educating the many rather than giving a lot of education to the few. In 1969 the government passed the Education Act No. 50 which sought to provide education that would conform to the political, social and

cultural ideals of the newly independent country. A number of changes in the content, methodology of teaching, organisation of schools and school entry age were proposed. The term 'education' was no longer confined to purely academic training but was to include cultural, physical, ideological and professional development as well. All educational policies were henceforth to consider national interest first.

Part four of the Act provided for the state management and control of all schools in Tanzania, including assisted and unassisted ones. They were to be under the (newly created post of the) Director of education. The main reason for this move was to control the curriculum of all schools. All salaries were now to be paid by the government. In order to emphasize the meaning and purpose of education in socialist Tanzania and to convey the sense of control of the Ministry over the national curriculum the name was changed from Ministry of Education to Ministry of National Education.

Early in 1969 Tanzania published her Second Five Year Development Plan which was an attempt to lay down a concrete strategy for the implementation of the principles set out in the AD, ESR and SRD. The plan incorporated five basic principles: social equality, ujamaa, self-reliance, economic and social transformation and African integration. The focus was on achieving the essential ingredients of an improved life for the majority. These were,as mentioned earlier, that all Tanzanians 1) enjoy a healthy diet 2) are adequately clothed 3) enjoy acceptable housing conditions and 4) have access to basic facilities of education and health.

Chapter 10 of the Five Year Plan gave details of the new educational policies. The Minister announced the need for appropriate strategies for reshaping the educational policy, some of major ones of which were: (Kurtz,1972:183-200)

1) Emphasizing effective primary education to equip young people in the first seven years of their formal education so that they could play a constructive role in the development of the quality of life in rural areas.
2) Re-writing the entire primary school syllabus to make it a self-contained unit providing basic education to all.
3) Encouraging the building of schools in rural areas on a self-reliance basis.
4) Africanizing all positions of headships of schools.
5) Vocationalizing the curriculum and making it more relevant. Subjects such as agriculture, woodwork, commerce and other technical subjects were now to be included in school curriculum.
6) Nationalizing the examination institutions and assessment responsibilities.
7) Democratizing student leadership, for example school prefects and monitors were now to be elected by students themselves.
8) Phasing out the government-supported boarding schools in order to eliminate elitism and narrow the separation between home and school.

coordinating various workshops and panels to further the goals of ESR in schools - these were The Institute of Education based at the University of Dar-es-Salaam and the Department of Education.

10) Allowing private schools to operate in order to appease the demands of certain parents for opportunities for secondary education for their children.
11) Making the expansion of schools, courses and admissions a direct function of the manpower needs.
12) Availing adult education in accordance with the needs of the rural development. At the same time making available work-study projects, and literacy classes according to the public demand.
13) Linking theory with practice wherever possible and emphasizing the dignity of labour in all educational institutions.
14) Instituting a cultural revival that emphasized traditional arts, crafts, drama and music.
15) Enhancing greatly the use of Swahili in schools, both as a medium of instruction and as a subject taught at all levels.
16) Expanding primary school to touch the majority and setting a date for Universal Primary Education(UPE) to become a reality.
17) Making all students attending university sign a contract in return for bursaries, to serve the nation for five years.
18) Starting TANU youth league branches in all schools.
19) Encouraging all cooperative efforts over individual efforts.
20) Starting upgrading and in-service courses for teachers to enhance their understanding and commitment.
21) Encouraging collaboration among various departments to introduce political education especially in the area of community development and agricultural extension.

Whilst the above planned changes were part of the strategy for implementation, the actual process of introducing these reforms to the public was simply by announcing them through the radio or the newspapers. It was then left to the respective technocrats to put the directives into practice. In the case of school reforms the Ministry sent out directives to Heads of schools who conveyed them to the rest of the teachers for their ultimate application on the students. Nyerere, however, was aware of the danger of his policies being either misunderstood or being unwisely implemented and so he made efforts to caution the people responsible for implementing the policies not to apply strategies and tactics that might result in faulty interpretation and implementation by the masses.

4.3.2.1. Curriculum Reform:

Immediately after the promulgation of ESR policy Nyerere clarified the strategy that was to be used, as he addressed all the head teachers, when he said,

strategy that was to be used, as he addressed all the head teachers, when he said,

> It must be clear we are not introducing a new subject called "self-reliance", or "socialism" into the school curriculum; nor just add periods of physical labour for the pupils and staff. What we are aiming at is converting our schools into economic communities as well as educational communities, which are to a considerable extent self reliant (financially)..... the pupils will learn new skills which are relevant to their future life, and adopt a realistic attitude to getting their hands dirty by physical labour...They will learn by doing (Nyerere 1968:410).

In 1968 a directive was sent to all primary, secondary and teacher training institutions to introduce farming or any such self-reliance activity in its curriculum. Like most other 'directives' coming from the top it was imposed on the school authorities to implement with the result that there were strong tendencies of its being followed mechanically without commitment, expertise, or for that matter, excitement. Their effectiveness will be evaluated from the socio-political, economic, academic and ideological perspectives in the next two chapters. An agricultural component was introduced into the science syllabus in all primary schools. By 1973 the number of schools specializing in agriculture had increased from 2 to 32 (Cooksey and Ishumi,1986:7). The government strategy in developing this agricultural curriculum for primary schools was to emphasize the latter's terminal nature. If, however, primary education was terminal and complete in itself then the importance of examination would have to be down-graded (challenging the selective and allocative function of education). Thus revision of the curriculum was planned so that it reflected the needs of the majority rather than aiming at creating professionals.

One of the purposes of this strategy of integrating economic activities with schooling was to inculcate a sense of dignity of labour in the youths. By constructing an educational strategy which incorporated productive activity with learning, the state sought not only to teach and demonstrate self-reliance but also synchronize it with the politico-economic strategy.

Within the curriculum however, the examinations continued to be used as gate-keepers for entry to secondary school, the cumulative record cards which included attitudinal assessments, and a quota system for various regions were introduced partly to diminish the importance of examination results. The onus of printing and correcting examinations fell on the National Examination Council instead of Cambridge or London. It was felt that although 5% of the primary school pupils succeeded in going to secondary schools, examinations encouraged teachers to spend all their time preparing the course work towards passing them rather than concentrating on the 95% who would have to start earning a living for

cooperative behaviour was expected to impose a change among students. However formal examination, fairly administered, seemed preferable to a potentially arbitrary and subjective concept of character assessment. In 1976, continuous assessment of academic work was introduced in yet another effort at reducing the importance of these competitive and elite nature of examination selection procedures.

4.3.2.2. Democratic Participation.

ESR recommended that students, support staff, teachers and administrators become active participants in all the activities of school, including decision-making and discipline. Rights went with responsibilities and they had to be shared by all to meet the needs of all the members of the school community. One of the difficulties in opening up the educational system to more widespread participation and decision-making, and in converting schools into "community educational centres," arose from the historically entrenched reluctance of teachers and those in authority to let go off authority and allow an active role for others to influence the nature of formal educational process. This age-old hegemony that was extended in the school-setting seemed to envelop the students too, who were expected to "behave themselves" and be passive receptors of knowledge. However, ESR and TANU Guidelines of 1974 called for the creation of a socialist, participatory democracy in all places of work and study. Popular participation was deemed essential by Nyerere for development.

To that effect then strategies were laid out for school committees to be elected democratically and they were to have two main functions: to promote full integration of the school with the community and to assist teachers in making policies and implementing decisions about attendance, uniforms, farming, discipline, syllabus, teaching etc. Careful planning was emphasized from the top and local agricultural officers were to provide expertise in planning self-reliance activities. Teachers, parents, students and Heads were all supposed to participate in the school farms and other manual activities. Besides farming, various schools planned to organise workshop activities like, book-binding, basket and brush-making, weaving, shoe-making, pottery, woodwork, brick-laying, fish-net making, boat-building, the making of simple farming implements, preparing food items etc. Although democratic organisation and planning were declared a central part of the Ujamaa policy, "it virtually disappeared in its actual implementation and in villagization ...there is no voluntary element at all" (Boesen and Raikes, 1976:22) Morrison's (1976) comment on the above issue was:

> One danger is that even those purposes of educational reform that are broadly acceptable in principal may be unwittingly distorted or subverted in the transition of policy to practice. The failure thus far to integrate agricultural and political education effectively into the

> broader curriculum has meant that these subjects, while given great emphasis, have been taught in an isolated and fragmented way (Morrison,1976:287)

4.3.2.3. Strategies Proposed for Curricular Reform

In 1969 Nyerere asked the teachers to create "New Tanzanians". Teachers, he felt, were the best mediums suited for the task because they were experienced in explaining matters. Persuasion, he thought may be slower, but it was more effective. University graduates were expected to transform the communities they lived in, from within. The staff and students were expected to be objective and scientific in their search for truth, in thinking and causing others to think in terms of humanity. They were to collect and disseminate facts, and be "protectors of the flame" when leaders endangered its brightness (Kurtz,1972:120).

The methods to be used by teachers were to uphold the ability to think and apply findings to the local situation. Pupils had to be involved in all activities and learning had to take place by doing. Nyerere suggested a strategy for teaching whereby all knowledge could be made relevant to life, and where problem-solving could be initiated in relation to the knowledge in their textbooks. Traditional ways of agriculture and living had to be changed; thus young people had to be trained to use modern principles of farming by adopting them to the local conditions. Experimentation and innovation in the light of local needs and limitations would provide students with techniques of dealing with life rather than simply theorizing. For example, the use of ox-carts and simple ploughs would free the farmer to use the time saved for reading, experimenting and activities.

Nyerere emphasized the point that the success of the policies depended on the strategies teachers employed to implement the policies. He stressed two points in relation to SR activities that directly related to methodology. He said:

> The first is the fact that the pupils must be really involved in this work, from the planning stage up to and including the allocation of the returns of any productive work which was undertaken. They must not see this new development as a sentence of hard labour,but as an exciting challenge... (1968:412)

Nyerere warned the Heads of the danger of making the mistake of working out plans and imposing them on students, saying, "This is what you do", because then the pupils would feel like labourers on a farm or workshop that belonged to some one else. Otherwise they would then act like labourers, conscious of exploitation, and end up doing as little as possible, given the amount of supervision provided. The second point Nyerere emphasized was the importance of integrating this kind

of self-reliance activity with school academic work and making their relevance to each other clear. Thus the practice of good farming would mean an input from subjects like Chemistry, Biology, Accounting, Geography, Hygiene etc.

As for the organisation of the schools, it was planned that school schedules should be reset to synchronize with the farming seasons of each region thereby maximizing the students' input both at home and in the schools. It was also recommended at one time that the entry age for primary students be raised to between 7-10 years so that by the time they finished their 7 year education they would be able to play the adult roles and benefit and contribute to economic self-help programs and to community farming activities. In its drive towards frugality, school buildings were to be put to multiple use in that adult education classes were to be held there in the evenings and some schools were to resort to double shifts whereby it would be possible to have a double intake of secondary pupils using the same school.

4.3.2.4. Strategies for Reducing Inequality.

Sociologists analyzing the problem of inequality in schools have come up with at least three distinct types of social control as a response to this perennial educational challenge: 1) using coercive power to force acceptance of situations of inequality 2) abolition of the causes and conditions of inequality and 3) efforts at justifying the existence of inequality and secure acceptance of it. Tanzania has resorted to using the second and sometimes the third.

In order to create a more egalitarian society two major policy moves in the educational field have been: one, a direct attempt at reducing social inequality by broadening the base of education provision and removing ascriptive barriers to access; and two, changing aspects of schooling and of curriculum to reinforce common socialist attributes and attitudes in the total school experience. The emphasis now was placed on directing more resources towards meeting basic mass learning needs and less on producing a small class of highly educated people (Court, 1984:277). It has been the government policy to build new secondary schools in such a way as to assure a fair regional distribution. However, private schools continued to be located according to the demand patterns and financial capabilities of the particular regions concerned. It was also proposed to include in the official educational policy a clause to reduce, and eventually eliminate sexual inequalities. The meeting of the UPE target, at least theoretically, eliminated gender inequalities in primary schooling. Gender imbalance had been especially acute in technical schools. The first and second Five Year Development Plans laid emphasis on equalization of opportunity. Any new secondary school was to be, as a matter of policy, either a girls' school or a co-educational school. The 1969-74 plan proposed uniformity in all primary school examinations, construction of new schools in disadvantaged areas and the achievement of Universal Primary Education (UPE) by

uniformity in all primary school examinations, construction of new schools in disadvantaged areas and the achievement of Universal Primary Education (UPE) by 1989 (Morrison,1976:269). The decision to seriously curtail the expansion of secondary schools was implicit in the ESR and included in the 1969-74 plan. Consequently state supported schools made up "one of the smallest public secondary school systems in the world relative to the size of the population" (World Bank, 1980:9).

4.3.3. Strategies For Other Innovations and Subsequent Directives.

In the years that followed ESR and AD, it became necessary to propose further changes and send out further directives for implementation to the government institutions. Among others the three important ones were the TANU guidelines (Mwongozo) of 1971, the Decentralization Policy of 1972, and the Musoma Resolutions of 1974.

Early in 1971 TANU published the guidelines largely to remind the party leadership of its responsibility to the people; to awaken the political consciousness of workers and peasants and to remind them of the real meaning of independence. However, more importantly, the guidelines admitted that the administrative infrastructure and the style of administration was still colonial and therefore at variance with the objectives of socialism and self-reliance. Those leaders who had not given up the habit of giving orders and had little patience to listen to people's problems needed to change now. The idea was to build equality between the leaders and the led. For a Tanzanian leader it was forbidden to be arrogant, extravagant, contemptuous and oppressive. This was also an indirect message to the school administrators.

Another important strategy with the specific objective of involving more people in the decision-making was the policy of Decentralization which aimed at giving more local freedom and democracy for both decision and action, on primarily issues of local impact, to the people. Under this policy all primary schools were placed under regional administration. They had to come to terms with the new ministerial structure as proposed by McKinsey in 1973 and the Villages Act of 1975, which called for each village to administer its own school. It also meant more self-reliance and participatory democracy at the local level. It was to curb the power of the bureaucracy and administrative elites in the headquarters, to whom all proposals had to be taken for approval, in the past. The strategy planned was towards a complete restructuring of the administrative system of education, involving the functional operations at national, regional, district and divisional levels (Maliyamkono, 1982:274).

At Musoma it was decided to bring the date for UPE forward from 1989 to

An added experimental program was the development of post-primary centres offering craft training to primary school leaders. Also planned were the Folk Development Colleges resembling the Scandinavian folk high schools. Although no major formative evaluation exercises were included as part of the on going strategy of educational reform it became imperative to appoint review bodies from time to time to look into the complaints and crises that developed over the years as the reforms began bringing results. One such major review body was the Presidential Commission which was set up as a result of complaints about the declining standards and inferior quality of schooling. The committee presented its report in 1984 calling for far reaching changes in the reform strategy, like the reintroduction of school fees and other matters. There was an almost total silence on ESR matters in the Commission's report. Instead it took a critical view of the efforts towards implementing the policy by indicating, for example, that decentralization had resulted in the creation of local bureaucratic machineries for control, rather than in greater participation in decision-making (Maliyamkono,1982:276). The Commission raised questions about the effectiveness of some of the most crucial reforms of the past decade-all of which were fundamental to the success of ESR. Presently, emphasis in the strategy seems to be leaning more towards the goal of better quality and survival rather than equality and reform.

4.4. GENESIS OF STRATEGY FORMATION AND A PRELIMINARY CRITIQUE

Following the pronouncement of ESR Nyerere travelled all over the country "politicizing and sometimes intimidating educators and teachers to accept the new educational philosophy" (Omari and Mosha, 1987). This was quite vividly reflected in his speeches (Omari,1981).

> Hence not enough time was spent in analyzing the technical aspects of the policy statement so as to give it technical legitimacy. As a result political platitudes and cliches took precedence (Mosha,1990:61)

In analyzing the immediate aftermath of the inception of ESR, Morrison says, 'surprise and confusion' were the main reactions among the people concerned with education because officials in the education division of the Ministry apparently had not been consulted. In fact two days after ESR was published the Minister of Education, Mr. Eliufoo delivered a major speech but made absolutely no mention of the President's pamphlet on the new policy (Morrison,1976:266).

> Characteristically, the policy seemed to come from above, shrouded in secrecy, even if it was a social policy deserving of public debate" (Omari and Mosha,1987:64)

Commenting on the policy-formulation style in Tanzania the above authors claim in their major study that the announcement was usually made with a great deal of public drama and political pressure that ruled out any room for debate or opposition. The policy pronouncement fanfare included orchestrated speeches and repeated radio recitations of passages from the ex-President's speeches, but with little elaboration or analytical interpretation. In the tempo and excitement that followed, the implementers (technocrats), understandably in a high state of anxiety, examined the policies with the fear of being branded 'the enemies of the revolution' if they did not overly support them, however unrealistic the policies may seem.The response from them had to be immediate with the result that some of these policies were characterised by haphazard strategies and implementation (ibid).

Goran Hyden, one of the foremost commentators on Tanzanian Ujamaa policy and Social Science Research Adviser to Ford Foundation, observed that in Tanzania there was a deliberate refusal to use rational analyses to assess the adequacy of the existing resource potential as a precondition to policy-making. In his twelve-year experience of studying East African policy-making he said that in Tanzania "Policy decision is made under dramatic conditions to produce a sense of rapid advance" (1979:16). Under these circumstances the quality of the strategy was bound to suffer due to resource-expectation mismatch, and stop-gap measures that had to be regularly applied as crises occurred. The frequent changes of key personnel in the concerned Ministries underscore the reality of the fear of victimization and losing one's job in case of dissent.

A research report of a collaborative effort between the University, field officers from the regions and operatives from institutions dealing with education, gave two crucial examples to prove the above point. These concerned the ESR and Musoma resolutions. The above report of 1987 said that ESR was a publication of Nyerere and was attributed to him personally. Immediately after the pronouncement of the policy a meeting of all senior educators was convened where Rashidi Kawawa, made it clear that there was no room for debate and the only task left was for its implementation (Kawawa,1967). In this tidal wave of political effervesce the policy statement was reduced to a simple formula, ESR = farming (shamba) and manual work (Omari and Mosha,1987:65). This research conducted jointly under the sponsorship of Rockerfeller foundation and IDRC of Canada, revealed, among other things, that the educational officials' and teachers' interpretations of the ESR were almost entirely confined to it being physical activities like farming, woodwork, welding etc.

Lamenting on this state of affairs Ndunguru(1976), a senior educator pointed out that crucial aspects of ESR policy, which were the creation of stable cognitive and affective pillars through solid instructional strategies, were completely neglected due to the misinterpretation of the policy. Twenty five years after the enunciation of the policy, educators and policy-makers were still lamenting the lack

of proper interpretation of ESR. For example some over-zealous implementers, in their efforts to impress and solidify their political positions, demanded that each student cultivate two hectares. If this were to be really implemented then it would require more land than Tanzania actually possessed. There were several problems in a policy that emphasized participation at the rhetoric level but resorted to a constant flow of top-down 'directives' from above, to institute policy. The first of these was the teachers' level of comprehension of the philosophy behind the reforms; secondly the expertise required in guiding the pupils in modern ways of any practical activity like masonry or wood-work etc (not to mention he resources required at schools), and finally the motivation and commitment required to successfully carry out that activity.

A second set of problems concerned the authoritarian channels used for strategy formation and implementation that were normally followed to initiate a new reform. There were at least five mutually exclusive parties involved in the exercise: the originator of the policy, the planner of the strategy, the ministry official delivering the directives to all schools, the teachers who received these and implemented them and the final recipients of the command, namely the pupils, on whom the directives were implemented on. By the time the directives reached the teachers they had lost most of their motivational force and political gusto and to a large extent, it's rationale. The policy called for an increase in government intervention to institute, what Goran Hyden (1979:10) has called,transformative planning, as distinct from allocative or economic planning.

> Transformative planning which is political in character seeks to legitimize new social objectives or to accomplish a major realignment of existing objectives. The emphasis on management of change through manipulation of variables which are important to social action. Little attention is paid to whether the marginal returns obtained are equal, which is the primary concern of allocative planning (Hyden,1979:10).

In another study, Samoff(1990) drew similar insights. He observed that policy-making and implementation in the field of education manifested conflicting and, at times, contradictory policy styles: seemingly incompatible goals, such as creating a participatory and egalitarian citizenry but maintaining central control; wanting to accomplish major changes rapidly and yet refusing to institute efficiency criteria of modern policy-making; fiercely emphasizing egalitarian principle in all educational policies and yet encouraging private secondary schools to flourish; insisting on meeting the basic needs of all Tanzanians as a priority but ignoring the economic considerations of policies. All these and more seemed to abound the experiment. Samoff concurs with others in saying that new policies were announced with great publicity and drama and optimistic goals set. However, often, prior to detailed analysis and planning, initial implementation got under way. These new

policies became national crusades that demanded selfless, enthusiastic support.

Samoff pointed out that this policy-by-campaign was self-limiting, since after the initial excitement and raising of hopes, "attention wanes, pronouncements become less frequent, and actual policy may revert to what it had been earlier" (1990:201). Since the initial unrealistic targets were rarely met, all goal-setting strategies remained mere 'statements of intent and hope' rather than guides to practical action.

> An inherently political policy process of this sort,where political education and mobilization are far more important than technical expertise and rationalized resource use, simply cannot be sustained in Tanzania's vacillation between technical-administrative and political-mobilizational perspectives on development (Samoff,1990:207).

Two more characteristics of policy-making process that Hyden analyzed were centralized decision-making and the structural susceptibility of the policy to external influences. Not withstanding the rhetoric of participation and bottom-up planning, public policy in general, and especially educational policy, remained highly centralized. However, the degree of centralization in policy making exceeded central capacities and expertise to plan strategies. "Pronouncements proliferate, but follow up, evaluation, and adjustment are weak, driven more by crisis than systematic monitoring "(Samoff,1990:201). Policy-making vacillated between reliance on mass support and distrust of mass participation. "Ostensibly politicizing institutions become vehicles for depoliticization" (ibid).

In spite of the central thrust of the policy towards self-reliance, educational policy makers relied on the West for models, analysis, diagnoses and approval (pg.203). Often policies were conditioned, starting from the identification of what was problematic to the designing of strategies for intervention, and upto the evaluation of the outcomes, by external factors. Depending on what could be funded, influenced what was proposed and attempted; examples of which were the Swedish-style Folk Development Colleges and Cuban style vocational schools. The extent of reliance on externally-provided finance can be assessed by the figures in Table 3 and 4. Thus policy makers had to find a match between their own goals and those of their potential donors.

Table 2: Tanzania's Ministry of Education Expenditure.

Year	Foreign Component
1962/63	65%
1976/77	80%
1979/80	71%
1988/89	51%

Source: URT, Ministry of Education (1988) Maelezo na Kumbukumbu ya Makadirio ya Fedha za Mpango wa Maendeleo, Mwaka 1988-89, Dar-es-Salaam, "Utangulizi."

Table 3: Aid to Education 1981/82 to 1987/88 (Capital Funds - 000Tshs).

Year	International Organizations		Foreign Governments		Tanzania		Total	
	Tshs.	%	Tshs.	%	Tshs.	%	Tshs	%
81/82	178955	60.63	54820	18.57	61378	20.80	295153	100
82/83	48680	68.66	19850	9.17	48025	22.17	216555	100
83/84	172839	59.81	14044	4.86	102117	35.53	28900	100
84/85	254771	60.47	28800	6.84	137712	32.69	421283	100
85/86	307070	58.41	68190	12.97	150500	28.62	525760	100
86/87	885397	70.00	96186	7.60	283424	22.40	1265007	100
87/88	438150	58.53	18800	2.51	29755	39.76	748545	100

Source: Adapted from URT, Ministry of Finance, Planning and Economic Affairs. (Various Volumes) 1981/82-1987/88.

An essential part of this study has been to analyze the style of policy-making in Tanzania. Several factors increased the importance of polity in Tanzania: socialism was said to be an ideology conceptualized by one man; and which was then taken to the people through a political party consisting of an essentially emerging bourgeois class (Hyden, 1979:5). It is also claimed that since the foundation of the ideology was not laid through a revolutionary struggle it had to be done by political means; and the revolutionary spirit, if not consciousness, had to be induced by artificial means of dramatization and adopting notions like, "we must run while others walk" etc. Hyden identified at least 4 main features of this strategy or mode of policy-making in Tanzania.

1. The first was the strong desire to do everything and do it at once. This is manifested in the way they were presented and labelled, as "frontal attacks," operations etc.
2. Secondly, those at the helm of power often decided without having first obtained full knowledge of possible consequences of their decisions. Hirschman called this "motivation - outrunning-understanding" style of policy-making (1965). Nyerere did not believe that ends justified means (Kurtz,1972:116). The Musoma Resolution was an interesting example of policy-making style in Tanzania, where frequently policies were laid down first and the difficulties of implementing them considered later (Stabler,1979:49). The speed-up in villagisation made it necessary to bring forward the UPE, which according to the 1969-74 Development Plan, was originally meant to be achieved by 1989. But with rural families moving into villages it was decided by NEC in Musoma to bring forward the UPE by 12 years to 1977, in the face of all the problems associated with teacher supply, school buildings, books, equipment etc. Musoma also revealed that NEC of TANU had again taken over the policy-making function of the government. Kawawa had said in the Assembly that "TANU is more supreme than the government and the government as such is the people's instrument for administration" (Pratt,1976:214).
3. The third crucial feature of the strategy was the "unwillingness of policy-makers to use the past as a source of guidance for the future" (Hyden,1979:6). This has been another very costly habit that we shall elaborate on in the following chapters. Suffice it to say here that many of the most important reforms of the ESR had already been given careful thought and had been tried out during the colonial days. All the past suddenly became irrelevant although the ideology had paid lip-service to the concept of 'learning from the past and from others'. In our theoretical postulates of policy-making models we had referred to Dror (1969) who considered this inclination as a main feature of policy-making in most developing countries. Tanzanians ended up therefore, trotting on either well-trodden paths (with less success) or on making frequent moves into the unknown without caring for the feasibility of the innovations in economically

rational terms. The task of policy-makers became, what Hirschman called, that of 'zeroing in' on a new policy "which would otherwise have been ruled out by the conventional criteria of rational calculation" (ibid).

4. The fourth feature of this policy-making mode was the discrepancy between public expectations and what could actually be attained by the incumbent public servants. To take but one example, every Ujamaa Village was promised an educational and a medical facility. However, in reality not even building materials could be sufficiently supplied for these facilities and children often used each others' backs as desks to write their notes on. In the absence of an objective assessment of the resources required to carry out the reforms, the strategy for implementation had to resort to the issuing of straightforward appeals and directive. This strategy so enraged the villagers that when Dr. Klerru, on behalf of the government, appealed to the farmers to move into Ujamaa villages he was shot dead.

Be as it may, the rationale for this policy-making strategy was often provided in the argument that it was a way of creating a sense of speed and participation for a radical transformation in a society that had escaped a revolutionary struggle. Another argument put forward was that it was not the 'optimizing' orientation of the planner but rather the commitment of the policy-maker that was supposed to help realize an idea, where ideology became a more crucial variable than planning. And lastly, that the fulfilment of political goals was a much more crucial priority than economic considerations and often times the latter goals were overshadowed by the former.

Judging from the shortcomings and merits of the ESR one can make a preliminary assessment of whether the policy remained one of political platitude or of public policy (Dye,1978; Ishumi,1988, Mosha,1986). According to the criteria set by these authors and their own assessments, the Tanzanian policy did not meet any of the criteria for making and implementing quality policies, as stipulated in the earlier theoretical sections of this chapter. The processes involved in the formation of the policy in Tanzania remained a secret between its architect and those who gave it their blessings (Omari & Mosha,1987:66).

The 'optimizing models', as Streaten notes often treated social institutions, psychological attitudes and orientations etc. as given. Furthermore they assume that an efficient civil service carried out government orders; that people were disciplined in appearing on duty on time and carrying out orders; that money was spent according to conventional notions of efficiency; and that policy alternatives were considered largely on their financial merits. Albeit, measured against these Olympic heights of public goals, governments everywhere may score the same: very low effectiveness. Criticizing these models, Killick adds, they also presuppose clear and stable goals on the part of the government, and at the same time ignore or treat it as given key environmental variables. This bias tends to be inherent in all the

'optimizing' models.

Marxist social scientists tend to fall victims to a similar bias in that for them the goals of socialism are given. Therefore Nyerere's and TANU'S policies were always measured against these "objective" goals. While conventional planning economists are optimalists, the Marxists are maximalist in their total concern towards maximizing a set of social values (Hyden,1979:12). Moreover, they do not necessarily agree that resources have to be used for other functions than those of realizing the "objective" socialist goals. Transition to socialism in Tanzania has had to be induced by political means; and independence has not necessarily meant a reduction of power, and particularly, power centrally controlled.

Political decisions were generally regarded as being beyond criticism, and therefore the blame for any shortcomings always tended to fall on the executing committees (Barkan and Okumu,1979:101). The civil servants regularly got whipped by politicians who accused them of inefficiency. This excessive use of policy-making mode, referred to as "platform policy-making", although at one time condemned by Nyerere, was the result of the awareness of the bureaucrats that showing commitment to policies was more important than offering a rational critique of them. Thus often civil servants tailored their feedback reports to please their political bosses at the expense of improvement or even success of the projects. This was particularly damaging in a situation where policies emerged largely without proper feasibility studies and therefore the only guide to proper action was accurate reporting.

By elevating the ruling party to the position of supreme policy-making body the political efforts were towards removing the policy-making powers of the civil service as an institution. Babu (1984) who had at one time become a popular Union Minister for Economic Planning in Tanzania, in his final disillusionment reflected:

> The one party-rule had ended in becoming one person rule with all the horrors it entails. The person in power, as he or she vegetates at the commanding heights of authority....surrounds himself with a crowd of harmless,often compromised mediocrities....create their own court jesters and errand boys..(pg.69).

Omari and Mosha concurred with the above in their report when they said, "Indeed, for Tanzania, most Ministers have remained errand boys who gave room to Mwalimu to be the chief spokesperson on educational matters" ESR and Musoma Resolutions were classic cases in point (Omari and Mosha, 1987:69). These authors concluded their report by saying:

> In future instead of relying on intensive dramatization, processions and an unconsidered plunge into implementation of new educational policy, systematic education, re-interpretation and critical analysis might lead to implementation strategies with more far reaching effects. (pg:67)

Maliyamkono pointed out that "It is one thing to provide an institutional structure...and another to insure its functioning in practice" (Maliyamkono,1982:276). In corroboration with the above, but in the economic sphere, John Saul, in his essays on the Political Economy of Africa said:

> In fact the missing link in the chain of Tanzania'socialism lies precisely here: the absence of a strategy which might guarantee that the newly established framework of state control over surpluses and over decisions be used to transform the economy significantly (Arrighi and Saul,1973:273)

We shall close this chapter with a quote from Cranford Pratt:

> Much has contributed to this continually impetuous style of decision-making. A dominating president who is much more an initiator than an administrator has certainly been a factor.....The failure has been one of planning to relate major policy-decisions to the resources available... a failure to take into account the capacities and weaknesses of the agencies that would have to implement the major decisions being taken; a tendency for political commissioners to rush into implementation of any measure they surmise has the approval of the president or the prime minister; a failure to establish priorities (Mwansasu and Pratt,1979:228-9).

END NOTES

1. The policy of villagisation involved creating Ujamaa Villages (communes) throughout the country so that ultimately the whole rural population of Tanzania would be living in these socialist or communalistic villages.

CHAPTER 5

IMPLEMENTATION OF EDUCATION FOR SELF-RELIANCE IN SCHOOLS.

5.1. Prolegomena.

Having examined the strategy formulation process in Tanzania this chapter scrutinizes the actual implementation of the policy by way of curricular changes (with a major thrust on self-reliance projects) and changes in the organisation of schools. The chapter is sub-divided into eight action areas identified by the ESR policy statement. Qualitative research conducted in Tanzania for the purpose of providing further validity to some of the findings in the documentary search on the ESR issue has also been integrated in this chapter. After the prolegomena the following areas will be explicated: changes in the curriculum (syllabi and pedagogy); performance of schools in implementing the self-reliance projects; making primary and secondary schools terminal and relevant; diversification and vocationalization of secondary schools; changing the role of examinations; integrating schools with the surrounding community; inculcating new socialist values and attitudes; reducing all types of inequalities; and last, introducing democratic participation in schools at all levels of decision-making and implementation.

Tanzania is one of the few African countries that stressed equality across the board - in the distribution of wealth and in the provision of basic needs for all; and in declaring the goal of national self-reliance as a key strategy for its development. However, by the 1980's it was realised that the situation was clearly one of "development without growth", where there was no significant improvement in the standard of living of the vast majority, especially those living in rural areas; at the same time the goal of self-reliance had moved further away (Ottaway and Ottaway, 1981:44-58). Neither had the inculcation of socialist values taken root nor was the productive base of the economy any stronger. The Minister interviewed in Tanzania pointed out that the emphasis should have been on production rather than on distribution. He also claimed that creativity, criticism and productivity were systematically undermined and in some cases diminished. This, he believed, killed economic growth and development and now we were paying the price for it. Growth was erratic and self-reliance remained a myth (ibid). Serious questions were raised about the viability of the policies of Nyerere who had himself admitted in 1977 that after ten years of efforts Tanzania was neither socialist nor self-reliant (Nyerere,1977). What was ideally expected to become a highly decentralized, village-based, participatory and self-reliant system had turned out to become an immensely dependent, highly centralized, non-participatory, statism (Ottaway and Ottaway,1981). Any societal transformation effort involves awareness, commitment, availability and use of resources and struggle on the part of the total

population. The Minister in the interview said, Nyerere had no real alibis in helping him to fulfil his vision because he did not seek the participation of his colleagues during the formation of the ideology. Thus the bureaucracy merely paid lip-service either because they had no choice or because they had found ways of profiting from it. For production and distribution of goods and services to be reorganised in a predominantly peasant economy, most people have to learn to do things differently. In the absence of a revolutionary situation, within the largely 'uncaptured' peasantry, who were neither deprived of land (at independence) nor were being ruthlessly exploited by Tanzanian landlords, there seemed little motivation for change. The social goals of public ownership of production, elimination of inequalities and exploitation, creation of indigenous initiative, self-reliance and collective living were largely irrelevant to the millions of Tanzanian peasants living in scattered homesteads all over this vast land.

Formal schooling in Tanzania had different goals at various times, depending on the ideology of the dominant group in power. Education has predominantly been used for adaptation, for social reproduction, for modernisation, for self-reliance or for liberation and development. It has however always served the function of transmitting knowledge and skills through classroom instruction, and in most cases taken up the allocative function. Schools have also been also seen as vehicles of social mobility. In the theoretical discussion two major schools of thought emerged: One saw schooling as an instrument of socialization and the second seemingly contrary view, saw socialization of students being largely determined by the wider socio-economic context and adult expectation, both of which were outside the control of schools. The political elite in Tanzania obviously believed it was the schools that were the chief instruments of socialization. Thus Nyerere explicitly laid stress on the curriculum, teachers and organisational changes as a means of inculcating appropriate attitudes.

In addition to the above roles, ESR introduced two new functions whereby schools were to become production units earning income to meet the recurrent costs and they were to have an explicit agenda of cultivating socialist values using cognitive and affective dispositions. No one had problems with Tanzania's idealistic goals per se. However, as Dror (1968) maintains, that following the pronouncement of goals systematic strategies for implementation must be laid out and judged on the basis of manifested outcomes, not mere good intentions. The following sections of this chapter contain a detailed explication of the policy as it was implemented in schools. In Tanzania, not only was it expected that schools would independently transform its pupils but that they would ultimately create a new socialist society by bringing about a socialist revolution through education.

Some of the major functions normally attributed to schools are: the conservative function of transmitting culture, skills, values, norms etc; the innovative function of effecting social change or being a major source of new ideas

and knowledge; the political function of using curriculum and organisation of schools to bring about political socialization; the economic function of manpower development and modernisation; and lastly the selective and allocative function of filtering using examinations and allocating through certification. Each of these has been used at different times in Tanzania.

Conflicting perceptions regarding the role of schools in agricultural development led to a healthy debate involving people like Foster (1969) and Callaway (1972). The opposing views were best expounded in Hanson and Brennbeck. Combination of education and productive work can have significant economic, social and pedagogical benefits depending on its basic conception, organisation, commitment of those involved and social framework in which it takes place. While there is some agreement that formal schooling may impact positively on agricultural development (Blaug,1964) there is no consensus on formal education being a sure tool for social change. Also attempts to inculcate positive attitudes towards manual work and rural life are hard to succeed when education is viewed as a private investment in a lottery for upward mobility with low odds and high stakes (Weeks,1969:50). In the interviews, a university professor, responding to the question concerning major constraints shaping the policy and practice, said inconsistencies in parental support for the policy in accepting the new function of schools (as service to the community) was one of the key problems facing successful implementation in schools.

Education as a panacea for social problems or as an instrument of social policy has seldom been shown to produce fruitful results when the social problems are not caused by education. Although Balogh saw agriculture as the only answer for school leavers, as long as schools remained a gateway to the emerging economy, agriculture or political education could not solve the problem. The Castle Commission of 1963, commenting on Education in Uganda, reported:

> The problems of agricultural education are not primarily educational; they are intimately bound up with the solution of economic, technical and social problems.....system of land tenure, improved land use, finance and marketing, research and development, traditions and tribal customs, being among them.

Thus what Tanzania experimented on, had been analyzed, tested and documented by educators and sociologists like Foster, who in his well-known article on the vocational school fallacy, had laid bare the deception and fallacy in the belief of the possibility of using curricular changes to solve social problems or impact major school and societal change (Foster,1969).

5.2. CHANGES IN THE CURRICULUM

The Musoma Resolutions laid out the new aim of Tanzanian education:

> The basic aim of our education is the development of socialist attitudes. A socialist is a worker. Therefore by introducing work in schools, we are building socialist habits in the students-the socialist habit of wanting to work (Musoma Resolutions,1974).

ESR proposed changes in the curriculum, organisation of schools and the entry age. The curriculum changes were in the area of course content, pedagogy, introduction of new subjects and changing of the evaluation procedures. One of the overriding aims was to influence values, attitudes and orientations. The specific objectives of the exercise were to move away from the literary, didactic, authoritarian, elitist and white-collar-oriented curricula and practices, and replace them with cooperative, service and community oriented, self-reliant and egalitarian methods and content (Cooksey and Ishumi,1987).

The main changes in the curriculum between 1967 and 1974 were as follows:

1. **Diversification And Vocationalization:** Subject 'biases' were introduced at the secondary level so that schools specialized in either technical, agricultural, commercial or home economics fields. The purpose was to teach productive activities with academic training.
2. **Active Political Socialization:** By including compulsory political education it was hoped that students would change their attitudes. Education was expected to develop service-oriented, non-acquisitive and cooperative attitudes; a desire to return to rural life, foster egalitarian values and create the love for manual work.
3. **Down-grading Examinations:** Evaluation of student performance and eligibility now included character and attitude assessment together with participation in ESR activities.
4. **Self-Reliance (SR) Activities:** The organisation of schools was changed to include at least one productive activity, such as farming. The purpose was to a) encourage self-reliance, b) combine education with work, c) earn while they learn, d) curb intellectual arrogance by 'dirtying their hands', e) prepare pupils for life in rural areas f) facilitate community involvement and encourage integration.
5. **Democratic Decision-Making and Participation:** The ideology explicated the need to decentralize authority by creating an environment of participatory problem-solving in and outside the classrooms. The purpose was to refine ideas and incite involvement and commitment to reforms.

6. **Making each level of schooling complete:** Entry age and school terms were changed to meet the needs of the new reforms. Each cycle of schooling (primary,secondary) was to become complete in itself as regards vocational skills, work orientation etc.

In accordance with the ESR policy, education was expected to develop co-operative attitudes, critical thinking and self-confidence; emphasize unity of mental and manual work, foster egalitarian values and promote self-reliance. Education was to become less 'bookish' and more functional, with a productive unit attached to each school while at the same time integrating it with the surrounding community.

It is necessary to examine how successful Tanzania was in effectively changing the curriculum and institute reforms in order to fulfil the goals of ESR. Tanzania's education system has always been heavily centralized and uniform as of the Act of Parliament passed in 1961 to create a single system of education. Therefore, an identical curriculum was enforced throughout the nation. Due to this centrally controlled direction, individual schools and communities were not able to inject new ideas (Omari and Mosha,1987:15). An opposing view was expressed by one of the interviewees, the Regional Education Officer for the city of Dar-es-Salaam, who said that the centrally planned curricula led to a standardised approach which favoured the implementation of the ESR in schools. The curriculum, however, basically remained academically oriented.

Over the last 25 years of ESR there have been several curricular changes: syllabi and texts have been partly localized with more attention paid to Tanzania, East Africa, Africa and the third World in subjects like History, Geography and Political Education. Efforts have been made to demystify expertise and bookish knowledge by removing the disfunction between mental and functional education. This particular feature of the policy implementation was lucidly emphasized by the former Minister of Education in the interview. In his opening remark, he said what Nyerere was trying to achieve in the ESR was to redefine the meaning of education for the "miseducated," who were brought up in the Western tradition of education and who believed all education had to be academic and had to come from books, preferably published in the West; that ESR was trying to infuse the reality of the Tanzanian rural poverty and the resultant need to become self-reliant and service oriented vis-a-vis the peasants. Thus, political education emphasized the pupils' future role in the development of a socialist, self-reliant nation. Attempts were made to localize and functionalize the science curriculum by relating it to rural environment. The flora and fauna studied were the ones found in rural areas and emphasis was put on application of science to agriculture, health, nutrition and development in general (Odia, 1971). However, these changes observed in the early years of ESR were systematically overshadowed by compounding problems. Thus most later studies concurred on this singular fact that the curriculum has remained

rigid and uniform with a predominantly academic bias, irrespective of the heterogenous environment and strong pleas from the founder of the policy to do otherwise (Malekela,1984; ILO,1982; Nyerere,1984; Cooksey and Ishumi,1987; Lubasha,1981; Gillette,1977; TANU,1974; Omari and Mosha, 1987; Ishumi,1974; Mbilinyi,1977; Kinshaga,1977). Interesting theories have been propounded to explain this stubborn resistance to any structural changes in the curriculum of Tanzanian Schools. And although opinions differ on this issue, many researchers have come to the conclusion that the formal system has not been characterised by an even and thorough revision of the subjects studied (Gillette,1977). Although the curriculum shifted to some extent, from an academic to a vocational bias, and towards Africanisation, localization, politicization and functionality, academic study dominated the curriculum and vocational instruction was usually limited to one major subject per school.

Amongst the reasons forwarded to explain the academic and abstract emphasis of school subjects was the point that examinations (which only tested the academic aspects) still played a crucial role in determining the life chances of all students and also the reputation and status of the school and its teachers (Gandye,1978; Malekela,1977). Thus the curriculum was still geared towards the less than 4 per cent of its graduates who gained admission to further formal schooling (Table 5), "leaving the others without the basic knowledge, skills and attitudes necessary to make them self-reliant within the village or urban setting" (Malekela,1984:73). With the coming of ESR and the resultant change in the goals of education, it was hoped that the curricular changes would also reflect the need to improve the economic and social condition of the majority who lived in rural areas.

Another reason for the lack of change in the curriculum focus was seen in the ambiguity over the priority post-secondary vocations the students were expected to pursue: was it further study, or work in the "modern" sector or work in Ujamaa villages? Primary school education remained irrelevant to the future lives of the vast majority of its recipients, according to Mbilinyi, whose research brought her to the conclusion that, "....that the implementation has failed to touch--- the fundamental issues is beyond doubt" (Mwobahe and Mbilinyi,1974:20).

As for the reform in the pedagogy following the changed goals of education suggested in ESR, "Tanzania cannot be said to have designed or implemented a coherent and pervasive strategy of pedagogical revolution" (Gillette,1977:132). Grol-Overling's research in classroom observation of teaching revealed that the most common method in use was where the teacher wrote notes on the blackboard from a book or old notes and pupils copied them; the teacher then spent time marking notebooks or doing other work (Overling,1969:115)

Table 5.4: Primary School Leavers and Those Selected to Form One

1962-1987

Year	Std. VII/VIII Leavers	Form One Selection: Number and Percent			
		Public	%	Private	%
1962	13730	4810	35.0	-	-
1963	17042	4972	29.1	-	-
1964	20348	5302	26.1	-	-
1965	29367	5942	20.2	458	1.6
1966	41083	6377	15.5	2329	5.7
1967	47981	6635	13.8	2591	5.4
1968	58872	6989	11.9	2610	4.4
1969	60545	7149	11.8	2511	4.2
1970	64630	7350	11.4	3021	4.7
1971	70922	7780	11.0	3254	4.6
1972	87777	7956	9.1	3667	4.2
1973	106203	8165	7.7	4379	4.1
1974	119350	8472	7.1	4964	4.2
1975	137559	8680	6.3	5114	3.7
1976	156114	8659	5.5	5756	3.7
1977	169106	8706	5.1	6590	4.0
1978	185293	8720	4.7	7165	3.9
1979	193612	8908	4.6	8467	4.4
1980	212446	8913	4.2	6677	3.1
1981	357816	9178	2.6	7095	2.0
1982	419829	9241	2.2	7988	1.9
1983	454604	9899	2.2	8469	1.9
1984	649560	10077	1.6	9606	1.5
1985	429194	10881	2.5	11745	2.7
1986	380096	11721	3.1	12625	3.3
1987	380758	14626	3.8	-	-

Source: URT, Ministry of Education (1988) Basic Education Statistics in Tanzania (BEST) 1983-1987,Dar-es-Salaam,p.10.

Dubbledam (1970) found teachers often grouping pupils by ability and then concentrating on the stronger ones "who were to be prepared for the General Entrance Examination (G.E.E.) with a chance of success". Mbilinyi observed that caning was used as punishment for being late, failing to answer a question or not sitting absolutely still (Mbilinyi,1977:132). Teachers, she found, were often solely concerned with maintaining their authority in the classroom, rather than encouraging participatory learning:

> The teaching methods and the organisation of school and classroom prevalent in primary and secondary schools are diametrically opposed to the objectives of developing creativity, critical thinking, self-confidence and cooperation. The classroom is run in a bureaucratic fashion, one man rule at the top, students powerless at the bottom. The prevalent use of the cane is symbolic of the authority relations....Rote memory learning is relied upon: partly because of the lack of teaching materials and textbooks;partly because some teachers lack the initiative and/or incentives to create their own teaching materials and books; partly because of the effect of examinations on both teachers and students; partly because the syllabus is too 'full'; partly because there are too many subjects and periods (pg.222)

Questions of pedagogy are intimately tied to the availability of resources, time, motivation, expertise, competency etc. and cannot be seen in isolation as a problem of teachers alone. Due to his\her own learning experiences of the past and cultural norms, the teacher himself\herself has a very traditional view of his\her profession. He\she looks at himself\herself as a banker from whom children come to withdraw knowledge. Social distance between the learner and the teacher is increased by virtue of the high ratio of pupils to teachers. Even in a 'model' experimental pilot project like Kwamsisi (created to be duplicated by other schools), Kilimhana found 'banking' approaches to teaching such as narration, dictation and one-way question methods rather than the more 'activistic' and 'populist' approaches such as problem-solving and group-work methods (Kilimhana,1975:146-7).

Thus, in spite of all the rhetoric and efforts at transforming the curriculum along ESR policy, the methodology and the content of most subjects like Physics, Chemistry, Mathematics etc - has seen no fundamental changes (Mukyanuzi,1985:50) and the curriculum's usefulness and relevance remain suspect. Old-fashioned books have not yet been replaced or rewritten in a manner consistent with socialist education in Tanzania (Karioki,1979:108). Classroom pedagogy at all levels tends to be academic (linked to examination/ selection/promotion syndrome), and treats the learner as passive and obedient recipient of knowledge. Even the new practical courses introduced after 1967 soon became more 'academic' in orientation (Kurtz,1972:178) as was confirmed by UNESCO report:

> The need for curriculum reform has been widely recognised... Children do not acquire dynamic knowledge; what is taught is irrelevant to life demands; great percentages of pupils come out of the system illiterate and not able to be employed or participate efficiently in rural life activities. Curriculum planning is inefficient and not supported by relevant teacher in-service training, teachers'guide books, text books and other learning materials. School evaluation and assessment results do not have any real impact on curriculum planning; innovations have been universalized without pilot project experimentation; and teachers are fundamentally unaware of curriculum development and thus cannot make even the slightest modification that will meet the needs of their pupils.
> (UNESCO,1989:82)

5.3. Self-Reliance Projects in Schools

One of the new roles given to schools was for them to become income generating institutions. The ESR was very clear about this:

> This means that all schools..must be economic communities as well as social and educational communities.Each school should have, as an integral part of it, a farm or workshop which provides the food eaten by the community, and makes some contribution to the total national income..every school should also be a farm (Nyerere,1967)

In 1968 all schools and teacher training colleges embarked on farming and other self-reliance activities. Between 1967 and 1973 secondary schools specializing in agriculture were increased from two to thirty two (Daily News,July 14,1972). Travelling through Tanzanian schools one sees some obvious signs of SR activities by the sight of school children harvesting maize or planting seeds or going to school with a broom. However, the types of agricultural activities are often no different from the basic labour intensive agriculture practised by the rest of the villagers. The teachers very often have little knowledge of, or inclination towards, agriculture. One respondent from the Commissioner's office stated in the interview that there was a general lack of interest and expertise among the teachers partly because of lack of motivation and partly because of lack of financial resources and capital for the school projects. Successful education for self-reliance would, amongst other things, depend on modern production techniques and the introduction of new agricultural skills, including possibly an initial small capital investment. Tanzanian children did not need to go to school to learn how to use a hoe. Thus it was necessary to provide more specialized training in agriculture. However most of the farming and other SR activities were not integrated into the curriculum. Walter Rodney (1972), writing about these self-reliance activities in Tanzanian schools said:

> Agriculture became an apology for a subject. It was part of the drudgery of the institution. The teachers received no agricultural education and therefore could not teach anything scientific. Children acquired nothing but distaste for the heavy labour of shamba (farm) work and in fact it was used as a form of punishment too (pp:82-83).

The 1976 teaching practice report of the education students at the University of Dar-es-Salaam stated that there was no learning component built deliberately in the SR activities. No effort was made to change the primitive system practised on the farms nor were efforts made to change teaching methods in the classroom along ESR policy lines. The report concluded thus:

> To implement a policy without critical analysis is in essence to sabotage it (Teaching Practice Study Exercise III 1976).

Even the returns were minimal compared to the costs. The performance of SR projects can be systematically analyzed using a simple typology of input-process-output construct. Input here refers to variables such as the provision of an explicit strategy to accompany material and manpower inputs like land, tools, infrastructure, finance, qualified teachers, managerial facilities etc. By processes we mean tangible and intangible interactions and characteristics within the learning situation such as teachers' morale, expertise and commitment, attitudes and understanding, teaching methodology and aids, students expectations and willingness etc. Output includes learning acquired - knowledge, skills, attitudes, behaviour, expectations etc.

Before examining the self-reliance projects in this framework it is well to remind ourselves of the major objective of these projects. Ideally self reliance activities were supposed to perform at least six functions:

1. Provide an avenue for acquiring skills for farming, carpentry etc.
2. Provide a source of food and income for schools.
3. Inculcate positive attitudes and dignity of manual work.
4. Build bridges between school and community.
5. Curb the exodus of school-leavers to cities by providing employment in rural areas.
6. Create self-reliance on a personal and national level.

The policy itself was the input of one person. There was no room for alternative strategies. In the interviews both the Minister and the Headmistress of a school in Dar-es-Salaam confirmed that Nyerere was the sole architect of the policy. If it is accepted that the policies themselves were good, the expected delineation of carefully worked out strategies by the technocrats was not forthcoming. A Member of Parliament from the Coast said in the interview that there was improper interpretation of the policy and as a result a faulty strategy for

implementation emerged. Heads of schools were simply sent 'directives' to introduce self-reliance projects in schools without any feasibility studies of viable projects or provisions for resources.A member of the Presidential Commission and a headmistress of one of the best schools in the country, reiterating on this point said that logical analysis and rational strategy formation exercises were replaced by political methods of sending out frequent directives and guidelines to straighten and correct the many inconsistencies that emerged in this erratic method of implementation. The pattern of communication between the Directors in the Ministry and Heads in Schools was not unlike that between teachers and students. Teachers, who were neither trained in the skills required by the project activity nor in the management of such a venture could only provide a limited input. Often the resources required, like good land, manure, water-supply, workshop equipment etc. were not available or affordable with the limited school budget.

The process of implementing these activities inevitably suffered because of the inadequacy of the inputs. Thus, teachers as well as students found themselves equally alienated from this activity (Mbilinyi,1979:222). It was further revealed that in most schools teachers did not join students in productive or manual labour (ibid). The priority for teachers and students was to complete the over-lengthy and examinable academic syllabus. Saunders and Vulliamy (1982:39-55) identified the teacher as the weakest link in the ESR chain. Without training, hope of reward (or fear of punishment) it was unrealistic to imagine that teachers would radically change their non-innovative, traditional approach to teaching. Teachers and students found it hard to be motivated to take these activities seriously when the latter were not examined like the other subjects. Since the directives had to be carried out, the most teachers did was to supervise the work done by students who had no control over what to produce or how to distribute the proceeds.Amongst the respondents in the interviews,the Head of a Teacher's College said that archaic methodology of teaching was utilized to impart the policy ideals; that not all the three - cognitive, affective and psycho-motor-skills were utilized in coordination to achieve maximum results; and that good policies were given to bad lieutenants. The contradictory nature of these productive activities led to complaints from parents and students of gross exploitation. These activities were isolated from academic course work and were ill-designed to promote any meaningful learning.

Various research studies conducted to evaluate the S-R activities in schools (reference of which has been made elsewhere in the thesis) have largely come to similar conclusions as they have been skilfully documented by Mbilinyi(1976), Mosha(1990), Lema(1972), Omari(1982), Mukyanuzi(1985), Pendaleli(1983), Ishumi(1988), McHenry(1979), Hyden(1979), Samoff(1990), Besha(1973), Pratt(1976) and others. The output was obviously conditioned by the process and the input. Firstly, the economic goal of meeting 25 percent of schools' recurrent cost was not met by most schools. The ILO (1982:112) report said that between 3-5 percent of the cost was met by the revenue from these activities.

Secondly, the academic goal of teaching new practical skills and providing scientific knowledge about the project was hardly fulfilled due to the absence of knowledge amongst teachers and resources in the schools for its effective impartation. Thirdly, the politico-ideological goal of inculcating new values mentioned earlier could hardly be conceived in the above described scenario. In an 1986 report prepared by Cooksey and Ishumi these activities were described to be "tagged on as a non-examined afternoon chore which often served to reinforce the students' distaste for manual labour" (Cooksey and Ishumi,1986:43). Nkonoki's study revealed that students were being used as labourers, developing undesirable attitudes, leading to negative reinforcement (Nkonoki,1977:247). It was further mentioned that it did not help to reinforce the dignity of labour to make manual work the main form of punishment meted out to students.

Therefore although the ESR had emphasized the use of scientific knowledge and skills in productive ventures, in practice these activities often turned out into a drudgery of physical labour, leading to a sacrifice of academic work and financial resources without any tangible results (Mosha,1990:64). Mbunda, writing in the Unesco publication on Tanzania's educational experience said, "the policy came as a directive without regard to the feasibility of its implementation in individual primary schools; nor were the teachers told how to implement it" (Mbunda,1982:91). A study by Besha revealed some of the consequences of these activities:

> One does not wonder therefore to see that S-R activities in schools do not produce the required effect....Because from the beginning nobody has sat down to think out or analyze how best, in details, these S-R activities can be carried out and integrated in the school curriculum; they have been taken in isolation... (Besha,1973:31).

Today many of these grandiose S-R projects are seen abandoned in a dilapidated state and many others have imbibed capitalist practices to run these originally socialist ventures.

5.4. Terminal Basic Education For Majority

The Party policy for primary education, stated in ESR, read:

> The education given in our primary schools must be complete education in itself. It must not continue to be simply a preparation for secondary school. Instead of the primary school activities being geared to the competitive examination which will select the few who go on to secondary school, they must be a preparation for life which

> the majority of the children will lead.... similarly secondary schools must not be simply a selection process....They must prepare people for life and service in the villages and rural areas (Nyerere, ESR pg15).

While primary school may be a universal right, Nyerere emphasized that the only true justification for secondary education in Tanzania was that it was needed by the few for service to the many. The curriculum, as a result, was to cater to provide the relevant skills and attitudes needed to live happily and well in a socialist and predominantly rural society and contribute to the improvement of life there. In determining the syllabus the sight would need to be on the majority.

As a result of the above policy, efforts were made to introduce basic education that had practical elements in the curriculum in order to prepare children for life and adult roles in rural areas. The medium of instruction was switched from English to Swahili in all grant-aided primary schools effective November, 1969 (Education Circular No2 of 1967). This change had far reaching impact on the quality of spoken and written English, which was the medium of instruction at secondary and tertiary levels. Students now lacked the language foundation they used to acquire formerly. Various cosmetic changes were instituted in the curriculum to give it a veneer of functionality. Existing syllabi was partly Africanized (eg. in subjects such as History) and self-reliance activities were introduced in the afternoon. In a review of research sponsored by SIDA, Roy Carr-Hill gave a final evaluation of the changed curriculum:

1. Despite apparently radical changes....the balance remained traditional, centred firmly on the 3Rs.
2. The teaching of English retained its prominent place.
3. Very little emphasis was given to Agriculture.
4. In spite of the political importance given to S-R activities its practice met with difficulties (Carr-Hill,1984:45).

Surprisingly, no formal agriculture syllabus was introduced in schools either in 1969 following the ESR, nor in 1975 following Musoma Resolutions, which urged the merging of theory and practice in schools (Omari and Mosha,1987:86). Curricular changes were often not matched by in-service training and supply of teachers' guides, textbooks, charts and other materials. A senior official in the Commissioner's office confirmed in the interview that there was a lack of personnel well-versed in the policy and that there were hardly any orientation courses/workshops for implementers. Thus there was no one to spearhead the supervision and management of production. Most syllabi emphasized the acquisition of knowledge per se without a corresponding practical component of its functionality. A study conducted by University staff and field officials saw no evidence of ESR principles being considered seriously in classroom teaching, where

only cognitive skills were emphasized (Omari and Mosha,1987). Under the Tanzania National Scientific Research Council (TNSRC) Kam's research in 1977 revealed that "The primary School curriculum has not changed. It continues to prepare pupils for entry to secondary School" (Kam,1977:196). The above report went on to say that the attitudes of parents and pupils alike had not changed towards primary school, which continued to be seen as a stepping stone for further education, and pupils' expectations remained unfulfilled. When interviewed Mrs.Kam strongly felt that Nyerere's policies were excellent but that he was fifty years ahead of his fellow Tanzanians and that ESR was a call for becoming self-reliant in every aspect of one's life.Unfortunately neither did the administrators understand the policies nor did they prepare proper strategies or provide the right exposure to students. The general recommendations of TNSRC/UNICEF research report included a call for urgent drastic changes in the curriculum since it was still geared to the less than 5% who finally made it to secondary school. It also called for efforts to make rural life more attractive and renumerative. The present system, with its continued emphasis on academic subjects and passing examinations at the expense of productivity and functional skills, was found contrary to the precepts of ESR. Manual work and functional skills were not being examined in the primary school leaving exams(PSLE) and as such no serious attempts were made by either the teachers or the students to imbibe the life skills called for in the ESR. The final result was that between 93-97% of the primary school leavers terminated their studies with no specific capabilities for either rural or urban employment. Sumras' 1986 research revealed village schools creating no favourable attitudes towards rural life and at the time of the study most students were either planning or in the process of leaving the villages to seek employment in urban centres. Ishumi's 1983 survey showed that 71.4% of all urban unemployed consisted of primary school graduates. It is believed that had community inputs (by way of views and active participation) been sought at the policy-making and curriculum formulation stage many of the current problems would have been alleviated (Malekela,1985).

From the documentary research conducted on the implementation of ESR in schools it seemed that various factors had contributed to schools' failure in providing the complete education that ESR stipulated. First, the productive activities remained marginal to the curriculum rather than becoming an integral part of it. Second, there was no syllabus or textbooks for teaching practical subjects. Third, these subjects were not examined in PSLE. Fourth, no provisions were made to absorb these school leavers nor were rural areas made attractive for them to want to return there. Fifth, the curriculum and teachers continued to prepare the pupils for exams and further education. Without eliminating both income differentials and competitive selection it was difficult to see how attitudinal changes could be brought or even a socialist society built. Sixth, the general societal values and parental attitudes had remained traditional towards education and no support from this powerful venue was forthcoming to convince children to think otherwise. This area of parental aspirations was gauged in Ishumi's survey of

children's preferences after they left primary schools. Forty four per cent wanted to go to secondary school; 25% to seek paid employment; 11% wanted to repeat Std.VII; 7% wanted to join adult literacy classes; 7% to join National Service and 4% to stay with parents and work on farms (1984:51). In actual fact less than 5% managed to get into secondary schools.

Some commentators have looked at this no-change attitude in schools within the framework of a class analysis. They argued that the bureaucratic class in charge of these curriculum changes felt threatened to let education reflect an ideology that gave prominence to the masses in preference to the dominant elite group. Thus the overpowering modernisationist perspective of the bureaucracy and educators was seen as resisting any drastic and unorthodox measures (Samoff,1990). From the documentary literature on the subject it seems that as long as schooling remains the principal vehicle for better quality of life, social mobility, prestige and power; in other words, as long as its chief concern remains that of skills and selection then any amount of rhetoric propagated about social transformation cannot make primary schools provide 'basic' education that is complete in itself and that prepares people for rural life.

Two more plausible perspectives to consider for the limited success of the policies are: 1) Tanzania's policy-making falls under the 'elite-model'of the typologies described in the previous chapter, where the political elite shapes public opinion on policy questions, where public officials and administrators merely carry out those policies. Because of such a strategy, where societal views were not given enough voice, no far-reaching qualitative results have emerged out its implementation (Omari and Mosha,1987:30). A second very down-to-earth factor could be discerned in the innate incapacity of many of the technocrats and bureaucrats to innovate a dynamic program and test it out for its workability. These and other possible causes contributing to the inefficacy of the policy goals will be analyzed and interpreted in greater detail in the next chapter but for the present we will end this section with a question similar to the one asked by Philip Foster 22 years ago: Can any primary school prepare young people (11-14 years old) for a vocational career using a traditional curriculum and hope its products to be and able to play adult roles in rural areas?

5.5 Diversification and Vocationalization of Secondary Schools

One of Nyerere's strongest wishes was to see students involving themselves fully in the production process while they were still at schools. This seemed like a perfectly sensible goal to aspire for. He had said:

> As a nation we have no excuse whatsoever for failing to give a chance to the thousands of able-bodied young men and women to participate

> fully in the production process, particularly those who are in the secondary schools and other institutions of higher learning. We have not given them an opportunity to combine theory with practice, and in so doing we have made our students believe that they have a right not to work (Musoma Declaration, p.3.).

During the last two decades many developing countries have tried to diversify their secondary school curricula by introducing pre-vocational subjects along with the academic. However, policy-making has been largely based on the intuitive assumption that vocationalization of school curriculum leads to better employment opportunities and outcomes. Originally the idea was conceived when it was realized that there existed a fundamental mis-match or lack-of-fit between the type of education offered at conventional schools and the skills and other characteristics required of students in the world of work (Psacharopoulos,1986:2). There was however, to date, little conclusive empirical evidence to confirm or reject the hypotheses in favour of these vocationally oriented schools.

King (1986) identified at least three types of diversification taking place around the same period in Tanzanian Schools. The first began with the ESR (later reinforced by Musoma Declaration of 1974) which underlined the diversification away from the purely academic subjects to more practical ones. The agenda behind this was partly to bring about political socialization and infuse positive attitudes to manual work and partly to reduce the Ministry's contribution to recurrent expenditure. The second area of diversification was in the realm of selection and assessment procedures, away from the exclusively academic to an assessment that included work experience, work attitudes etc. This is dealt with at length in the next section. The third area of diversification was towards rural self-employment of secondary school graduates, and away from urban sectors. Our concern for the moment is with the first type only.

In 1972 secondary schools began the process of 'vocationalization', a term used interchangeably with 'diversification'. To the purely academic oriented curriculum, career-oriented course specializations, namely agricultural, technical, commercial and home economics were added. From these four categories or 'biases' each school was given a specialization of at least one bias. Thus out of 85 public vocational schools on the mainland 47% became agricultural, 33% commercial, 13% technical and 7% had home economics as their specialization, the last being exclusively attended by girls (1981/82 Budget Speech). In accordance with the 1972 Manpower Report to the President and the Proposal of 1973, the objectives of this innovation were:

1. To attempt to enhance the implementation of ESR.
2. To make students productive, both while they were at school and also immediately after they left school.

3. To provide a useful background for those who joined industry or crafts and technical institutes of training.
4. To give pupils the necessary skills and attitudes for them to become productive members of Ujamaa Villages.
5. To inculcate the value of work and study, thereby diffusing any elitist tendencies acquired as a result of their education.
6. To match the supply of middle-level skills with the manpower requirement (Pendaeli,1983:8).

When pupils were about to finish their primary education they put down three choices of secondary schools of their preference although most would not be aware of the particular vocational specialization offered by the schools of their choice. Their primary concern was to be selected and be part of the 2 to 5% of those who did get the chance to continue formal studies. Their choices, however, pre-determined at an early age their future expected careers and the follow-up training courses if any.

When this major reform decision for vocationalization was taken, it was immediately accompanied by Ministry's 'request document' to foreign donors for funding (ME,1973). It was expected that each school would be equipped with special facilities relevant to its specialization. Laboratories and workshops were to be built or expanded. Teachers trained in the relevant specializations were to be recruited from other Ministries. It was also expected that all those directly concerned - teachers, curriculum developers, evaluators etc. would be actively involved in the implementation exercise. A needs assessment from the peasants was to determine what would be taught. This pragmatic approach was to be applied to the quality and relevance of both the theory and practical work to be undertaken, including the examination of these subjects.

As early as 1974 a major workshop on education made a critical analysis of the project and made the following observations: 1). The program was still oriented towards preparing pupils for the competitive examinations. The specializations were not linked to actual productive work in school or in the community. Furthermore, the relationship between the goals of diversification and those of manpower planning was not clear. 2). There seemed to exist no detailed realistic plan of operation. 3). Major changes in some schools and colleges were observed to take place on the "spur of the moment basis" (Mwobahe and Mbilinyi,1974:30-33).

Mukyanuzi's (1985) research on the implementation of this reform showed that most of the envisioned changes were not accomplished except for the assigning of the biases and the building of the laboratories and workshops (Mukyanuzi,1985:60). It was also observed that there was limited success in the changes brought about in the curriculum: most syllabi still reflected the needs of those going for further studies or going for urban employment. The examinations, too, failed to give due

weight to testing competence in vocational subjects. The problems therefore seemed to be the unchanging curricular processes, content irrelevancies, inadequate evaluation, inappropriate selection and allocation mechanisms, and undue central control of the Ministry.

We have so far examined the objectives and the rationale and stated objectives of vocational secondary educational reform. We have also briefly reviewed its implementation and attempted to identify some of the contradictions therein. We now need to consider the criteria used to measure the potential advantages stemming from diversification and review a few of the research studies conducted in the area. The evaluation conducted by World Bank in 1986 took a random sample of 14,000 secondary students in the diversification program in Colombia and Tanzania. Four main criteria were used:

1. Access to secondary education (equity).
2. Cognitive learning outcomes (internal efficiency).
3. Labour market outcomes (external efficiency).
4. Cost-effectiveness (economic efficiency).

Results indicated that relative to the schools offering only conventional curriculum, the diversified schools recruit more students from poorer origins and they impart higher cognitive skills. However, these graduates cost more to educate and despite their superior cognitive skills did not find work more easily nor did they earn more than their counterparts(Table 4). Saunders (1982) found that there was limited meaningful socially productive work done at school while the practicals only illustrated an aspect of the academic subject rather than working knowledge of the activity. The following studies on the subject are acknowledged: Psacharopoulos(1986), King(1986), Omari, I (1982) Pendaeli, E (1983), Mukyanuzi (1985), Saunders (1982), The Ministry of Labour and Manpower Development (1984), Psacharopoulas and Loxley (1985), Cooksey and Ishumi (1986).

Secondary education is both expensive and scarce, especially in Tanzania. In the light of that, efficient program evaluation and open feed-back system was absolutely essential. If the goals set for secondary education (like service to the many) were not being fulfilled then the objectives needed to be reformulated or its structure reorganised, irrespective of whether this was based on the grounds of efficiency or equity.

The World Bank invested 2.3 billion dollars in diversification programmes worldwide between 1970 and 1980. In 1984, the World Bank officially announced its decision to stop supporting the diversification program in Tanzania following the negative report from its evaluation. Psacharopoulus and Loxley (1985:7-36) in concluding their voluminous report, specified where diversification program should not be offered: 1. When the country's secondary school system is very selective (less

than 20% attending). 2. Where implementation capacity is very low. 3. When unit cost of keeping a diversified student in school is 2 or 3 times higher than that of a conventional student. All the three conditions seemed to apply to Tanzania:

> Diversification and Vocationalization can be written off as a 2.3 billion dollar experiment which failed. Most of the dollars ended up in the pockets of building contractors and the manufacturers of laboratory equipment and workshop tools, but have to be paid back out of the export earnings of some of the poorest countries in the world, including Tanzania (where incidentally large-scale borrowing is completely contrary to the spirit of self-reliance expounded in ESR) (Cooksey and Ishumi,1987:54).

5.6 Role Of Examinations

Commenting on the role of examinations Nyerere raised the following pertinent query in the ESR:

> It is difficult to see why the present examination system should be regarded as sacrosanct....There is no reason why Tanzania should not combine an examination which is based on the things we teach, with a teacher and pupil assessment of work done for the school and community. (Nyerere,ESR:71)

Along with the curricular changes, ESR suggested that examinations should be downgraded in society's esteem, since they largely assessed a person's ability to memorise facts and did not always succeed in assessing character, power to reason or willingness to serve (ibid). Thus strategies were designed to revamp the assessment procedures so as to dampen individualistic motivation and prevent discrimination against those from disadvantaged backgrounds. Nyerere even wanted the student's self-reliant behaviour to be assessed.

The Minister of Education strongly attacked the traditional formal examinations as an outmoded colonial hangover. Later that year in 1971 Tanzania withdrew from the Cambridge Local Examination Syndicate and established national exams for Forms IV and VI. Although this move helped reduce dependency and increase local control of curriculum it did not lead to a departure from the historically entrenched examinations syndrome. A National Examination Council was established in 1973 and given the mandate to formulate examination policy in accordance with the principles of ESR (The Daily News, Nov. 14, 1973). The Party conference of 1974 led to the issuance of a directive that stipulated the basis for assessment: 1. Written examinations 2. Classroom performance 3. Attitudes

towards work and service 4. Performance of work. These had to be continuously assessed. By 1976 a reformed examination system was well in place that included continual assessment combined with affective aspects like character, cooperation with others and productive work. A major drawback in an otherwise promising change was that assessment was completely controlled by subject teachers with no student participation (Mbilinyi,1980:22). Primary school examinations were not altered along the same lines and they continued to rely primarily on written multiple-choice examination of the four core subjects - English, Swahili, Mathematics and General Knowledge.

Although Nyerere asked for major changes in the assessment procedures and although an institutional framework was put in place for those changes to occur, in practice very minor importance was given to character and work attitudes in the total assessment compared to the written academic aspects. For example:

> A mere 0.1 percent of the 13,340 students who sat for examination in 1976 qualified in the academic section but failed to receive a certificate because of their low character assessment (Court and Kinyanjui, 1978:72)

Thus while continuous assessments were recorded in secondary schools, their impact was minimal on the final selection. The present examinations tend to measure:

1. Skills at taking the exams.
2. Ability to memorise and reproduce factual knowledge.
3. Ability to secure supplementary educational assistance outside of formal schooling.
4. Size of student's fiscal resource arsenal.

There were other problems and loopholes in the selection procedure. Corruption and bribery had penetrated the education system like in the other facets of economic life. 'Crude manipulation takes place, such as selling of examination papers which occurs annually' (Mbilinyi,1979:223). Many students of middle class parents and of bureaucrats could afford private tutoring; repeat standard VII or use the private schools as a stepping stone to further their education. At home the parents still pressed the child to study for the exams. The system was so highly selective and rewarding that no amount of political rhetoric helped change people's perceptions. Ronald Dore gives a pertinent Tanzanian example in his Diploma Disease. A primary school headmaster in Dar-es-Salaam told him that for two years running no child from his two-stream class of 90 got into secondary school. The children lost respect for the teachers and in fact went on to break all windows of the school. In the end the headmaster had to be transferred (Dore,1976:120).

It is a sad fact that many of Nyerere's ideas were either misunderstood, partially implemented or given a cosmatic treatment. No one, for example, seemed to remember his suggestion that pupils should take part in the assessment of their fellow pupils. An examination of the sample papers from 1968 to 1973 by Mbilinyi (1976) confirmed that even within the written examinations it was rote memory that was being tested and not fundamental understanding or interpretation. Written examinations continued to function as the sole criteria for selecting candidates for secondary and tertiary levels. Unfortunately its backwash effects were such that teaching remained exam-centred and pupils studied for the examinations. However, although examinations relied on memorization and tended to be punitive in nature, there were limitations to what could effectively replace them without undue disruption to the education system. There were suggestions of aptitude tests as a replacement. However it would be difficult for Tanzania to introduce new models of sophisticated evaluation when it could hardly manage the traditional ones. Even the policy suggested in ESR was not working partly because of the difficulty of objectifying character and attitude assessment. It would be merely replacing one set of criteria based on academic merit with another equally difficult set of rubrics whose impartiality was even more questionable (Foster,1969:86). People need to believe that the selection system is 'just' and objective and based on merit rather than on whims or mushy ideas" (ibid). Maintaining the integrity of the present system, which has more chances of remaining objective, would be, for Tanzania, a great achievement since corruption infused a new dimension of exacerbating the unequal treatment to the affluent and powerful sections of the society. At times those with power block and occupy places thereby depriving the deserving students of their rightful places in secondary schools.

5.7 Integration Between School and Community

In a critical examination of the colonial system of education Nyerere reiterated the fact that:

> Tanzania's education is such as to divorce its participants from the society it is supposed to be preparing them for....there must be a parallel and integrated change in the way our schools are run, so as to make them and their habitants a real part of our society and our economy. Schools must,in fact, become communities and communities which practice the precept of self-reliance (Nyerere,ESR:1967).

Various definitions of this concept of integration need to be examined in order to fully appreciate Tanzania's effort in this area. According to one definition integration of school and community is interpreted to mean linking the school with the world of work. The learner here is involved in part-study part-work and moves between the academic studies and the practical world. This has been tried in many

countries including Tanzania. The second type of integration is seen to link the content of the curriculum to the practical application. This means the syllabi are oriented towards their application to the practical world, where knowledge for its own sake or abstract knowledge is seen as a luxury. Tanzania's secondary school vocationalization program partly fits into this category. The third approach maintains that content must arise from the practical problems and survival needs facing the community at any given point in time. The curriculum is directly related to the day-to-day and long-term issues concerning the community, and is therefore relevant,practical,functional and utilitarian. This principle was applied in Tanzania prior to the introduction of formal education where emphasis in all informal learning was on providing life skills both for economic survival and socialization purposes. Some of the most effective learning has taken place through this approach (Mmari,1977:281).

Like all other educational reform efforts in Tanzania, this too suffered from a lack of planned strategies with systematic assessment of program needs worked out prior to the policy pronouncements. An official from the Commissioner's office, responding in the interview to the question on the major constraints that shaped the policy and practice, commented that not only was the founder's policy statement poorly interpreted but that there was a lack of planning prior to the implementation. Political platitudes of the bureaucrats only repeated the policy statements without involving the students, teachers, parents, educators, planners, engineers, villagers, donors etc in drawing feasibility studies and even undertaking a critique of the value and rationale of any innovation. The passivity of the populace in relation to the profusion of the (former) president's political pronouncements was preposterous. In practice then, few ESR activities and projects involved the surrounding community in any direct way (Kerner,1984:19). Almasi (1985:27) found that in the four agricultural biased schools he studied:

> School/community integration tended to take place on an ad hoc basis and not through laid down policy statements....school teachers and students were no longer participating in literacy classes. Further, schools in the sample did not operate projects in collaboration with village communities. There was also lack of representation by either side in each other's committees.

School committees, made up of parents, teachers and others ostensibly existed in all schools, although many were, defunct, meeting only once a year. However, these committees did not have a regular advisory, let alone executive function. As a result parents were usually ignorant of what went on in school, let alone participating in it. Dubbledam (1970) noted the apathy on the part of parents and 'sabotage' on the part of teachers as responsible for this lack of integration. Many teachers were against these meetings because they thought 'parents, mostly uneducated people talked about matters of which they had no idea' (Dubbledam,

1970:143).

Part of the problem seemed to be the bureaucratic control exercised by the Ministry in the decision-making process in the schools regarding staffing, curriculum, exams, finance etc. The Presidential Commission of 1984 recognised this over-centralized control from the Ministry Headquarters and the resultant delays in essential decisions and services, where "teachers and other staff think that school heads do not have the necessary authority over their institutions" (MOE,1984:41-2). A member of this Presidential Commission interviewed, elaborated on the above when she said it was necessary to involve teachers to formulate action plans, modify curriculum, to facilitate the integration of manual work or job skills in the timetable, and merge theory with practice. However instead of charting out a scientific way of implementing the policy, 'guidelines' and 'directives' kept on descending in a "management by crisis" situation. When it came to decision-making the question of community participation, influence or control was seldom or never raised at all (Cooksey and Ishumi,1987:44). Ironically, it was the private sector that exhibited a meaningful community influence on the form and content of schooling since private schools were usually locally planned, constructed, staffed and financed. There is strong evidence that points to the fact that parents and villagers were enthusiastic about being involved in setting and changing educational policy (Mbilinyi,1974).This is contrary to what was said in one of the interviews where a headmistress of a girls' school strongly believed Nyerere had to do the work of formulating the policy alone since Tanzanians were not ready to participate in that colossal task in those early years of independence. The extreme uniformity of curricula, final exams etc is striking in a country that espouses participatory democracy and critical thinking. It is difficult to see in Tanzania sufficient flexibility for the 'community' and the school to interact and take decisions for bringing about meaningful change in the village life. Thus Ishumi (1974) reported on a research project involving 140 schools in Bagamoyo, Arusha and Masai districts:

> Not a single school was found to have formulated its syllabus 'substantially or partially' with representatives of the community. There was no 'conscious, purposive or functional interaction' between the school and the community (p253).

The bureaucracy at the Ministry seemed to lack the foresight, the imaginative and innovative capacity to evolve viable strategies, to let go of that control. This was amply confirmed by some of the respondents in the interviews. The degree of centralized policy-making exceeded central capacities to evolve strategies, far less to monitor implementation. There seemed to be a continuous vacillation between reliance on mass support and distrust of mass participation (Samoff,1990:203).

Lastly, mention must be made of the famous, near-successful experiments in integration of school and community, namely the Litowa, Kibaha and Kwamsisi Projects. (See Toroka,1973;Baume,1982; and Kilimhana,1975). Kwamsisi was a pilot project of school-community interaction that represented a significant departure from other schools in Tanzania. Children were on a village farm rather than an isolated school. Villagers participated by teaching some local subjects. Most of the costs of the school were met by the village itself. Kwamsisi had developed many non-farm economic activities. Kilimhana's research in 1975 revealed some inconsistencies, one of them being in the area of school-community link. According to this research the community seemed to provide minimum opportunities for the actualization of youths' potential skills and newly acquired positive attitudinal development. Their self-reliant, cooperative and creative abilities and attitudes were thwarted by the villagers. Elsewhere in other villages many parents generally wanted their children to use the school as an instrument for getting away from rural areas into jobs in the formal sector (Foster,1969). This demonstrates the absolute need for all sections of the society to cooperate in fulfilling the goals of the policy. In any case, on the basis of the experience of Litowa and Kibaha the Second 5-year plan (1969-74) called for the transformation of primary schools into community education centres. However, these isolated examples of relative successes in no way represented the thousands of schools that built no such bridges with the surrounding communities (Carr-Hill,1984:54), We leave this section with a last quote from Chamunwana:

> Thus the school still continues to initiate students into elitism and the masses continue to be alienated. The agonizing vertical linkage between the educated and the peasant is an oppressive relationship which hinders the desired socio-political transformation. (Chamungwana, 1974:17)

5.8 Inculcation of Socialist Values And Attitudes.

The new role of education in Tanzania was defined thus:

> The basic aim of our education is the development of socialist attitudes... Musoma Resolution 1974.

Following the above stipulated aim,the objectives of education as enumerated by Nyerere in ESR were:

> The education system in Tanzania must emphasize cooperative endeavour, not individual advancement; it must stress concepts of equality and responsibility to give service [it] must counteract the

> temptation to intellectual arrogance..[it] must encourage three things: an inquiring mind, an ability to learn from what others do...and a basic confidence (ESR, 1967:4).

It seems evident that many of Nyerere's proposals concerning SR activities, school-community integration and education for service were all geared towards a major effort at political socialization (Foster,1969). According to Coleman (1965:18) political socialization refers to "that process by which individuals acquire attitudes and feelings towards the political system and towards their role in it." The process has at least three stages:

1. Acquiring knowledge of the way the political system works.
2. Developing feelings (positive or negative) about the system.
3. Creating the intention and acquiring competence to participate actively in it.

The socialization function of children is shared by both the school and society (including parents and peer group). There are various ways in which a government can initiate a process of political socialization using schools as the main tool. The first is to take over control of the schools and its curriculum. Second, it can make indigenous the curriculum content by replacing foreign oriented subject matter with more relevant and 'ideologically correct' material. Third, it can introduce new subjects with the explicit purpose of inculcating the new ideology. Fourth, it can change the pedagogy to a more dynamic style consistent with the principles of the new ideology. And fifth, introduce a practical component in the curriculum and create possible role-models for children to learn by doing and example. All the above methods have been used to a greater or lesser extent in Tanzania.

Political education is taught starting third grade and the course consists mainly of information about the Party, the government and the socialist policy. In later years it includes an "unsophisticated development/dependency theory, a potted history of Africa and a formalistic though dithyrambic description" of the institutions of the state and Party (Cooksey and Ishumi,1987:42). Mbilinyi describes graphically the methodology used in Tanzanian schools: The teacher reads out national policy statements and Party principles word for word; the pupils copy these in their notebooks and memorise them in order to parrot them the following day. She contends pupils leave school without being able to identify the meaning of capitalism and socialism (1974:140).

As far as the changes in the pedagogy and organization of schools for the purpose of inculcating the new values and attitudes was concerned, it was found that authoritarianism and competitive individualism thrived with little training in problem solving, critical thinking and cooperative living. Mbilinyi's long-term extensive research led her to conclude that:

> In a situation of domination and subordination, where democratic procedures of policy-making and lesson evaluation are not followed, self-confident citizens capable of making their own decisions and unafraid to criticize leadership...will not be produced. Self-confidence, cooperation, critical thinking and creativity - these attributes do not fall from heaven. They arise from social practice (1979:221).

The teachers felt they were made to teach a curriculum they did not design, preach an ideology they didn't cherish, and supervise an activity they were not trained for. Elietinize (1981) found that neither the teachers nor the students were highly motivated towards political education and the teaching suffered from poor syllabus, lack of resource materials and trained teachers. Ishumi reports of a survey conducted in 1971 of 102 teachers of which 70% had no clear idea of what political education was, and almost all shunned teaching the subject. The teachers formed one of the weakest link in the chain. In most schools they did not themselves join students in productive manual labour and prefer to supervise with a cane in hand rather than a hoe (Mbilinyi, 1979:222). A teacher who did not himself practice equality or participatory discourse, and used manual labour as a punishment could hardly have convinced pupils of the value of egalitarianism or the dignity of labour. David Court, in his conclusion of a related discussion on Tanzania, said:

> Didactic styles of teaching, authoritarian and hierarchal relationships, and bureaucratic styles of work provide a standing contrast to the ideals of cooperation, participation and democracy which the students know are the ideals for decision-making and organisation within the schools (1976:678).

The above documentary support leads us to conclude that most of the strategies applied in schools for political socialization remained largely ineffective. The Government paper, The Daily News lamented editorially in 1973 that "Education for Self-Reliance is not working" (February,13). Reiterating this situation, Lionel Cliffe (1972) said school children were socialized into values which were basically dysfunctional to the socialist society that was being planned (pg.220).

In the following chapter we shall attempt to examine what were some of the critical issues raised by the various studies evaluating Tanzania's efforts at political socialization in schools. Also, we shall attempt an analysis of some of the constraints and causes responsible for the non-fulfilment of the vision of achieving socialism and self-reliance by a revolution through education.

5.9 Decentralization, Participation And Democracy.

Emphasizing the need for the people to take control of their lives, the Party

Guidelines declared:

> Any action that gives them [the people] more control of their own affairs is an action for development, even if it does not offer them better health or more bread..... (TANU Guidelines,1971:6).

As a corollary to the above, ESR had made a similar demand in the educational area:

> The pupils must be able to participate in decisions and learn by mistakes....the idea of planning must be taught in the classroom and related to the farm; the whole school should join the programming of a year's work, and the breakdown of responsibility (Nyerere,ESR:57).

In Tanzania the theme of participation was ideologically so prominent that at times development was virtually defined in terms of mass participation. According to Nyerere, development brought freedom provided it was development of the people. "But people cannot be developed; they can only develop themselves" (Nyerere,1973:60). He further argued that there could be no socialism without democracy since underlying both was the principle of equality. It was an attempt to give the people their own socialism rather than waiting for the central government to do it.

In order to implement this vital principle, first, in 1971 the Party's "Mwongozo" Guidelines theoretically opened the way for workers participation and control by forbidding arrogant, extravagant, contemptuous and oppressive leaders. However, in spite of this official line of encouragement the state clamped down hard on workers who took these guidelines literally and organised a series of strikes in 1972-3, revealing the petty-bourgeois content of its socialism (Shivji,1976:23-5). Second, in 1972 the Party's Annual Conference adopted a major policy of Decentralization which underlined the conception of 'development from below.' It was defined as the process of devolution and deconcentration and was intended to extend peasant participation, increase bureaucratic efficiency and facilitate planning (Nyerere,1972). Third, in 1974 came the Musoma Resolutions where further changes were made in the field of education to hasten the effort at preparing the total population for enhanced participation. Finally in 1975 the government passed the Villages and Ujamaa Villages Act which provided the legal basis for the establishment of village assemblies and village councils to be elected by the assembly.

Montgomery and Esman have identified nine objectives advanced by the proponents of participation, which include: 1. It promotes commitment to the system which comes as a result of participating in making decisions. 2.It increases group organisation for self-help and collective efforts. 3. It enhances administrative

efficiency. 4. It makes communication patterns easy. 5. It promotes self-satisfaction. 6. It boosts the power of people to exert pressure on public administrators (1971:374-78). The collective impact of the above variables was expected to increase people's self-confidence, democracy and productivity.

Effective popular participation depends by and large on a) the commitment of the political leadership towards achieving that goal and b) existence of formalized institutions providing for its effective functioning (Baguma,1977:52). In the final analysis the success of any operation at bringing about popular participation would probably depend on the nature of the mix and interplay of some of the following variables: form of participation (direct or indirect), level (cell, ward, regional or national), scope (popular, legal, executive), resources (expertise, finance, infrastructure etc), ability to participate effectively (knowledge, will, awareness).

Unfortunately in Tanzania, with decentralization new chains of commands appeared which caused administrative and other problems. To give but one example, the Regional Education Officer (REO) was now responsible to Regional Development Director (RDD) but he was also answerable to the education headquarters, and at times the two authorities issued contradictory directives. To date however, the hierarchial, administrative school structure has remained largely in tact (Maliyamkono,1983:276). Mention has been made of the alienation felt by the students, teachers, parents, peasants, workers and other groups. Despite extensive rhetoric extolling citizen participation not much progress was made in developing detailed programs of how that widened participation could in fact be encouraged. There seemed to be a fear that increased political participation would bring a more vigorous articulation of community needs and a surfacing of the gross inconsistencies, inefficiencies and corruption among those in authority. There is a Swahili saying that translates, 'let the sleeping dog lie for if you wake him you will go down'.

Whatever political consciousness had taken place in schools as a result of the decentralization policy, in turn generated a deluge of demands that were difficult to fulfil. In spite of the 1974 initiatives at Musoma, there remained a need to remove various institutional inflexibilities and rigidities (Okoh,1980:197). While the teachers felt the repressive powers of those above them, they in turn refused to relinquish those powers in their relationships with students. As a result all major decisions and curriculum design remained over-centralized including the supply of new instructional materials. While Nyerere conceded at one point that the core of the educative process was critical consciousness and rational autonomy, in ESR he unequivocally laid down the purpose of education which, according to him, was the transmission of knowledge on the basis of preconceived truths and norms (Okoh,1981:198). Mbilinyi observed the paradox between the precepts and practice and noted how the coercive and repressive ideological apparatus were relied upon

to increase social control:

> A high degree of coercion is found within the so-called ideological apparatus of schooling, for example, caning...as a mode of control...the emphasis on student discipline and punishment of student resistance to the hierarchial authoritarian structure of the school by expulsion from the national school system. (Mbilinyi,1979:226)

Teachers represented a powerful parental authority on academic and non-academic affairs. A chain of hierarchial relationships among students themselves linked them to the overall structure of school. There was still a widely prevalent general acquiescence towards those in authority that had to be overcome. Nyerere admitted in 1971 to two persistent flaws: first, students were not adequately involved in planning and in deciding their own affairs. Second, schools were not adequately integrated into the communities of which they were to be a part.

Among the frustrated groups involved were the parents whose apathy was noted by Dubbledam in his research. The parents' powerlessness in relation to the school and the Ministry was symbolic of the persistent hierarchial and authoritarian relationships that continued to exist in all facets of Tanzanian institutional life in spite of all the various major policy changes, conferences, political speeches and global efforts put in this experiment.

In the absence of effective and meaningful participation there were no adequate and convincing reasons to hope that those in power would for long be responsive to popular needs.

5.10 Reducing Inequalities

> The essence of socialism is the practical acceptance of human equality....equality of opportunity for all citizens.... (Nyerere 1967:103).

Nyerere told a gathering that while some countries believe that development could only come by having a middle-class, 'we shall be a nation of equals' (The Tanganyika Standard,11th Feb.1967:1). Socialist educational policy was partly aimed at reducing inequalities of access to basic education. The abolition of primary school fees in 1973 was aimed at reducing enrolment inequalities. The urgent implementation of universal primary education was an effort at ensuring that at least social differentiation based on educational attainment amongst the majority was minimized though there would be other mitigating variables affecting the realization of equality of opportunities between various groups in society (Mohiddin,1981:160). Indeed, efforts were also made to address to most of the areas

of inequalities, namely, gender, rural/urban, ethnic/tribal, regional, class and economic differences between groups and individuals.

1. **Gender:** The development of a country is partly determined by the position given to its women. The under-representation of girls in educational institutions has been a matter of concern for politicians and educators like Mbilinyi who, in her research of Mwanza and Tanga districts found that a significant fraction of the statistical variance was accounted for by an expressed attitude of boy-preference (Mbilinyi,1973:6). Recent trends however show that there has been a slow but steady increase in the proportion of girls at many levels. Moreover the disparity between sexes is now relatively small compared to other African countries (Carr-HIll,1984:24). Today, at entry into primary school, girls and boys are admitted in equal numbers, which certainly is a major accomplishment for Tanzania. Affirmative action was taken in several areas to reduce the gap: the 1974 requirement that students must have two years' work experience before university admission, was waived for female students in order not to depress female enrolment. The Presidential Commission on education proposed as a policy goal, the elimination of gender inequalities in secondary and higher education (1984:11). As mentioned earlier, any new secondary school, as a policy, must be either a girls' school or a co-educational school (Msekwa and Maliyamkono,1979:30).

2. **Regional:** Affirmative action was also applied to correct regional imbalances by way of special allocations to districts and regions that were deemed disadvantaged. By 1974/75 the quota system had been introduced. The bureaucracy seemed to have become a defender of public good rather than one of selfish personal interest. Cooksey and Ishumi however, in their critical analysis of ESR policy implementation claimed that the net effect of the general quota system was to:

    1. Fill form I places with children who had little chance of catching up with more competitive students.
    2. Afford opportunities for favouritism to educational administrators and influential parents.
    3. Deny places to pupils who would have passed otherwise in favour of those who would inevitably fail at a later stage anyway (Cooksey and Ishumi,1986:18).

Although government policy is to build new secondary schools in under-represented regions, private schools have followed demand patterns1. Thus the overall regional distribution in the last two decades had continued to be inequitable. Table 3 shows the regional distribution of public and private schools . By 1984 one-forth of all secondary schools and fully 42% of all private secondary schools were

in Kilimanjaro Region, whose residents made up 5.3% of the total mainland Tanzania population. Students of this region constituted 27.7% of all Form V pupils in Tanzania in 1982 (Samoff,1990.211). In ethnic terms the Chagga constituted 20.5% of those entering form V (grade 13) (Cooksey and Ishumi,1986:17,28).

3. **Rural/Urban:** Malekela's research is a major source of information on tribal, rural/urban and religious inequalities (1983). He ran an important study of nearly 3000 state school students in Form IV, and among his findings was this that it was definitely advantageous educationally to be born in urban areas. In a situation where approximately 90% of the population lived in rural areas, almost 25% of the Form IV students came from urban areas (1983:140). The mammoth UPE programme constituted a major effort at rural development and transformation, whereby 93% of school age children were enroled in Standard 1 by 1978 (MTUU,1979:20). In secondary schools however, a disproportionate number of children were from urban areas and who were the sons and daughters of bureaucrats and 'experts' (Mbilinyi,1979:223). As for the provision of resources, urban areas had more trained teachers, more facilities, more textbooks and teaching materials. Since the quota system only worked on a regional level it did not distinguish between different family backgrounds and children from wealthier homes again had an advantage. Private schools complicated matters further since now only those regions (and individuals) being able to afford could have extra access to education.

4. **Ethnic/Tribal:** Tribal or ethnic differences have never been given much attention in Tanzania. 'Region' is merely a surrogate for tribal or ethnic group and reflects really the politics of ethnic balance.Major overt racial inequalities on the other hand were eradicated soon after independence. It is however interesting to compare the ethnic origin of some students. Among Form V students the Wachagga and Pare, who account for only 7% of the total population approximately, formed 27% of the total sample. The students included in the Quota system are weeded out at the Form IV level and unequal proportions reinstated.

5. **Socio-economic Class:** In his analysis of class formation and reproduction in the Kilimanjaro region, Joel Samoff (1979) argued that "differential access to education has been manipulated in Tanzania to ensure the reproduction of a local ruling class" (p.68). There seemed to be a probability that inequalities between regions and between gender was associated with inequalities between social strata.

Mbilinyi (1973) showed the linkages in Tanzania between the educational structure and class formation between generations. In analyzing enrolment

variations between households she found 1) Father's formal education and occupation had an effect on children's enrolment, and also 2) Opportunity cost of releasing children from the household farm labour force had important ramifications. Malekela (1983) analyzed the family background of a large sample of pupils in secondary schools and reported that despite the Quota system there were 12 times as many children of high status parents in Form IV than one might expect from their representation in the population. In general then children from higher socio-economic background had greater educational opportunities. However, Tanzania has recorded some successes in bringing greater equality of access in primary education as between sexes and to a lesser extent between regions and urban/rural areas. Having said that, it has to be admitted that Tanzania's education system is markedly elitist in that only 2-3% of the primary school children manage to gain admission to secondary schools and less than 20% of these manage to go to Form V. The private secondary schools have been widely used by children of the elite to gain access to further education and as a means of eventual back door entry into the state system. The bureaucratic elite in the Ministry and elsewhere in the government wanted to convince the people the need to accept primary education as terminal for the masses but not for their own children. Thus while official response was one of equalizing economic status, actual educational practice implicitly served to secure acceptance of objective inequalities (Court,1984:272). Cooksey and Ishumi (1986) argued that the effect of policy formulation and implementation in the area of social equity had been insignificant and this at great cost to quality and efficiency: the worst of both the worlds (pg.9). At the same time, regional differences were highly politicized while other social cleavages like religion, race, class and gender are given unequal treatment since they were deemed politically less significant (Samoff,1990:236). The Presidential Commissions's main concerns were quality and meeting popular demand rather than equality and meeting Party demands; this suggests that Nyererian influence on education policy was now dwindling rapidly.

> His frank recognition that ESR goals are nowhere near being met in education could be generalized across the whole policy spectrum (Cooksey and Ishumi,1986:31).

Samoff seems convinced in his researched conclusion that access to education in Tanzania has been the proximate determinant of class differentiation and despite efforts to overcome this, education and class situation have continued to be firmly linked (Samoff,1979:47-69). Thus in spite of good intentions, Nyerere's educational reforms have continued to present problems with no sign of a reversal: the practice has remained elitist in nature as seen by the shape of the educational pyramid and in the light of the tremendous mushrooming of private schools. Going by the experiences of Soviet Union, Tanzania, Ghana etc., commentators like Court (1979), Morrison (1976), Dobson (1980), Ishumi (1986) etc. have come to similar conclusions that inequality is difficult, indeed almost impossible to eradicate, even if basic social structures are changed. Bowles and Gintis go a step further to tell us that

in fact education has never been a potent force for equality (1976:8).

Having explicated Tanzania's performance in implementing changes in the eight action areas identified by the ESR policy statement a general conclusion that is derived is that there was a clear gap between the ideals and the implementation seen in society and schools. While there were some similarities between the strategy formation style and methods of implementation, ideology stood apart. Different sets of actors played key roles at all the three distinct levels of the experiment.

The interviews gave further credence to the documentary findings and concurred on the issue of the existence of a discrepancy between rhetoric and reality. The interviews further provided added insights into some of the possible causes of the lack of success of the ESR policies. It was made fairly clear that the ideology resulted in policies that were in the first place not well understood and interpreted and in the second, not well tested for their applicability to the needs of the people. Furthermore no prior macro-level feasibility studies had been conducted to objectively assess the material, manpower and psychological inputs that were necessary in order to derive the type of outputs envisioned by the political elite.

As a result of this mismatch, policy implementation turned out to be erratic and haphazard with little comprehensiveness and accountability. In the next and final chapter a critical analysis of the gathered data is undertaken to evaluate not only the validity of the basis of Nyerere's brand of Socialism but also to evaluate the strategy formation and implementation style adopted by those in power. Finally a synthesis of the probable causes of the ineffectuality of the AD and ESR policies is attempted.

END NOTES

1. Private secondary schools which were seen as a major threat to Tanzania's egalitarian goals were later seen as partial solution to the insatiable demand for secondary schools. By mid 1980's private secondary schools and students out numbered their government counterparts in Tanzania (Samoff:Table 7.9)

CHAPTER 6

Evaluation and Critical Analysis of the Education For Self-Reliance Policy.

6.1. Prolegomena

At the tenth anniversary of the University of Dar-es-salaam, Nyerere addressing the students said:

> Socialists and Non-socialists agree on one thing about Tanzania. All agree that there is a gap between our stated goals and our present position. Some socialists argue that our socialist rhetoric and our policies are moving in the opposite directions, and that the gap between goals and achievement is consequently getting wider as time goes on.....Some even believe that the government and bureaucracy are now agents of capitalism. The non-socialists argue that as a result of our dogmatic socialist commitment the country is moving towards collapse and that our policies are therefore worsening rather than improving the condition of our people. I am not sure that both sets of critics can be right; but that is no reason why we should be complacent or refrain from looking critically at ourselves. (Nyerere,1980).

A country does not become socialist simply because of the lofty ideals or noble intentions of its leaders. One prerequisite for such a transformation to take place is the existence of an appropriate social structure which characterises it and the nature of the relations of production which play a decisive role in determining it. Good-will and commitment are hardly enough criteria for effective decision-making.

An ideal that is not investigated is one whose reality remains unknown. And an unknown reality is a reality that cannot be transformed. When Nyerere decided that education policy in Tanzania had to be based on the belief that social inequality was to be feared more than poverty, he could not have seen the degree of hardship that people would be called upon to face (Court,1984). Ability to learn from others was considered by Nyerere to be an important requirement in the ESR policy. Knud Eric Svendsen, a long time personal advisor to the former President and professor at the University of Dar-es-Salaam made this profound statement at the inception of the socialist policy:

> The worst enemy of a socialist policy in an African country is bad economic performance. No political regime.....can withstand the effect of economic stagnation in front of the prevailing expectations of the population. And these expectations cannot be removed by a higher political consciousness..It is not sufficient that socialism give results in the distant future. It must prove its case even in the very short run. (Svendsen,1967:12).

Tanzania was fortunate to have so many renowned scholars interested in doing research on its socialist experiment, making a wealth of recommendations to caution it on its course. Moreover, because of its declared intention of becoming self-reliant it attracted global response in the form of financial and technical support to help the country support itself. Some of the best Canadian scholars like Cranford Pratt, Colin Leys and David Morrision joined the team by conducting excellent independent research and publishing texts on the subject. As early as 1965 field work was initiated by Morrison who, in his text on Tanzania enumerated the levels at which a reform experiment could be analyzed. There were three questions for analysis that he thought must be considered: First, does the government have the necessary material and manpower resources? Second, are the innovations in policy winning sufficiently wide acceptance to clear the way for their implementation? And finally, even if the founder's policies are fully carried out, will they fulfil the various expectations of the people concerned? Commenting specifically on Tanzania he then said, 'On the question of capabilities and resources, one can find little scope for optimism' (Morrison,1976:279). Pratt (1976) feared the feasibility of the experiment and warned that the strategy would generate discontent and declining morale in the civil service and spark a downward spiral of inefficiency, lethargy and corruption. It is amazing how prophetic these warnings were and how adamant the leadership was to ignore them.

Caution needs to be exercised against simple analyses of the prevailing problems of implementing socialist reforms. There is more to it than simply poor implementation or lack of incentives. What is often mentioned as the cause of the present problems is that good policies have been poorly interpreted and poorly implemented. The crucial question to ask however was, whether one of the essential aspects of a "good" policy was not its feasibility and realizability in the context of the existing social reality and environmental conditions. What was seldom mentioned was the possibility that the current problems in fact could have been caused as a result of the model in relation to the level of development of the nation state, or because of the conflict of interest between goals of the peasants and those of the state. In the drama of creating institutions and a huge bureaucracy the peasant seems to have been given little attention in the process. Costly mistakes were made in the name of equality and revolutionary change (Kiros,1985:96). Development research, defined by Hyden, as problem identification and problem solving research, has played a minimum role in the planning process in Tanzania.

As a result, most of the goals have remained unfulfilled, "unanalysed and unrealized abstractions" (Friedland and Rosberg Jr,1964:2). Ideals have clashed with harsh realities of the 20th century global trends even in other third world countries bringing to an end socialist experiments in Ghana, Mali and other African States.

On the ideological level, no general consensus emerged over the precise definition of African Socialism. While on the one hand its initial vaunted distinctiveness receded as more Marxist-Leninist brand of socialism came to dominate the scene in the "second wave" of African aspirations, on the other even this latter school has suffered a severe blow to its viability as a result of the most recent crumbling of the largest socialist bastion of the world. Nyerere's strong belief in the communalism of pre-colonial Africa failed to convince the people to revert to the so-called egalitarian living of the past. It was the revolution brought about by colonialism that had left an irreversible mark on the African mind such that its political and economic legacies could not be brushed aside by even the most articulate ideological and nostalgic rhetoric.

On the theoretical level what raised concern among the scholars was Nyerere's concept of education as the main tool for social change (Apple,1978;Bourdieu and Passeron, 1977; Collins 1977; Dore 1976; Coombs 1985.) Education was shown to have a limited capacity of equalizing socio-economic conditions, let alone bringing about a new socialist society. Bowles and Gintis make a bold claim in their seminal book on schooling.

> Education over the years has never been a potent force for economic equality....[This is] a fundamental misconception of the historical evolution of the educational system. (Bowles and Gintis, 1976:8).

The authors argued and demonstrated convincingly that the idea of achieving more equality in society by making educational opportunities available to all had been one of the most enduring and cherished myths of modern times. Normally educational changes reflected the dynamics of the larger society in which they were introduced. They were not intended to replace values and norms but to confirm a given social system.

A popular school of thought, that looked at third world underdevelopment as being the result of its lop-sided relationship with the developed capitalist centres of the world, opened up an alternative perspective to the understanding of Tanzania's failure in achieving its goals. The practical reality of this economically dependent role of the politically independent African States broadened the analysis to include the exogenous factors that ultimately shaped their development path. Demagogically declaring socialism as their goal, many of these states instead, have created a new class of bureaucratic bourgeoisie to implement the policy of a 'classless'socialism. The emergent class has used state power to advance the

control and privilege of its limited numbers while at the same time opening the door to increased domination by transnational corporations and further impoverishment of the masses.

However, against all odds, Nyerere's total commitment and enthusiastic faith blunted all apprehensiveness among the elite and masses who together plunged into the experiment with their vision on the promised egalitarian society rather than on the innumerable obstacles and sacrifices awaiting them.

6.2. Critical Interpretation of the ideology

6.2.1. A Re-examination of African Socialism

All across Africa in the early 1960's the notion prevailed that socialism as an economic and social system was already deeply rooted in traditional Africa and that Africans had simply to revive those precious values and old habits of community-oriented work and living. However, the optimism of the 1960's turned into scepticism first, and finally pessimism. Nkurumah's overthrow in 1966, Keita's deposition in 1968, Senghor and Toure's failures in their respective countries - all these heralded Tanzania's fate, not too far away from where they had stumbled.

Nyerere's deep conviction in the values of traditional African family life with its concepts of collective ownership and production made him believe these family attitudes and practices could be extended to incorporate the whole village community, and indeed the whole nation. This extension of "Ujamaa" values nationally turned out to be extremely difficult to implement. In reality there was a trend away from these values as was observed by Burke, who said:

> A growing number of young Tanganyikans are rejecting communal values....and extolling an individualistic set of values(1964:207).

Cranford Pratt observed that "communal values were rapidly being eroded under the impact of acquisitive individualism "(1976:229). Such a development seemed inevitable under the powerful impact of colonialism, global capitalism and the introduction of the cash economy. Whatever equality, classlessness and cooperation that had existed in traditional society had been the necessary consequence of a specific mode of production of that 'closed' society where land was plentiful and free, population low and commodity production, market economy or surplus accumulation for the purpose of investment, absent. Little social differentiation was possible then. Moreover, there was a unity between the producer, his product and its consumption. However, these societies were impoverished and totally vulnerable to all outside forces.

As mentioned in the earlier chapters there was a dispute over the validity of Nyerere's claim of even a uniform existence of 'Ujamaa' values in all traditional societies. There is sufficient evidence from most sub-Saharan Africa today that clearly indicates that neither collectivism nor egalitarianism was universal (Foster,1969:83). The basis of the incongruity arose from Nyerere's generalizations across a) time b) samples and c) unit of analysis (Rosenburg and Callaghy,1979). His reference to a particular time and place in history when and where these values existed had been naively extended to apply to all African societies in the total historical past. And he further defaulted in conveniently extending the relationship within the family unit to the community and the nation. However this effort at extrapolating mutual concern "to mutual collaboration as tried out in the Ujamaa farm settlements has been unsuccessful" (Okoh,1980:73). Nyerere cited no empirical studies and no historical references to provide validity to his claim that socialism and democracy were natural to Africa. The fact was that most peasants, in what became Tanzania 29 years ago, lived in fairly isolated homesteads practising shifting cultivation, and this concept of collective and egalitarian living had dubious universal applicability. Thus Nyerere could only be right if he nailed down his generalizations to a particular place, time, sample and concrete unit of analysis.

Various societies in Africa encouraged the individual acquisition of wealth, social status and power on the basis of personal abilities, skills and creativeness (Foster,1969:84). Without being given an ideological mandate the above were tacitly accepted. Generally the acquisition of wealth as a pre-condition of social influence and authority was not uncommon. Inequalities of wealth and status certainly prevailed in the pre-colonial Africa.It is therefore not fair to blame colonialism for attitudes of inequality. It is also true however that the extent of objective differentiation vastly increased as a result of colonial rule (Nyerere,1968:3).

In spite of Nyerere's near obsession with traditional African values on which he based his 'Ujamaa', he failed to deal explicitly with the concept by either clarifying the connection between tradition and value or providing an objective basis for his 'historical' claims. Is a traditional practice valuable because it is traditional? Unfortunately Nyerere failed to systematically defend these values on either moral or economic grounds. It is against this type of background that Nyerere's ideology can be analyzed. This unconfirmed basis of his convictions was confronted by the powerful forces of modernisation, consumerism and economic growth. Ultimately the inevitable disintegration of traditional values took its toll in the face of modernity; for after all, values are the products of an on-going social living and social testing. Okoh sums up this discussion by saying:

> Nyerere seems to lose sight of the fact that what is valuable for the Tanzanian society of today is a function of the human condition which the contemporary citizens of that country apprehend in their existential situation (Okoh,1980:101).

Nyerere's picture of traditional African society therefore tends to be both idealistic and incomplete. There seems to be a Rousseau-like admiration for the noble life of a simple age. Most East African historians would agree, however, that life then was nasty, brutish and short (Brown and Hiskett;1975:Ch.22).

The ideology itself had several weaknesses. Firstly, the Arusha Declaration was essentially a political rather than an economic manifesto, and as such at the implementation level efficiency was usually sacrificed for equality and other political priorities. Secondly, it lacked a systematic focus, such as the linkages between agriculture and industrial development. Thirdly, as many scholars have argued, it was totally misleading to say that traditional society was classless and casteless (Mohiddin,1981; Karioki,1979; Okoh,1980; Mazrui,1972; McHenry,1979; Amin,1969). Nyerere argued there were no classes in Africa since the equivalent of the word class did not even exist in the African language. This argument can be dismissed with innumerable examples of certain realities that come into existence before they are conceptualized or given a term. If Nyerere's syllogism was valid then socialism did not exist in Africa because there was no equivalent concept for it. Besides the linguistic argument there was the substantive claim that has been attacked by his own political counterparts. Nkurumah substantiated his disagreement by citing the existence of slavery and feudalism in the African past. (Nyerere himself was the son of a Chief). Nkurumah, forcefully arguing against the belief of Africa's classlessness said:

> Such a conception of socialism makes a fetish of the communal African society. But an idyllic, African classless society enjoying a drugged serenity is certainly a facile simplification; there is no historical or anthropological evidence for any such society....the realities....were much more sordid(Nkurumah,1966:4).

In any case, Rweyemamu (1973) said he failed to understand why the goals of society in this day and time should rest on such flimsy foundations as the embellishment of its traditional system rather than the objective conditions of the contemporary world.

Nyerere seemed to contradict himself when he acknowledged the fact that the dismantling of the traditional institutions to give place to modern ones was inevitable (Saudie,1967:265). On the one hand he claimed the basic tenets of traditional life as being the core of his socialist policy and yet on the other he recognised that colonialism has eaten away much of that legacy (Saul,1972:180). In his hostility to Marxism Nyerere risked an alternative pragmatic path founded largely on unexamined premises that failed the test of practice. He preferred to look backwards to a rather romantically conceived classless past as a guarantee against the inequalities of capitalism rather than looking forwards to the

imperatives of a struggle - possibly a class struggle - as an alternative to the existing peripheral capitalism (Saul,1990:35). Samir Amin dismissed the possibility of using the primitive past to set up modern structures when he said it was an illusion to think that primitive collective traditions could facilitate setting up of modern socialist structures (Mopulu,1973:10).

Michael Harrington, a prominent and perceptive sociologist argued that if poor countries tried to advance towards socialism using democratic means they would be blocked by the passivity of the masses; and if the ruling elite tried to act on behalf of the masses it would quickly fall into Stalinist ways, turning against the peasantry, the proletariat and every one else (1976:219). Nyerere disagreed with him and believed it was possible both to avoid divisive acquisitive individualism and develop an economically productive communalism.

6.2.2. Ideological And Theoretical Evaluation of ESR.

Unlike The Arusha Declaration which was based on traditional African value systems, ESR had no real traditional educational model as a reference, although the values and attitudes espoused in it had their basis in African Socialism.

Formal schooling was essentially a Western concept that was exported during the colonial period to the colonised countries. The curricula, organisation and infrastructure that accompanied it, closely resembled that at the metropole. Schools in the West however were believed to be the principal mechanisms for social mobility and individual opportunity and had over the years developed clearly defined set of instrumental values and attitudes based on the needs of its clientele.

Having imported this institution wholesale, Tanzania decided to use this essentially foreign 'cultural capital' to inculcate diametrically opposite sets of values and attitudes like cooperation,equality, service above self etc. Tanzania today is clearly a 'conditioned' capitalist state (Samoff,1990) in which traditional or precapitalist structures co-exist with modern ones. Thus in Tanzanian schools there was, to quote the new sociologists of education:

> A hidden curriculum of unstated norms and beliefs....which promoted individualism, competitiveness and authoritarianism....[and] which originated from cultural hegemony and control exercised by the dominant groups of society (Cagan,1978:261).

Thus in this peripheral capitalist (and essentially non-socialist) environment, socialist educational reforms had hardly any chance of success. In order to understand the processes taking place in Tanzanian schools the concepts developed by the 'New Sociology of Education' become helpful. Pierre Bourdieu observed that,

'In a given class formation, the pedagogical action corresponds to the objective interests of the dominant groups or classes' (Quoted by Ergas,1982:586). The New Sociologists emphasized the role of cultural factors in creating inequalities. The concept of 'cultural capital' is relevant here and is defined as the sum total of language forms and abilities, beliefs and traditions, tastes and norms of behaviour, values and attitudes which belong to the dominant groups in society. In the Tanzanian situation this group or class would be made up of the vast bureaucratic bourgeoisie constituting managers, civil servants, parastatal workers, businessmen etc.

While functionalists justify the function of schools as being rational instruments that sort and select the talented for top positions, the radical critics view schools as perpetuating the existing inequalities by convincing the disadvantaged of their inferiority, and giving support to the politically dominant sectors of the society. Schools are thus viewed as instruments of elite domination fostering compliance and docility rather than critical thought and self-reliance. The `structuralists' therefore criticize the institution for its role in perpetuating a hierarchy of power and privilege and providing legitimacy to the existing regime.

With the replication of this Western educational institution in third world societies, the rich nations exported the in-built inequalities that such an institution reinforced. The competition and authoritarianism seen in this system, and clearly visible in the entire educational system of Tanzania tended to dismantle all efforts at inculcation of alternative values, unless the total system was transformed. Schools in Tanzania are not drastically different from the colonial patterned schools inherited 40 years ago. Commenting on this aspect of schooling Bowles and Gintis describe the scenario as:

> ..ensuring the minimal participation in decision-making by the majority (the workers); protecting a single minority against the wills of a majority; and subjecting the majority to the maximal influence of this single unrepresentative minority (1976:54).

Schools therefore did not reduce inequality and repression originating in the economic and political sphere but reproduced and legitimized this pre-existing pattern. Although Bowles and Gintis's point of reference was different, its applicability is none the less undiminished. The administration and teachers unconsciously worked towards perpetuating the system by their authoritarianism (and imposition of discipline), while being part of the victimized group themselves. The lack of control over their education and the alienation from the curriculum content felt by the students were reflected in the alienation the workers, peasants and teachers felt in their lack of control over their work. Moreover as long as there are economic disparities and privileged classes in Tanzania, inequalities in the educational system will persist. Neither can one expect any dramatic reforms in the

attitudes of students in spite of all the efforts at their politicization.

Some research points to the fact that children appear to be far more influenced by what happens at home rather than at school (Jencks et al,1972:255). In Tanzania therefore the role given to schools of restructuring the values and attitudes would not be fulfilled unless the same was reinforced at home, which was highly unlikely. The society at large and home influences showed no sign of affinity towards the socialist ideology that was preached in schools. In fact even in the school environment non-socialistic, authoritarian and non-participatory practices abound (Mbilinyi,1979).

As a result of the strong influence of the family, Bowles and Gintis maintain that schools are probably more effective when they attempt to complement and reinforce the socialization process initiated at home and in the community they live in. In Tanzania today because there is a close association between years of schooling and the reward system (in the form of socio-economic status) the education system is alleged to be perpetuating the existing social order. This close association between educational attainment and later occupational success thus provides a meritocratic appearance to mask the mechanism that reproduces the potential class system in Tanzania. Schools in Tanzania continue to serve as selection and certification agencies whose job is to primarily to measure and label people, and only secondarily to act as socialization agencies. This is partly perpetuated by the importance given to examinations in spite of repeated criticisms from Nyerere. Jencks maintained that the schools served primarily to legitimize inequality rather than creating it. Structuralists therefore recommend a change in the socio-economic structure of the society as a prerequisite to changes in the structure of schooling, since education, has been known to enhance inequalities in a few instances in Tanzania.

6.3.Evaluation of the Strategy formulation

6.3.1. Critical Review of Policy-Making Style in Tanzania.

In order to device effective strategies for reform, Crowfoot and Chester lay down the following conditions:

> All planned change efforts imply a commitment to a certain view of reality, and acceptance of certain modes of realizing those ends. Those assumptions constitute the conscious or unconscious bases for selecting specific courses of action and thus they precede all tactical decisions. To the extent that change agents cannot identify those basic assumptions and their implications, they cannot explore the full

range of effective strategies of change. (Crowfoot and Chester,1974:278).

The following discussion is a continuation of the debate began in Chapter 4 section 4, where a fairly extensive analysis of the genesis of the strategy formulation style in Tanzania was undertaken. It was seen how policies were initiated with a the top-down approach and followed the chain of hierarchial command as they filtered through the five almost mutually exclusive groups of 'participants'. An analysis was also made of the contradictions arising out of this transformative style of planning with its political character and management by manipulation rather than participation; and finally the widening gap it created between ideological rhetoric and actual practice.

This policy-by-campaign method, where 'declarations and directives' proliferated, and where mobilization fanfare overtook technical expertise, rationalized resource use was seen to be severely self-limiting. Also included in the analysis was Goran Hyden's explication of the degree of centralization in decision-making and the structural susceptibility of the policy to internal and external influences; and how the government was caught up between reliance on mass support and distrust of mass participation. We then enumerated and elaborated on the four main features of this mode of strategy formulation style adopted by Tanzania, namely, a strong desire to do everything at once; acting without full knowledge of the situation or possible consequences; unwillingness of the policy-makers to learn from the past to guide their future; and discrepancy between public expectations and the reality of what could actually be attained by the incumbent public servants.

On the theoretical level the 'optimizing'and `pure rationality' models were juxtaposed against the Tanzanian 'model' to gauge the level of unscientific and unorthodox methodology Tanzania employed for the destiny of its 23 million people. Nyerere's all powerful role in this 'platform-policy-making' drama and the non-possibility of tinkering with his basic ideology were briefly touched upon. In the same vein the role of the rest of the elite and the masses was alluded to.

According to Foster (1969) one of the essential requirements for a successful reform is a clear concept of the relationship between a desired outcome and the process of change which leads to it. The vulnerability that existed here was due to the fact that not enough was known about the reality of the social structure of schools and the ways in which it conditioned the attempts at social and technical change. Thus educational policy had to take into account the complexities of school social structure and the way attitudes are formed and changed. Little is known about the range of social outcomes of schooling. Tanzania's bold approach was : `let us create the facts first and worry about the consequences as they arise' (Ergas,1987).

A strategy that is drawn upon limited knowledge and analysis may not permit the incorporation of criteria such as the opportunity cost of decisions, and efficient resource use. Moreover if total active participation of all the parties concerned is not encouraged then the benefits accruing out of praxis,and the resultant knowledge it generates,tends to get lost. In the case of Tanzania the alienation provoked by the circumstances of being subjected to directives and (often abrupt) shifts had a discouraging effect on teachers and administrators alike.

By simply responding to political directives without a comprehensive, well-thought out operating strategy, a vacuum in the rationale and motivational aspects of implementation was created that could not be filled by coordinating meetings aimed at resolving specific problems. Educational strategy needed to meet at least two fundamental conditions: 1) to integrate visibly and logically, the basic principles of ESR with the objectives and modes of action corresponding to each aspect of schooling and government action 2) to be known and acted upon by those in-charge at different levels of the diverse spheres of decision-making and implementation. What was also extremely essential was to have a clear philosophical and practical conception of society and of the transformation process which went beyond a macro-historical and macro-sociological level. It was essential to integrate the scientific knowledge that was available about the phenomena of attitudinal and behavioral change and an understanding of the contemporary Tanzanian society in flux. Without this it was impossible to mediate a successful transition, however accommodating the populace or inspiring the ideology. Malekela's extensive research showed that:

> In the case of Tanzania very often an order comes from above. The curriculum developers and the Ministry of Education (ME) often make curriculum without a trial phase...and without providing for the necessary complimenters, such as teachers, textbooks and physical resources. Due to the modus operandi of `we must run while others walk', some syllabi do not include monitoring and evaluation to enable one to make necessary revisions. Inspectors ....show signs of despair... ..Recommendations made to relevant authorities ....receive very little or no attention. (Malekela,1985:74).

Finally, it is important to examine the various roles of the Presidency- as a coordinating body, as an independent policy-making organ, as a state within a state and as a democracy. Michael Hood(1988) looked at Tanzania's tripatriate system of policy-making, which allowed the party, the government and the President to formulate policy on different bases. Elaborating on this point, Hood says that the Republican Constitution of 1962 gave Nyerere, according to his own words, `enough powers to make me a dictator'. This enabled him to by-pass both the Party and the Government and pass policy unilaterally - sometimes against the advice of his government. By utilizing the tripartite arrangement to suppress, sponsor, pass, by-

pass, support or change policy the President was placed in a strategic position within the state to direct and control action.

The absence of an institutional mechanism for coordination and consultation over the objectives of the policy vis-a-vis the problems of its implementation caused innumerable problems and at times brought the Party and the government into a head-long clash, as was the case with the issue of private capital. AD itself was a response to a crisis where the government was not consulted (Pratt,1976:241) and the Party members received no advance notice of the coming changes (Mwansasu,1979:194). The Villagisation policy was brought against the advice of senior government officials (Green,1980:93). The Presidency became both a stabilizer and a source of policy instability by virtue of its strategic position.

The docility of the public and the dependency of officials, professionals and businessmen on the state, inhibited the development of a social class to act as a restraining influence on the policies. The present state of affairs is an indication of a government without governance and a state without a system (Hood,1988).

Theoretically Ujamaa precluded any conflict. Internal Tanzanian politics always veneered an aura of compromise, negotiation and cooperation. However, as contradictions emerged Nyerere injected more and more of his personal style and drive into yet wider areas. Conceptually the philosophy of Ujamaa precluded any coercion and yet when peasants refused to comply with his thinking, "persuasive coercion" had to be resorted to (Karioki,1979:Ch.3).

Often times the strategy and implementation were contradictory to the original policy: two of the examples were the way self-reliance activities were handled in schools and the non-changing role examinations continued to play in young people's lives. The socio-economic order that Tanzania sought to create was being covertly, and at times overtly, sabotaged by the very bureaucracy that was appointed to run the institutions to bring about the realization of socialist policies.

6.3.2.Central Direction vs Local Participation.

Most major policy pronouncements in Tanzania since independence have been associated with Nyerere. The credit for all that was achieved in the first twenty years always went to him - and hopefully the blame too. This was especially true in the educational field where even the Ministers of education were referred to as his "errand boys" (Babu, 1984). The birth of the policy was generally shrouded by secrecy and there were no serious debates over either its source or contents. Planning and implementation were usually left to the bureaucrats, who complied in the fear of losing their jobs or being transferred,in case they voiced dissent. The frequency of such transfers among key personnel underscored the reality of this

fear when an innovation was being implemented (Omari and Mosha,1987:65).

In an atmosphere of such uncertainty it was unlikely that any kind of democratic participation would accrue. Irrespective of the precepts of the ideology, implementation consisted of the banking method where all but the President were on the receiving end of the reform exercise. All the major policy statements were directly attributed to Nyerere who spent many months travelling all over the country politicizing and even intimidating educators and teachers to accept his new philosophy. Soon after, a conference of all senior educators was convened to deliberate on the policy and there it was made clear to the participants by Nyerere's spokesperson that there was no room for debate and that the task left was that of implementing the policy. According to a report prepared by Omari and Mosha (1987) undue secrecy in policy-making process sheltered ignorance and blocked objective challenges which were essential in opening the way to the articulation of better alternatives. As a result major policies in Tanzania tended to suffer serious reversals or setbacks after tremendous damage to the quality and efficiency of the system.

The Party, the NEC and the President occupied a pre-eminent position in the decision-making process. The bureaucratic arm of the Party was given the task of translating the policy into a reality. In the process however this group grew at an alarming rate and by mid 1970's government agencies and parastatals accounted for an estimated 80% of the economic activities and 44% of the G.D.P.(Ergas,1987:134). However this first experiment in state-society relations seems to have failed. The state as the teacher found itself with few pupils. In its second phase of state-society relations, from teacher the state turned into a policeman undertaking campaigns that forced peasants and pupils alike whether or not they wanted change. However, in Goran Hydens's felicitous expression, the 'peasantry remained uncaptured.' Nyerere had as much trouble controlling peasants as he had in controlling the administration, as was shown by the growing corruption and acquisitive individualism building in them. Socialism now turned into a set of purely negative commands. No strikes, no demonstrations, no public complaints by civil servants etc. were allowed. Tanzania's policies continued to reflect the thinking of Nyerere and in this benevolence, democracy simply had no major part to play (Ergas,1987). However by 1980's the experts started to displace the politicians. In the popular perception, the politicians had failed to deliver and as a result suffered an erosion of legitimacy. Apolitical individuals and academics replaced the senior group in key ministries, parastatals and other organisations. In the education arena, quality concerns replaced socialist reconstruction, redistribution or equality. School fees were reintroduced and private schools encouraged. Tanzania's transition was stymied (Samoff,1990:244).

In spite of emphatic political statements about development being of, by and for the people, those in power had showed little capacity to involve the masses. The problem was one of lack of communication, at least partly deriving from nascent class differences, although expediency also played a part. In trying to achieve quick results the slower but surer way of involving people in planning was by-passed. There are now sufficient studies to show that there was an acute lack of a two-way meaningful dialogue between the ME, administration, teachers, students and parents.

In Ngware's 1989 research on the quality of secondary education in Tanzania the respondents argued that there was an acute need to improve communication between the Party, ME, teachers and students; that policy-decisions needed to be communicated and not imposed. One teacher said that most policy directives sent out to schools were vague, poorly communicated and at times intimidating. It was felt that the authorities were only interested in two things: giving out policy directives and receiving good reports from schools. "They have to consider that we, at the receiving end are also humans. Demanding unworkable deadlines will not help" (p 100).

Within schools the formal administrative structures were equally rigid and non-communicative, based on a hierarchial pyramid, with the Ministry (and the ghost of the president) at the top and students at the bottom (Chap.5,Fig.1) The hierarchial and authoritarian structure of role relationships in the schools and classrooms reinforced alienation of students and prepared them for future subordinate roles in the society in line with a capitalist mode of work organisation.

Decentralization, ironically led to more central control. In its heat, the existing councils at the district level were eliminated, a move latter regretted by Nyerere (Samoff,1990:194). However in order to secure compliance with central directives the government required popular support, whose intensity was in turn dependent on popular participation, which was often corrosive of central control. The ensuing tension proved counter-productive. Thus a major dilemma developed between the ideological necessity of encouraging local participation and the growing need for central control. On a more practical level, a parallel contradiction lay in the fact that effective decision-making required expertise and so popular participation had to be severely curtailed. According to the bureaucratic elite, energized local participation was feared to prove divisive rather than constructive and therefore had to be avoided rather than encouraged. "Ostensibly politicizing institutions become vehicles for depoliticization". (Samoff,1990). Under the guise of 'serving the public interest' the alienating bureaucracy blocked mass participation while often remaining incompetent, corrupt and parasitic. The only way out for the peasant now was to go truly self-reliant.

6.4.Analysis of the Execution of the Policy

6.4.1. Introduction:

On the 10th anniversary of the University Nyerere said:

> Certainly gaps between theory and practice are not difficult to find in Tanzania....there are also some areas in which we appear to be further from our stated goals now than we were some years ago.... A very obvious gap and one which is frequently referred to, is that between our stated goals of self-reliance and the facts. For there has been an increased rather than decreased dependence upon imports to keep our economy running (Nyerere,1980:7).

Socialist transformation is a highly complex and conflictual process where an ideology directly impacts on the material interests of all groups in a given society. Two sets of factors seem to play a central role in affecting the outcome of such a transformation: organisational and environmental. The first relates to the structure, leadership and ideology of the state in question and the second pertains to the relationship between the state and society to be transformed, the world system within which it operates and the physical (geographical, historical etc) conditions that form the `fixed assets' of that state.

In order to successfully implement a socialist strategy the state needs intensive, direct, continuous, and efficient administration and control together with a motivated and involved populace. Tanzania was weak on both the counts. Since compliance was voluntary and incentives missing, implementation became weak even when the general population was predisposed to Ujamaa value changes. Concluding a major research report, Cooksey and Ishumi say, 'It is a tragedy that the widely acclaimed ESR policy should have been such a dismal failure'(1986:60). It has been difficult to create believers who are also practioners. Nyerere used schools as an experimental ground for his socialist ideas. This was essentially a political decision where feasibility seemed less important than making headlines of a yet new dramatic innovative reform. A nagging flaw that persisted within the top leadership was that once an idea was born, then implementation and success were assumed automatic or irrelevant. Party decisions were often based on intuitive impressions rather than research-based assessments: UPE and Mwongozo were clear cases in point (Ngware,1989:109). Ottaway, who has written extensively on African socialism said it was clear that the choice of socialism was not based on a rational analysis of costs and benefits or a strict evaluation of the probability of success. She claims it is difficult to find any concrete benefits of socialist policy anywhere on the African continent (1987:170). All goal-setting efforts tended to be statements of

intention and hope rather than guides to practical action and the initial unrealistic targets were seldom met (Samoff,1990:201).

6.4.2. Self-Reliance Projects In Schools.

In Ngware's research of Tanzanian schools a respondent said:

> We spend long hours there (in farms) and often classes are cancelled; we are just like labourers in a concentration camp (1989:82).

Another respondent said, 'How can the educational institutions be self-reliant when the whole society is not?!' Some others didn't care about ESR one way or the other.

Despite explicit directives in the policy documents against isolating manual and mental work, this was how it was immediately interpreted and practised. The bureaucratic evaluations of ESR implementation concentrated on quantitative measurements of output by volume and value, thereby missing out the conceptual component of the exercise. The reality however was that, neither were the attitudes changed nor was there a significant productivity increase (Mbilinyi, 1980:15-20).

ESR was not taken as a policy whose application permeated all aspects of teaching and extra-curricular activities, but was isolated to mean only manual labour, whereas the concept could and should have been applied to every aspect of the learning experience. Thus an excellent concept was misinterpreted by almost all involved in its implementation. Not only were these projects not given the professional treatment in both teaching and its evaluation but often school infractions by students resulted in sanctions in the form of more farming. There was little accountability and systematic financial planning. Self-reliance had become a form without a critical function serving neither the modernisation nor the social transformation function (Samoff, 1990).

6.4.3. Changes in Curriculum

Despite the emphasis put on relevant syllabi in the policy, the new curricula at all levels were not based on the outcome of a systematic and elaborate needs-assessment exercise; and as a result failed to capture the realities of communal life lived by the majority. In practice, the primary and secondary curriculum continued to prepare children for the next academic stage, which the majority were never to enjoy, thus ignoring the central directive of ESR regarding the terminality of each stage.

On an examination of the syllabi of the colonial days, Mosha (1990:62) confirmed that the curriculum then was balanced, realistic and effective towards creating more productive and functional graduates. He claimed that the practical components of the curriculum were better planned and based on theoretical knowledge acquired in the classroom where practical work was more a core of instruction rather than a chore. With the coming of independence, however, practical agriculture and animal husbandry were quickly abolished for reasons of politics and sentimentality. It was easy to dismantle the past structures by the stroke of a single ministerial directive but difficult to replace them with better alternatives. The UNESCO report of 1989 clearly stated that the present (1989) apathy compounded by over-loaded timetables, poor teaching and scarcity of resources led to passive, ineffective teaching and failure of ESR policy to be successfully exploited. The report went on to state that classroom processes were typified by rote learning at all levels and when this was the only technique used it became monotonous and uncreative (Vol.2.pg. 23).

6.4.4.Terminality and Relevance of the Curriculum.

In our analysis of the data we saw that efforts at transforming primary education into basic education were not successful since not enough changes were instituted in the curriculum for the inculcation of basic skills and experiences in order for the pupils to be able to play adult roles and earn a livelihood for themselves after schooling (Pendaeli,1988). Even the examinations tended to serve 'primary' knowledge needs rather than 'basic' knowledge ones, and thus they tested the knowledge acquired for pupils to fit into the next stage of formal education. Due to the political and parental pressures the present syllabus failed to effectively cater for either the majority for whom schooling became terminal or the minority who went on for further education. This lack of balance extended to the academic/manual work proportion too. Without eliminating income differentials and making rural areas more attractive (both employment and living wise) the competitive selection continued to reinforce inequalities and negative attitudes towards rural life. Swantz (1977) found that young people needed to feel a sense of material and intellectual advancement during and after schooling,in the absence of which they failed to derive a sense of accomplishment or any sense of terminality; with the result that they resorted to loitering and other negative outlets to their energies.

Although politically the terminality concept appears attractive and appealing, normally no education can be complete after the first seven years of schooling, especially when the quality of that education happened to be poor. In fact Nyerere's subsequent writings after ESR emphasize life-long education by asserting that 'education has no end' (Mosha 1990). Today nobody buys into that concept of education being complete at every level of schooling and all parents hope for post-

primary education which still serves to improve chances of finding a job in the urban areas.

6.4.5. Diversification and Vocationalization.

Amongst the queries raised by the Presidential Commission on education was the question of the effectiveness of the D and V program.Vocationalization had failed to create an impact on the overall outcomes since it was resisted within schools as a distraction from academic subjects and outside schools by peasants and workers who resisted it as an inferior educational track. Since the programs were also largely disconnected from the forces that create jobs they were unlikely to increase the employability of young people (Psacharopoulos and Loxley,1985). Even the relevant Ministries connected to the biases refused to recognize the syllabi of these school programs. As a result students had to take other professional examinations to qualify for work (Omari,1984:22). Research showed that the biases did not help them either to get jobs early or help them in their further studies that few of the graduates remained in rural areas and those that did, could not manage production more skilfully than those in the non-vocational group (Mukyanuzi,1985).

The research further revealed that the reforms were ineffective partly because of haphazard and disjointed action, wastage, misappropriation of funds, lack of responsibility for action and total lack of accountability and evaluation (ibid). The vocational programs did not focus on the most pressing needs and aspirations of the rural communities. Thus although the most crucial objectives for which the program had been designed in 1972 had not been fulfilled (ibid,pg.297), the political will of the elite was so adamant on making at least statistical impressions that the government has continued to salvage this grossly inefficient reform and continued to pump good money into a bad investment.

6.4.6.Role of the Examinations.

Selection was now theoretically only partly dependent on examination performance but in practice the element of continuous assessment based on attitudes to work made little or no difference to selection procedures.

Making education too ideologically oriented has its dangers. In a perfect society it may be desirable and feasible to select candidates not only on intellectual but ethical, moral and political grounds. However in our imperfect societies this approach could lead to a deterioration in the quality and efficiency of education and most likely breed favouritism, nepotism and corruption (Ergas,1982:582). Tanzania proved to be a fertile ground for all the above. Mbilinyi discussed the increasing popular protest against alleged unfairness in selection:

> Stealing and selling exam papers happens each year with nationally published criminal court cases resulting (Mbilinyi,1976:193).

Teachers were accused of switching examination numbers for their friends and there was also a suspicion of conspiracy between bureaucrats and teachers to select pupils corruptly and dishonestly (ibid). These factors contributed to a crisis in the legitimacy of the educational selection system. Not only did the system of evaluation not change according to the ESR format but it became seriously flawed. This had a further side effect of increasing inequalities, since now, money and influence made it possible to buy certificates too.

6.4.7. Integration Between School And Community.

Two statements issued by the political leadership 17 years apart provide an excellent insight into the discrepancy between the ideal and reality seen in Tanzanian education. The ESR declared in 1967 that

> The school will become a human resource development centre and community hub, or a multipurpose centre which will be adaptable for adult group discussions and social functions as well as classroom instruction; and will include day-care and kindergarten facilities, a practical room for handicrafts, carpentry and domestic crafts, and a community kitchen and dining room. (Quote from Gillette,1977:181).

This is a perfect example of an ideal being spelled out as a desired goal in the policy statements. However whilst on paper it seemed appealing to most people, during the process of its implementation, invariably discrepancies seemed to surface between that vision and the reality that took shape.

Reference has been made earlier to the research project carried out in 140 schools in Bagamoyo, Arusha and Masai districts that showed that community participation was completely ignored in the formulation of syllabus and there was no `consciouspurposive or functional interaction' between the school and community (Ishumi,1974:253). Addressing an education seminar in 1984 Nyerere said:

> We are still labouring under the disadvantage that our people think of school education as being a training for employment in towns....and move away from rural areas....[thus] becoming exiles from their homes and their societies. They run away instead of helping to change them. This is an indication and a measure of our educational failure (Daily News Oct.24,1984).

Two observations are made from the above quote. First,this a clear confirmation of the general claim that the rural areas are not attractive enough for our students to want to return to and two the unequivocal admission of the discrepancy between the expectations or ideals of the leadership and the actual performance.

6.4.8.Change In Values and Attitudes.

Socialist transformation requires, what Kenneth Jowitt calls, 'breaking through', that is, the decisive alteration or destruction of values, structures and behaviours contrary to those of socialism. Every major ideology can be a potential political culture if it manages to establish its roots in the populace.

In a pragmatic analysis of the ESR however, Mosha(1990) raised the issue of the environmental prerequisites for such a change:

> ESR calls for a change in mental values and attitudes....However it is wrong to assume that values and attitudes can be changed in a school. Hence the policy should have clearly delineated the roles of various interactive agents that together shape values and attitudes in society (p.60).

Mosha claimed that there were few indications of attitudinal changes in the students over the last 20 years. ESR never became institutionalized because parallel reforms were not attempted nationally and therefore a community infrastructure did not exist to promote relevant and supportive attitudes and behaviour. In Ngware's (1989) research one respondent said it was wrong to assume that educational institutions could be more socialist than the society itself. "I don't see anything socialist going on in this country. How can we build pockets of socialism in schools?"

Field research conducted in 1977 by a large group of educators under the auspices of TNSRC and UNICEF revealed interesting findings. It was found that for students and parents the priority in education outcomes was being able to meet the basic needs (food, shelter, clothing, health) where ideology and politics only marginally interacted if they helped them acquire those needs.

While schools provided the setting where certain patterns of behaviour were moulded and transmitted (which in turn might get diffused in the larger society), normally schools transmitted those norms and values widely and strongly held by the society (Bowles and Gintis,1976). These two viewpoints help understand the Tanzanian situation. Schools therefore were seen as either instruments of social change or as Foster believed, that the effect of schooling was more a result of the

status and material rewards society conferred on its products. As regards Tanzania, Foster argued that schools could not be expected to transmit egalitarian values and attitudes in a society where the educated still held positions of higher economic and social status (1968). Several Tanzanian studies have supported this thesis (Besha(1977), Lema (1973), Mbilinyi(1980), Mosha(1990)etc).

Schools in Tanzania were clearly institutions of social differentiation, reinforced by distinctions of reward, status and influence, formally certified by promotion and selection (Samoff,1990). Nyerere tried to use moral and ideological incentives within a capitalist social formation where material incentives predominated. The questions that needed to be asked were: Were the conservative critics right in claiming that what Nyerere tried to profess was simply too contrary to human nature to succeed? Were people by nature acquisitive and selfish? Samoff seems to have attempted to answer this:

> The rewards of individual achievement in a highly competitive environment render distinctly unattractive efforts devoted to developing attitudes of cooperation, reciprocity and national service. Mastering the syllabus is simply more important than developing a critical consciousness, and memorizing official facts prevails over analyzing underdevelopment. (Samoff,1990:231).

6.4.9. Reducing Inequalities

It can be argued that Tanzania has achieved equality of opportunity in its educational system since nearly everyone goes to primary school and nearly everyone is denied a place in secondary school. However, even though accessibility to schooling has increased quantitatively the system remains elitist in that only about 3% of the total primary school leavers get to go to secondary school. The political and social mobility in Tanzania today is based largely on academic education and who-knows-who criteria. This reinforces elitist attitudes among the educated which, many believe, is only a reflection of the realities of life. The unequal development of regions (see Table 4) and with it, of the educational facilities, is tending to foster parochial or ethnic superiority attitudes. The large representations of small sections of society in higher educational establishments and their consequent domination in recruitment to higher government posts may disrupt the hitherto national integrity or unity enjoyed by Tanzanians. Inequalities within the education system in this case clearly enhance inequalities in society, backfiring a prominent goal of ESR. The problem facing Tanzania is much more fundamental and complex than a mere restructuring of the education system. The relation between education and status became stronger as a result of the policy action to diminish private enterprise which meant removing the other main alternative means of social mobility. Thus occupation, status, prestige, wealth and power remained

related to one's educational credentials (Leonor,1983; Valentine,1980; Dodd,1988).

Samoff's conclusion on schooling and inequality was clear and rational: focused on skills and selection, schools were unlikely to have an impact on reducing inequalities or elitism. Evidence showed consistently that differentiation had even increased (Malekela,1983). There was in fact a basic inequality in the way the issue of inequality was viewed. Far less attention was paid, for political reasons, to inequalities of religion, race, class or even sex. Affluence certainly enhanced both access and chances of success. Parental occupation, income and socio-economic status and class remained highly correlated with school success. (Mukyanuzi,1985).

From the economic point of view a further dilemma facing the country in its efficiency/equality choice was the fact that although clear regional disparities existed in favour of a few areas like the Kilimanjaro region, it was widely accepted that it was these areas that had the most innovative, enterprising, self-reliant and productive group of individuals among all the 120 tribal groups. Socialism in Tanzania had the habit of penalizing the more efficient, the more well-to-do, the over achievers of the society in the name of equality. Some sections of the population were almost made to believe that it was necessary to be equal in poverty, inefficiency and corruption. Thus it was alright to spend one's money on drinking but it would be violating the leadership code to save and invest for the purpose of enhancing one's wealth.

6.4.10.Democratic Participation.

In a remarkably honest statement the Mwongozo declared:

> The purpose of both AD and Mwongozo was to give the people the power over their own lives... but... to the mass of people power is still something wielded by others...(Mwongozo,1971).

In practice the role relationships in the total educational hierarchy were used as important mechanisms for socializing its clients to adapt to particular kinds of situational demands, typical in the Tanzanian case, of the authoritarian and hierarchial structures of administration and control (Mbilinyi,1982:102). Every group and individual had to take orders and yet the same groups and individuals perpetuated the 'ordering' system on to their immediate subordinates. Thus within the grassroot level student body, there were the monitors in the classroom, the prefects, the head prefect, the house leader, the party youth leader etc, who were all controlled by the various teachers in charge of those sections. Thus the discipline master coordinated with the prefects to enforce control and determine punishment. The school head and the head prefect acted as go-betweens linking the various levels of the hierarchy.

Nyerere had wished teachers to be the primary animators of the community, who would through rational explanation and critical dialogue nourish and stimulate young minds towards changing their attitudes. In practice however teachers showed (1) lack of critical thinking, self-confidence and cooperative attitudes (2) lack of proper understanding of the Ujamaa ideology and ESR (3) a lack of motivation and initiative to inspire pupils to adopt Ujamaa values. Thus the teachers failed to harness the learning energy latent in their young students. Instead their authoritarian stance induced regression, battering students back into a state of dependence (Varkvisser,1973:278). These relationships of dominance and submission permeated all aspects of the learning environment whereby it was no longer easy to distinguish between the oppressor and the oppressed. Even when teachers tried using more democratic, problem-solving methods in their crowded classrooms students complained they would not be able to finish the heavy syllabus and ultimately fail in the all-important examinations.

Self-reliance, democratic participation and liberation were not possible when views were not freely expressed and classroom interaction and role-relationships remained rigid and hierarchial. Questioning can be trouble-shooting but not necessarily trouble-making. One of the most embarrassing contradictions to-date is the Ministry's regular issuance of 'directives' from above in dire contradiction of the policy. It is the authoritarianism and hierarchial controls that were zealously defended rather then participation and democracy. As a result each of the groups felt alienated. Teachers and students did not have a say in any of the major changes in the education system (Omari and Mosha,1986). Thus their responses in the implementation were limited. The Unesco (1979) recommendations included the need for `fostering a sense of partnership among the principal participants - policy makers, management, teachers, parents, technical specialists etc' (Vol.2.pg.78). This lack of participation and effective involvement seems to have been the most glaring example of weakness linking theory and practice. Never did the process of curriculum formation or any other school decision get anywhere close to being dominated by the peasants and workers whose indigenous accumulated cultural experiences were totally neglected. Twenty five years after ESR, the teachers still, on the one hand, wielded complete power over students to reward, punish, evaluate, suspend, expel, detain, promote or rusticate (Mbilinyi,1982) and on the other complained of their lack of power and authority over syllabus, text books, course specializations, posting, examinations, holidays etc.

6.4.11. Meeting Human Resource Needs.

A parent's response to Ngware's question (in his field research) on the quality of education was:

> I am told my child sits on the ground, classes are over-crowded and teachers are frustrated ....worst still there are no books and my child cannot even write his own name (Ngware,1989:120).

Ideological considerations had so diverted education and teachers from the academic issues that the quality of education and overall efficiency suffered tremendously, as was confirmed by the Presidential Commission on Education (1984), appointed mainly to look into this major problem. Another more recent major evaluation by a team of UNESCO experts (1989) referred to above in its report:

> In recent years, quality deteriorated to such an extent that there are fears that the system has started to turn out illiterates (Vol.1.pg.10).

This indeed is a strong statement coming from an apparently reliable source. The report went on to quote evidence (Criper and Dodd,1985) that two-thirds of standard VII pupils are unable to read and understand any text at that level, and that after 5 years of exposure to the English language, at least 95% of the children had not started mastering any of that subject. Thus both the primary school graduates and those from the secondary school diversification programs have been seen to leave schools with neither the skills to be gainfully employed in large numbers nor the academic and attitudinal changes that ESR had envisaged for them.

This state of affairs was partly the result of the policy's disruptional effects on all the five major variables that seem to determine the quality of education in any school namely, instructional materials, teaching staff, management, learning environment and curriculum content. Expensive programs like the vocationalization in secondary schools led to findings that showed very little benefit accruing either as a preparation for the next stage of academic work or providing better employment prospects (Psacharopoulas and Loxley,1985). If only 5 percent (or less) of the total body of students were being selected to go for further studies then one would expect some of the most brilliant minds in the university where only ten percent of that 5% went. But complaints from that institution have led to supplementary preparatory courses for students entering university.

As a result of all the above constraints most of the manpower or human resource expectations remained unfulfilled. Both the educators and planners decried the school's failure to provide technical and intermediate level manpower and training (Samoff,1990:230). The system had borrowed form and process from the modernisationists and ignored the context and underlying relationships including notions of efficiency developed from cost/benefit analysis, returns on investment etc., leading to the worst of both the worlds. The skills and selection process allowed the `manpower needs approach' to supersede the `social demand approach' and as a result the system continued to perpetuate an educated elite class while leaving the majority of the population dissatisfied in this acutely selective

educational system.

6.4.12.Overall Efficiency

Besides an accumulation of individual and collective inefficiencies there were structural and institutional deficiencies that needed correcting. Morris found, `contemporary rural administration has reached a genuine state of crisis'(1976). There were distressing indications of a general decline in the competence, the discipline and the morale of the public service (Mwansasu and Pratt,1979:229). The KRUM report of 1975 (a committee of the National Assembly) told story after story of the most severe lapses in discipline and in morale, extending also to the teachers and school administrators (ibid). In Jamaica Nyerere spoke of the inefficiency and indifference of the publicly owned parastatals and the violation of the leadership code (Stabler,1979:56). On the industrial front he said,` the fact is that we have been, and still are grossly inefficient in our factories and workshops and with increasing reliance on foreign aid, self reliance was more a goal then a reality' (ibid). There was a growing public acknowledgement of misuse of authority and power, as well as recurrent cases of embezzlement of public funds at all levels and in most 'Socialist' institutions (Daily News, Nov 23 & 24, 1988). The 1989 UNESCO report talked of complex bureaucratic procedures between Ministries causing long delays and impeding the decision-making process (p.97,Vol.1). It was found at the ME that there was virtually no effective pattern of delegation of control, power and authority and there was a nation-wide crisis of educational management (ibid and pg.25 vol II). The vast majority of the 10,000 primary school Heads had learned their recipes for management on the job, and the poor quality of primary school suggested that this cadre was part of the vast unskilled or semi-skilled pool of managers in the country.

It is now imperative to undertake an analysis of the exogenous and endogenous causes of the inefficacy of ESR policy and examine a few of the contradictions therein.

CHAPTER 7

CONCLUSION

7.1. Prolegomena

The purpose of this research study was to analyze the Tanzanian socialist transformation effort through schools, and explicate some of the key factors responsible for the inefficacy of the educational policy.

After having examined a fairly substantial body of documentary literature, we came to the conclusion that there were specific exogenous as well as endogenous factors, which contributed to the failure of the policy of Education For Self-Reliance to materialise in the Tanzanian schools. These will be enumerated in a point form in this concluding chapter. It must be conceded, however, that the results obtained from this study do not resolve the many issues surrounding the debate over the role of schools in bringing about a societal transformation. Nor does it provide any ready-made solutions to the complex problems of transition in the Third World societies. What it does do is to look at Tanzania's innovative approach at using schools for a particular societal change in its totality, and the type of constraints that can impede its success. The author's concluding remarks, therefore, serve as a cautionary note that can be heeded by all those involved in such large scale national experiments involving millions of people.

7.2. Exogenous Factors Contributing to the Inefficacy of the ESR.

Given the alien origin and alienating function of formal education in Tanzania, it becomes imperative to examine the role of foreign financial (and cultural) capital that penetrated the education system and influenced the direction of the policies. Mbilinyi puts it thus:

> All of the basic education reforms have relied on foreign sources of finance. Donors or investors....influence the design, implementation and evaluation of basic education reform policies, inevitably so. Grants and loans have included technical aid 'packages' which include forced importation of machinery.... as well as experts and teachers....at prices which are not negotiable (Mbilinyi,1979:224)

Strategies and policies seemed to be influenced and be circumvented by external agendas. Policy makers had to match their own goals with those of the potential donors. There were two major thrusts to this issue. One related to the dependency-centre-periphery notion, where global economic and cultural imperialism

based on historical realities of third world countries vis-a-vis the developed capitalist centres, came into play. The second concerned aid, grants, loans and technical assistance to developing countries together with the conditions and other baggage that normally accompanied such transactions.

With the inception of the new policy it was hoped that Tanzania's bold efforts at self reliance would lead to some major changes away from its dependency and peripheral state towards a self-sustained growth. In fact, one of the key factors that prompted AD and ESR pronouncements was the increasing disillusionment with the traditional strategy of development with heavy reliance on foreign aid. Unfortunately however, except for certain measures such as the nationalization of the examination system, and the break effected from tri-national University of East Africa, the scope for foreign influence on education concepts and policy failed to diminish substantially (Gillette,1977:283). Unlike China or Guinea, Tanzania did not discourage or stop the in-flow of high level external advice and aid for education and educational policy. This characteristic of Tanzania's structural susceptibility to foreign models, analyses, diagnoses, and approval permeated throughout the undertaking of most projects - starting with the designing of intervention to evaluating outcomes and providing funding (Fuenzalida,1983). Most new projects in education and a significant portion of the recurrent budget relied on externally funded finance.

Expectations about what could be funded influenced what was proposed and what was attempted: a good example of which was the Swedish style Folk Development Colleges. Another indirect impact of this external financing was that success in negotiating such assistance became itself a source of power and influence in Tanzania. Budding alliances with foreign donors and a political coalition with the government elite became all important in securing funds for a particular sub-sector (Samoff,1990).

What we need to consider here is how compatible or incompatible has this external influence been on ESR policy. The Unesco/Unicef project in primary education was a clear case of fruitful support for a clearly defined government policy. Thus generally where education policy has been clear and forceful, the margin for negative foreign influence has been curtailed. But there have been cases, like in the technical education, where there existed a fundamental divergence between these programs and the self-reliance policy. Gillette and Spaudling (1975:164) presented an interesting syllogism that underlined the First U.N. Development Decade (1960-1970): "Development is economic growth, but economic growth is a technical process; therefore development is technical". Such a narrow economic focus was clearly antithetical with the broader and more ideological concept of the people-centred development expounded in the ESR. The exogenous element gave rise to conflict partly because most aid went to programs compatible with urban "modernizing development" rather than the rural oriented programs.

As for the quality of returns accruing from the program supported from external sources, the absence of public accountability for policy errors allowed both the state and the World Bank (or other loaner or donor) to get away at times with extremely poor policy formulation and implementation, thus compounding the existing crisis. Reference has been made earlier to the 2.3 billion dollar experiment in diversification and vocationalization of schools that failed. Yet such was the power of the World Bank and the hermetic nature of the political process in Tanzania that the Bank was able to bow out of the D and F arena without a word of protest about either the quality of its decision-making process or the dictating of policy without taking responsibility when things went wrong (Cooksey and Ishumi,1986:54).

The argument that foreign resistance has been responsible for the failure of socialist efforts is often derived from tenets of dependency theory. According to Hatch (1975:14) in October,1974,

> The World Bank told President Nyerere that he would have to modify his socialist policies as the price of his country's economic survival. It virtually threatened to withdraw current and future aid unless he suspended his Ujamaa program.

Going back to the dependency theory, it was assumed that the locally dominant elite found it more profitable to seek class alliances with their counterparts in the developed metropolitan centres of the capitalist world. Because the interests of this group were not furthered by the development of socialism in the periphery, it consciously or unconsciously sabotaged the efforts in that direction. These agents of underdevelopment perpetuated the cultural, psychological and economic dependence on foreign expertise. President Nyerere noted in a talk at the University of Dar-es-Salaam, (Feb 14,1976) that the "bureaucrats" were the "agents of the big exploiters", the foreign capitalists and served the interests of foreign capitalists as well as their own interests, but <u>not</u> the interests of the Tanzanian peasantry and workers. Western mass media further helped demoralize those on the socialist path by splashing derogatory titles in their press. Whatever the effects of foreign domination on the policy, large amounts in aid from Western nations continued to flow into Tanzania, without which the policy of socialism and self-reliance would have certainly been much more of an idealist dream than it turned out to be. By 1981, Tanzania was receiving more per capita international assistance than any other tropical African country (Yeager,1982:112). Be as it may, the issue of the effect of exogenous factors was a mixed bag of both help and hindrance in the development of Tanzania. Still weak and poor, the country continued to project at least a cosmetic continuity to its experiment, with the continued support of its generous donors.

7.3 Endogenous Factors Contributing to the Inefficacy of ESR

Commenting on the socialist experiments in Africa in general, and on Tanzania in particular, Ottaway summarized her observation:

> The crisis of the socialist state, which is so much in evidence in Africa at present, appears to be rooted in the gap between what it tries to be and what it is in practice. The socialist state is supposed to be autonomous, powerful, firmly in control of the society and capable of exerting the force necessary to remould it according to a socialist model....in reality [it is] autonomous but also powerless, incapable for the most part, of capturing the society and ineffectual in its exercise of coercion (Ottaway,1987:188).

Commenting on Tanzania's experiment Ottaway goes on to specifically claim that a socialist state never emerged in that country - there was a dominant ideology, there emerged some related policies but there was no socialist state.

In this last section, we need to recapitulate all the factors discussed so far (at the ideology, the strategy and the implementation level) that contributed to the inefficacy of the socialist policies in general and ESR in particular. The enumeration will necessarily be brief and in a point form since discussion on each of them has already transpired in the earlier part of the thesis.

Dostoevsky once said that ideas tend to have their consequences. The consequences of Julius Nyerere's political ideas dominated the Tanzanian development scene for at least thirty years. His policies have been subjected to both conservative and radical criticism. Marxists and neo-Marxists mostly saw it as a text-book example of economic dependency and periphery capitalism. Conservative observers pointed to the country's worsening economic situation and blamed much of it on collectivization, nationalization and bureaucratization, amongst other things (Yeager,1982).

Attacks from left and right not withstanding, Tanzanians today are more equal than their counterparts in Kenya, Zaire and many other third world countries. Political stability is remarkable and ethnicity provides no serious threat to the unity between its 120 tribes. Political repression is felt less here and "there is a grassroots feeling", notes a correspondent, "that one can always appeal to authority" against abuses of power (Langellier,1980). Measured in terms of education and health care Tanzania can boast of having reached the peasants in the remotest centres of the country. Primary schooling is almost universal and literacy rate is amongst the highest in Africa. Swahili is used as a medium of instruction in primary schools, and signs of relevance are seen in many of the subjects taught. Tanzanian pupils are more self-reliant than students in many other countries. Some even grow

their own crops. Most pupils are at least minimally politicised and have developed a sense of confidence in themselves. Education and health are almost free, and although affluence increases chances of academic success, poverty does not preclude it (Samoff,1990). Gender inequalities have been reduced and the country is wiser in 1990's to the dangers of being caught up in fancy ideologies when the basic needs of the society have not yet been met.

7.3.1.Problems at the Ideological Level.

In bringing together the salient aspects of this thesis, we can now enumerate in a summary form the chief causes, analyzed so far, that seem to have been responsible for the inefficacy of the socialist educational policies in Tanzania:

1. Without question Nyerere has been the most influential political figure in Tanzania in the last quarter of a century and all the policies of the country reflected almost exclusively his thinking. But while the people may have enjoyed a relatively benevolent regime, democracy was simply not a part of that picture (Ottaway, 1987:179). Thus it was essentially a one man ideology to be implemented by 23 million. Cranford Pratt (1979) asked a rhetorical question: Why did Tanzania develop such an impetuous style of decision-making? His answer: A dominating President who is much more an initiator rather than an administrator. One could add, a politician rather than a financial planner; a moralist more than a politician.
2. The policy was inadequately articulated, understood,interpreted and implemented (Mwansasu and Pratt, 1979). Twenty five years after its enunciation educators and policy makers were still lamenting the lack of proper interpretation of the ESR (Mosha, 1990:61).
3. In Nyerere's overpowering obsession with political issues, substantial basic considerations like fall in real incomes and quality of life of peasants and workers, worsening economic crisis and increased dependence, were neglected. Thus ideology took precedence over economic and social considerations. The choice of socialism was based on considerations other than rational analysis of costs and benefits or economic growth.
4. A major dilemma facing socialist countries had been the absence of material incentives in return for commitment. An unfortunate replacement for which had been the use of coercion. Nyerere removed both, the `carrot' and the `stick' and said socialism was an 'attitude of mind'. The peasants who constituted 90% of Tanzanians, saw little justification in changing their attitudes and tradition-bound life-style to what Nyerere thought was traditional. As regards the incentives, for those in paid employment, he enforced unrealistically low salaries to impress a better statistic to the world. The people's response followed accordingly.

5. Nyerere's nostalgic belief in a traditional kind of social solidarity, 'Ujamaa', was a personalized belief that was extrapolated on to the present day African world view. Traditional systems of land tenure were highly individualistic (Kitching,1982:120). The sharing and cooperation were strictly ancillary to each individual household's right and obligation to provide for its own subsistence and prosperity; and freedom to live collectively or separately. The type of economic collaboration demanded now was a novel form of social and economic organisation quite strange and alien to the vast majority. Moveover these new forms required the solution of complex technical and organisational problems which the villagers were not even remotely equipped to cope with (ibid). The effort to revive the values that had been all but destroyed long ago (if they ever existed) through social engineering and politicizing was seen as an exercise in societal regression. The hazard of projecting the present backwards in time lay in the fact that passage of time usually reduced or diluted the reliability of oral tradition (Mazrui,1972).
6. A major disputed question was whether schools could transform society in isolation when the dominant societal values and norms had moved further away from the envisioned goal. The naivete of this approach which viewed human societies as a chemical solution from which one or another element could be extracted was seen to be seriously flawed (Meister,1966:21). Marx was of the belief that a transformation in the material base of society had to precede lasting changes in the institutional and ideological superstructure and that the dialectical relationship between the two required a political struggle at both levels. Was Philip Foster right in saying that schools were prisoners of society and could not be used to initiate changes in attitudes or behaviour; or conversely was Illich, the prophet of de-schooling, who felt the very structure of schooling inherently impeded radical change? Because of conflicting assumptions both authors, writing with well-supported evidence came to virtually opposite conclusions (Morrison,1978:293). When societal structures had not come to terms with the new ideology it was naive to expect school children to lead the revolution in this profoundly philosophical undertaking.
7. There existed a school of thought that felt Tanzania needed to pass through the capitalist stage (based on Marxist beliefs) before it could apply itself scientifically to the building of a socialist society. Moreover capitalism tended to enforce the values of discipline, efficiency and responsibility that Tanzanians seemed badly in need of.
8. Nyerere drew a clear distinction between his kind of socialism from that of the Marxist variety largely because of the apparent absence of classes and class struggle in Africa. Shivji (1973) and others believed the socialist effort in Tanzania had to be analyzed within the framework of class analysis. It was then that the bureaucratic bourgeoisie would be seen as part of the problem, exacerbating the contradictions.

9. In the absence of any strong motivating force, developmental imperatives dictated the leadership to exercise coercion in many socialist countries. In expounding on the pathology of institution building in Tanzania, Mudoola (1985) blamed the Tanzanian leadership of political shyness and attributed it to "developmental immobilisme".It was argued that the Party should have used force to discipline the government bureaucracy and its own cadres.
10. When asked to discuss the country's socialist policies and its implications, the populace and the politicians alike, at one time, tended to dilute and limit the ideological implications to issues of renumeration and material gains. Unfortunately even the Party, while asserting its powers, showed little sense of an understanding of the overall context of the decisions it was taking. The vision that Nyerere had of the future society was watered down and even coloured more by capitalistic undertones than the altruism he had expected. Tanzania's socialist vision and capitalist practice seems to be the most steady formula to have survived, irrespective of all the rhetoric of the last 25 years. From the school child to the Minister - all practised acquisitiveness and individualism in their daily lives and yet all were familiar with `Ujamaa' and its principles. There was also an inconsistency between the goals of the founder (Nyerere), the ambitions of the bureaucrats, the ideas of the planners, the tasks of the teachers, the dreams of the parents and the students, vis-a-vis the new policy in general and schooling in particular.
11. Perhaps the most crucial factor responsible for the policy's ineffectiveness was the imperfect fit between the image of the society posited by the ideology and the actual environmental and organisational conditions in existence at the time; and the difficulties encountered in translating the rather vague dictates of the ideology into actual policies.
12. Although there was an apparent emphasis on the need to learn from the experiences of others the policy certainly ignored many of the lessons from the past, including those of the colonial times. Failure to learn from past efforts of others in making the curriculum relevant and practical resulted in tremendous cost incurred by the duplication. Nyerere was hailed for what others had quietly tried more effectively and with better results. As for the AD Nyerere was suspicious of any theory or dogma be it Marxist or non-Marxist. These were some of the controversial or contributing factors at the ideological level that had their effect on the policy performance.

7.3.2. Problems at the Strategy Level.

A task force made up of the Unesco/World Bank/Tanzanian experts undertook an extensive evaluation of the education system twenty years after the inception of the ESR and in its final report (1989) it was clearly stated:

> Any new ideas and innovations should be well planned, thoroughly analyzed, explained and justified to all partners in educational activities and properly phased for effective implementation before they are applied on a countrywide basis. Experimentation and pilot projecting of new situations will offer opportunities for dialogue among all those interested and will give evidence of their feasibility and possible contribution in meeting the country's problems. Formative and summative evaluation is needed. (Unesco,1989,Vol.2.pg.78).

1. Amongst the most costly assumptions that Nyerere made, when embarking on the policy, was the expectation of the existence of an innovative, efficient, well-versed body of strategists, planners, policy-makers, educators and clientele who would translate his rather amorphous ideological principles into viable strategies of implementation. Concepts like mutual help, cooperation, commitment, egalitarianism were indeed difficult to translate into practical potions to be administered on to the malleable recipients. Having not sought the participation of the people during the formation of the ideology he now expected a select elite group to formulate the strategies and a not-so-select group of recipients on whom the dosage was to be administered. This top-down hierarchial method of policy-making annulled all rhetoric of democratic participation and, to an extent, egalitarianism. Had people's views been sought from the start a very different picture might have emerged and some of what is being researched now would have been done prior to the inception of this nation-wide policy.
2. The success of a policy cannot be based only on good will and sincere intentions, but on researched cause and effect relationships so as to decipher what worked and what didn't and why. Mosha(1990) alleged that the policy remained one of political platitudes rather than qualify as a `public policy' since it failed to meet the criteria of `quality policy' stipulated in Chapter 4. One of the major errors of omission was the fact that no simultaneous structural changes were planned in the rest of the society. This has been one of the most viable criticisms of the ESR.
3. Those given the responsibility of translating the policy, including Ministers, other senior policy-making executives and administrators (including teachers) were hardly technically qualified to do the job. Temu (1985), a one-time presidential economic advisor, reflecting on this issue said that top executives were seldom experts in the field they got to head, as seen by the facility with which they were transferred from one post to a quite unrelated other. ESR had some excellent ideas but it lacked both professional and managerial input to turn them into a transformative strategy. The lack of solid professional contribution may well have contributed to the faulty assumptions behind specific educational policies. Morrison (1976) confirmed this fact when he said that Tanzania's educational revolution was ill-planned

and lacking in resources. The Unesco report put it bluntly (Pg.10, Vol.1):

> There is hardly any planning process taking place at the Ministry of Education level. Thus this important tool for managerial decision-making is unavailable. As a result a coherent strategy for educators has not been developed.

In this highly political method of decision-making and bureaucratic methods of strategy formulation no pedagogical or psychological analysis was undertaken to examine effective ways of instituting change in student's attitudes and behaviour. If Nyerere could start his essays on socialism with the sentence, 'socialism is an attitude of mind', it was imperative for him and others to learn how that attitude could be acquired. For the Party and the government, feasibility seemed less important than headlines and fanfare of the new reform. Intuition and political considerations preceded or excluded all rational approaches to policy-making.

4. Tanzania's reform exercise was necessarily of an experimental nature and as such it was essential to fully utilise the total human and material resources available for a final refined version of the policy at hand. To evolve not only a policy but also a strategy in an oligarchic framework, with input only from the top, was hardly possible, especially when the implementation was to be entirely carried out by the masses at the bottom. In order to develop correct policies, the experiences of not only those who had experimented with similar reforms in the past, but also the knowledge and creative imagination of those who would be given the task of actually implementing them, needed to be fully utilized (Clark,1978:258).
5. Socialism in a poor country could not primarily concern itself with distributive questions without its also having a clear strategy for economic development (refer interviews). It had to show results by way of rising living standards. Socialism would surely go sour if it came to be associated with the perpetuation of mass poverty. Given the weak technological and economic infrastructure together with the overall poverty, it was overwhelming for the state to take on vast extractive and distributive tasks. The state in Tanzania with its very elaborate institutional framework and a very weak socio-economic and technological base had taken on welfare responsibilities that would tax the resources of even the most developed countries (Kiro,1985:117).
6. There was also the lack of a senior policy-making executive to influence Party thinking and to help shape and refine macro-educational policy. Thus there was no effective sounding-out body that could freely criticise and improve policy-making. Nor was the academic community given the confidence to make open assessments, since most criticism seemed to ultimately touch the sensitive nerve of the ideology itself where it was immediately petrified. Therefore no formative evaluations were forthcoming

either.

7. The motivational aspects were completely ignored and appeal was based on moral and emotional grounds for people to act. No thought was given to the underpaid teachers and ill-staffed or even the over-crowded classrooms. Having been left out of decision-making and now being neglected into poverty, the teachers saw little justification in making a commitment to an ideology that they did not help formulate.

8. The massive growth of parastatals and bureaucracy led to over institutionalization, the fetish for which was caused by the leadership's concern of building political structures which could then be manipulated and law-enacted to legitimize any course of action the elite thought fit.However within these efforts at domesticating power there arose this problem of over employment and parasitism. Institutional fetishism arises when there is a preoccupation with means rather than ends, where self-serving interest precludes or pollutes other concerns at the extreme expense of the goals for which these institutions were established in the first place. Mudoola summed up this discussion neatly by saying that the inter- and intra- bureaucratic affiliations (or conflicts) created as a result, led finally to institutional "immobilisme" (1985:120). The parasitic nature of these bureaucracies generated parasitic minds which tended to live off the organisations rather than for them (ibid). At one time there were more than 400 parastatals in this small economy. And yet in spite of this over-institutionalization there was no institutional mechanism for the socialist transformation!

7.3.3. Problems at the Implementation Level.

1. The Ministry of Education (ME) has not been the prime mover of any of the major educational policy decisions- ESR, Musoma Resolutions, D and V or UPE. Although Nyerere played a major role in formulating the above policies there was not an equally strong effort at building up the management and policy-making capacity of ME itself. Failures in implementing policies tended to be blamed on implementation rather than on the policies themselves (Unesco,1989:15) 'certain national educational policies cannot work..... thus Ministry of Education might be attempting to implement the unimplementable' (ibid). Last year Nyerere told the Tanzanian community based in Washington that his ideology was good but the style of management and implementation was poor. (Daily News,Nov.21, 1991).

2. In general the relations between the state and society remained poor. This was mirrored in the relations between the various parties involved in the ESR reform experiment. It was the political elite who always decided what type of relations the rest of the society could have with the state and the party which acted as the teacher, policeman, oppressor or developer at various times. Finally however the Party proved ineffectual (Ottaway,1987:177) and

the peasantry remained 'uncaptured'. Participation was seldom encouraged at any level.

3. The docility of the workers and the peasants boosted the authoritarianism of the state. This absence of a strong, revolutionary and self-conscious working class left a wide gap for the party and government bureaucracy to occupy the central role as the dominant group in society. The peasants and workers had no one to speak for them and this group as a result never managed to take control.
4. Too much was attempted too soon with too few resources. Living on the margins of the periphery of global economy, room for negotiations was very limited and mistakes, costly. Over hasty efforts to use their so-called control of the state to nationalize industry, socialize agriculture, abolish markets, plan every major activity, produced economic collapse and severe structural disequilibrium in the national economy. In the breakdown of linkages that followed, a major detrimental channel of parallel black market structures opened up. Pushed to crossroads, compromises were made with the major global powers and financial institutions, class forces, the market,the role of incentives and non-socialist relations of production (Munslow,1986:5).
5. At the top of the list of internal problems was governmental inefficiency. There was a severe breakdown in many of the governmental sectors. The Unesco study reported:

> There is a tendency to avoid individual action and to procrastinate: delay has become endemic. The sense of individual responsibility and accountability has been lost. There are complaints of apathy and absenteeism (1989,IIpg.16).

Public utilities, roads, schools etc.were in a dilapidated state and efficiency in government offices had all but vanished. At independence Nyerere said we had three major enemies: poverty, ignorance and disease. Now there were six. Added to the list were inefficiency, corruption and irresponsibility. The institutions created to facilitate mass needs became obstacles to mass movement and motivation. The parastatals became parasitic and reports of gross inefficiency and embezzlement were daily occurrences reported in papers (Kiro,1985:124). Nyerere himself pointed out that revolutionary leaders capable of reforming society were yet to evolve. He observed:

> All too often leaders.....fail to show by their actions that they care for the people ...indicating that if a little 'chai' (bribe) is passed over, the matter can be speeded up (Nyerere,1977:40-1).

Structural and institutional deficiencies went hand in hand with others mentioned above to create the state of affairs the country found itself in.

6. Tanzania faced both man-made and natural crises at home in the form of economic failures, deficits, war with Uganda, floods and draughts, which took their toll in exacerbating the already monumental problems it faced in its thorny path to development. Together with these, powerful antagonistic forces were at play like the affluence in the neighbouring countries, capitalistic conspicuous consumption, cultural imperialism etc.
7. For a long time the elite stayed aversive to external evaluations of its performance and commentators praised the country based on its policy and stipulated goals. It created such a powerful impression on the world body that Tanzania received massive assistance in order to help it become self reliant. To date, many still remain highly impressed by the ideology.

An important point to consider, however, was that if any policy, however good, was not tailored to fit the population it was created for, then the fault would ultimately tend to lie more with the policy rather than on the people who would be made to implement it. However, if it was the people who voluntarily chose a policy among other alternatives then the blame could be shared. Nyerere's policies per se were commendable but they did not seem to match with the needs or capabilities of Tanzanians whose basic concerns were different from Nyerere's priorities. In the end, Nyerere felt his policies were good but the people let him down, and the population in turn felt betrayed by a political elite who forced a policy on to them when their basic needs and priorities of life were quite different. As a result of the economic changes that accompanied the socialist policies the poor became poorer, the quality of education deteriorated to its worse since independence and although more went to school, the country found itself in greater debt than ever before. The socialist cause suffered further with the stepping down of Nyerere from power.

Out of deep respect for Nyerere whatever he started was given a veneer of ambush enthusiasm but as soon as he was happy at having initiated a new reform drive, the impact started waning off with the result that the final fulfilment of the goal was seldom witnessed. Examples abound of either trickling off of reforms or contradictory policies being set to work simultaneously - examples include introducing S-R activities and letting them be implemented in a haphazard way; introducing character assessment and yet not giving them the due recognition in the final examinations; emphasizing Swahili at the primary level but not taking enough initiative to change the medium at the secondary level; creating rural schools but not providing the required facilities; dramatizing the participatory rhetoric but maintaining a very authoritarian, centralised and hierarchial structure; diversifying the secondary curriculum but not diverting the exam system from the 'core' subjects; controlling the expansion of state secondary education and emphasizing the egalitarian concept of equal access to schooling, and yet allowing private schools to flourish; stressing the terminality of each stage of education but retaining the academic curriculum together with a traditional exam pattern; emphasizing grassroots participation in policy formation and decision-making but continuously

sending out directives from top, for implementation.These are some of the discrepancies witnessed and recorded that contributed to the inefficacy of the ESR policies.

Finally mention must be made of some of the more overt contradictions existing presently in the educational system, largely as a result of the policy intervention. Nyerere had said, without democracy there could be no socialism but he hated opposition from people like Kambona, Babu, Bibi Titi Mohamed etc. He used detention and other forms of coercion to rule out all opposition to his policy on the home front. He emphasized participatory democracy and people's supreme power, but took most of the major decisions for the country behind closed doors in secrecy, at times just unilaterally. He insisted that Ujamaa values should come voluntarily but allowed force to be used on peasants to move them to Ujamaa villages. In the tensions between modern vs traditional his recent injunction was: hold fast to the basic principles of traditional living while we adapt its techniques to those of the 20th century. In the educational setting there was this major tension between social demand, manpower needs and individual goals. As a result of the elitist selection system, schools remained the chief vehicles of social mobility but the ESR goals expected students to receive education for service to the community. In the classrooms authoritarian relationships reinforced passivity while the teacher talked of the virtues of creativity and critical thinking. Cooperatives, which are basically socialist institutions,that were created prior to the inception of AD and ESR, were banned soon after the declaration of the new policy in Tanzania. Mwongozo encouraged the workers to be militant but when they did they were suppressed. Nyerere fought for racial equality but made TANU an all black-Tanzanian party. He nationalized businesses and buildings to eradicate exploitation and then created parastatals that soon developed parasitic and corrupt practices. Equality of opportunity was emphasized in the educational context but elitist structures were fiercely guarded. The policy emphasized the need to improve the quality of life of the peasants but it systematically underplayed the importance of economic growth. Equality was all important in socialism but regional inequality by way of the number of schools and provision of other facilities was on the rise. While the vision was consistently socialist the practice remained largely capitalist. Since the inception of the self-reliance policy dependency has been on the increase in all areas including food. Tension remained in areas such as: quality vs quantity, 'red' vs 'expert', efficiency vs equality, 'correspondence'vs 'contradiction', moral vs material incentives, politics vs productivity, elite leadership vs mass participation, insularity vs dependency, nation vs region, political goals of schooling vs wider societal goals, social transformation vs skills and selection etc.

A class-oriented bureaucracy was made responsible for promoting egalitarian democratic participation. Decentralization led to greater central controls. An ideology emphasizing democracy was imposed on to a populace. Nationalization of schools meant simply confiscating the existing buildings and yet self-reliance could

not be maintained in even its regular upkeep: true self-reliance would be building your own schools. Nyerere's constant questioning and uncertainty about the best means to resolve these contradictions has been both the greatest strength and weakness of the Tanzanian experiment.

7.4. Final considerations and Recommendations.

Of the two sets of factors enumerated above, it is this author's belief that the endogenous factors, by far, played the major role in the failure of the schools in implementing the ESR policy. A major question that emerged in relation to the endogenous factors was, 'could schools really shoulder the task of bringing about a cultural transformation through the school children, given the reality that the untransformed adults remained at the helm of the policy initiatives and implementation?'

What was perhaps most required was a conducive school environment, created to give the students freedom and responsibility to initiate, plan and pursue the self-reliance activities according to their interests and backgrounds. The schools on their part needed to provide the required expertise in the areas of planning, research, farming methods, accounting, markets etc. Having thus created an appropriate physical setting, a carefully planned ideological enculturation programme would have perhaps helped instil in the young minds the logic and value for co-operative activities, and make the students see the profound wisdom in treating all human beings as equals.

As for the societal input, simultaneous structural changes were absolutely essential in all the other institutions of the society so that students could be inspired to learn as much from example as from knowledge acquired from the classrooms. Educational change and social change are reciprocal and one cannot be instituted without the other.

The doctrine of 'Ujamma' and ESR was not to be preached but practised and lived out. Neither was it to be instituted by sending out directives from the top of the hierarchy to the bottom but evolved through praxis and active participation of all the parties involved in the exercise.

Finally, mention must be made of a crucial human factor that was largely ignored by the leadership in Tanzania. A basic understanding of human nature and past historical experience has generally shown that for any effective action or sustained change to take place in society, either of the two basic conditions need to be present: a strong incentive to evoke action and commitment, or a well-organised coercive system in place to institute action through legal and forceful methods. In Tanzania neither of the two conditions were present. Generally, any

new ideas or innovations involving human beings need to be well planned, and explained to the participants before they can be executed with any success. Dialogue and pilot projecting leads to the refinement of the projects and enhances the chances of their receiving commitment and responsible action.

In conclusion then, despite the relative clarity and radical nature of the objectives of ESR and AD, and the strength of the top leadership, Tanzania experienced great difficulty in using schools as a tool to bring about a socialist transformation in society. Socialist changes in one segment of the population - the school going segment - failed to win acceptance, confidence and support of the students, parents and the population at large. In its efforts at de-emphasizing formal educational credentials by attempting to break the hierarchical nature of the societal structure, Nyerere ran into complex problems, starting with the colonial attitudinal hangovers, to gross inefficiency and sabotage among his own self-created bureaucracy. Moreover, as long as the overwhelming benefits (monetary and social mobility) went to those with the highest formal education it became unrealistic to promote changes that offered a 'second rate' education that prepared the majority to return to rural areas and to integrate with the village communities.

This study was undertaken with the specific purpose of identifying the causes of the inefficacy of the reforms in the school system. The problems were analyzed at three levels: the ideological consistency, the strategy formation style and the implementation tactics. Each of the eight areas of reforms identified in the ESR were systematically examined and the performance evaluated.

In our efforts at assessing the extent to which schools could perform certain social functions, as prescribed by the policy makers, given the constraints operating within and outside the school system, we identified a number of causes and contradictions that contributed to the limited impact of the reforms in schools, and the impact of schools on the society. The overall recommendation of this study is that the planning of any educational reforms has to be accompanied by a rational and systematic needs-assessment of the population for whom the reforms are planned. As a prerequisite, rigorous feasibility studies need to be undertaken as part of the reform experiment in order to juxtapose the various goals with the human and material resource availability and psychological preparedness of the larger population at hand. It is the conclusion of this thesis that while Nyerere's policies and intentions were noble, the people of Tanzania were neither capable and receptive enough to implement the reforms nor were the circumstances conducive to the fulfilment of this grand socialist vision.

SELECTED BIBLIOGRAPHY

Akwenye, O.S. (1974) Education For Self-Reliance in Tanzania: From Theory to Practice, 1969 - 1974. Montreal, McGill University.

Almasi, O (1982) Fifteen Years of Education for Self-Reliance in Secondary Schools in Tanzania: A Critical Appraisal. Paris, U N E S C O, I I E P.

Almasi, O (1985) Implementation of Education for Self-Reliance: The Case Bias-Designed and Bias-Adapted Agricultural Secondary Schools. M.A. Dissertation. Department of Education University of Dar-es-Salaam.

Apple, M. W. (1978) The New Sociology of Education: Analysing Cultural and Economic Production, in Harvard Education Review 58(4) Nov. 459-503.

Altbach, P.G.(1982) "Servitude of the mind? Educational Dependency and the Neocolonialism," in Comparative Education (ed), Altbach, P.G. Kelly and Arnove.N.Y.Macmillan pp469-484.

Amin, S. (1969) The Class Struggle in Africa Africa Research Group.N.Y.

Apter, David (ed)(1964) Ideology and Discontent. Free Press, N.Y.

Arrighi, G. and John S. Saul (1973) Socialism and Economic Development in Tropical Africa. Monthly Press Review, N.Y.

Babu, A.R.M. (1984) Whither Africa? in Africa Now, July 1984

Baguma, R. (1977) Decentralization and Popular Participation in Planning For Rural Development in TAAMULI, 7, (2) Dec. Baran, Paul (1957) The Political Economy of Growth Monthly Review Press, N.Y.

Bates, T.R.(1975) "Gramsci and the Theory of Hegemony," in Journal of the History of Ideas. Philadelphia 351-66.

Baume, Carol (1983) "Self-Reliance Activities in Tanzanian Schools". Stanford University, School of Education. (Mimeo)

Bennett, H.(1963) Studies in East Africa History. Boston.

Besha, M.R.(1973) Education For Self-Reliance and Rural Development. Dar-es-Salaam. Institute of Education.

Bienefeld, M.(1982) "Tanzania: Model or Anti-model?" in Bienefeld, M and M.Godfrey (eds) The Struggle for Development: National Strategies in an International Context. Wiley,N.Y. 293-322

Blackmore, K and Brian Cooksey (1981) A Sociology of Education For Africa. George Allen and Unwin, London.

Blang, M. (1966) "Literacy and Economic Development," in The School Review. Winter.

Blomstrom M. and Bjorn Hettne (1984), Development Theory in Transition. Zed Press.

Boesen, J. and Philip Raikes (1976) Political Economy and Planning in Tanzania. IDR Papers. A 76.6. Copenhagen.

Bourdieu, Pierre and Jean-Claude Passeron, (1977) Reproduction In Education, Society and Culture. Beverly Hills: Sage Publication

Bowles, S. (1980) "Education, Class Conflict and Uneven Development," in The Educational Dilemma.

Bowles, S. and Herbert Gintis (1976) Schooling in capitalist America. N.Y. Basic Books.

Brown, G.N. and M. Hiskett (1975) Conflict and Harmony in Education in Tropical Africa. Allen and Unwin, London

Burke, F.G. (1964) "Tanganyika: The Search for Ujamaa" in Friedland, W.H. and C.G. Roseberg Jr. African Socialism Hoover Institution. Stanford, California.

Busia, K. (1962) The Challenge of Africa. N.Y. Doubleday.

Cagen, E. (1978) "Individualism, Collectivism and Radical Educational Reform," in Harvard Educational Review,2,1978 p.261.

Callaway, A.(1972) "Planning Out-of-School Education for Development," in Planning Out-of-school Education for Development (ed) by J. Ryan Paris: Unesco. IIEP.

Cameron, John (1970) The Development of Education in East Africa. Teachers' College Press, N.Y.

Cameron, J. and W.A. Dodd (1970) Society, Schools and Progress in Tanzania. Oxford: Pergamon Press.

Carnoy, Martin (1974) Education as Cultural Imperialism Mckay, N.Y.

Carnoy, M. and Joel Samoff (ed) (1990) Education and Social Transition in Third World Countries. Princeton University Press, N.J.

Carr-Hill, R. (1984) Primary Education in Tanzania. A Review of Research. Education Division Documents No 16. SIDA Sept. 1984. Stockholm.

Castle Commission (1963) Education in Uganda. Government of Uganda Records.1963:34.

Castle, E. (1966) Growing Up in East Africa. London, OUP.

Chamungwana, W.M.S. Socialization Problems in Tanzania: An Appraisal of Self-Reliance as a Strategy for Cultural Transformation in TAAMULI, 5 (1) Dec.1974.p3-17.

Cheru, F. (1987) Dependence Underdevelopment and Unemployment in Kenya University Press of America.N.Y.

Clark, W.E. (1978) Socialist Development and Public Investment in Tanzania 1964-1973. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.

Cliffe, Lionel (1973) "Socialist Education in Tanzania," in Cliff, L and John S. Saul (ed)(1973) Socialism in Tanzania Vol. 2. East African Publishing House, Dar-es-Salaam.

Cliffe, L.(1978) "A Revolutionary Transition to Socialism?" in M.Palmberg, Problems of Socialist Organisation in Africa. Uppsala: SIAS PP 38-43.

Coleman, J.S.(ed)(1965) Education and Political Development Princeton, N.J. Princeton University Press.

Collingwood, R.G.(1961) The Idea of History. Oxford University Press, London.

Collins C. (1977) "Mozambique: Education for the people," in Southern Africa (June/July). 21-23.

Cooksey, Brian and Abel Ishumi (1986) "A Critical Review of policy and practice in Tanzania Secondary Education since 1967" Dar-es-Salaam. Mimeo.

Coombs, Philip (1985). The World Crisis in Education: The View From the Eighties. N.Y. O.U.P.

Coulson, Andrew (ed)(1979) African Socialism in Practice. London: Spokesman.

Coulson, A. (1982) Tanzania: A Political Economy. Oxford: Clarendon Press.

Court, David (1975) Education As Social Control: The Response To Inequality in Kenya and Tanzania. Discussion Paper 217. IDS. University of Nairobi.

Court, David (1973) The Social Function of Formal Schooling in Tanzania" in The African Review 3(4) 1973.

Court, David and Karibu Kinyanfui (1980) "Development Policy and Educational Opportunity: The Experience of Kenya and Tanzania" in Gabriel Carron an Ta Ngoc Chau (eds). Regional Disparities in Educational Development. Paris:UNESCO/IIEP.

Criper, C. and W. Dodd (1984) A Report on the Teaching of the English Language and its use as a medium in education in Tanzania. ODA/British Council.

Crosland, C.A.R.(1962) The Conservative Enemy N.Y. Stocken Books. p122.

Crowfoot, J.E. and M.A. Chester (1974) "Contemporary Perspectives on Planned Social change: A comparision," in Journal of Applied Behavioral Science. 10 (July/August/Sept): 278-303.

Daily News. Dated the following: 11-2-67; 14-7-72; 13-2-1973; 14-11-14-11-73; 24-10-84; 23 & 24-11-88; 21-5-1991; 21-11-91.

Dale, Roger (1982) "Education and the Capitalist State: Contribution and Contradictions," in Michael Apple (ed) Cultural and Economic Reproduction in Education. Routledge and Paul. London.

Dalton, G. (1969) "Tribal and Peasant Economies," in The Quarterly Journal of Economics LXXVI

Dobson, E.B.(1955) "Comparative Land Tenure of Ten Tanganyika Tribes, "Tanganyika Notes and Records. March, 1955.

Dore, Ronald (1976) The Diploma Disease: Education, Qualification and Development. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Dror, Y.(1968) Public Policy Making Re-examined Chandler, San Francisco.

Dubbledam, L. (1970) The Primary School and the Community in Mwanza District, Tanzania Groningen: Wolters - Noordhoff.

Dumont, R. (1966) False Start in Africa. London. Andre-Deutch.

Dunn, W.N.(1969) Public Policy Analysis: An Introduction. Prentice Hall. Englewood Cliffs. N.J.

Dye, T. (1978) Understanding Public Policy. Prentice Hall. Englewood Cliffs. N.J.

Elietimize, F.M.S. (1981) Problems of Teaching Political Education in Secondary Schools. M.A. Dissertation, Department of Education. University of Dar-es-Salaam.

Ergas, Zaki. (1982) "Can Education Be Used as a Tool to Build a Socialist Society in Africa? - the Tanzanian Case," in Journal of Modern African Studies 20(4)pp571-594.

Ergas, Zaki (ed)(1987) The African State in Transition MacMillan press, London.

Foster, Philip (1969) "Education for Self-Reliance: A Critical Evaluation" in Jolly,R(ed) Education in Africa: Research and Action. Nairobi: EAPH.Freyhold, Von M.(1979)Ujamaa Villages in Tanzania: Analysis of a Local Experiment. N.Y. Monthly Press Review.

Friedland, W.H.(1964) "Basic Social Trends" in Friedland, William and Carl Rosberg Jr. (ed) African Socialism Hoover Institute Stanford, U.S.A.

Fuenzalide, Edmundo (1983) "The Reception of Scientific Socialism in Chile, "Latin American Research Review 18 (2):pp95-112.

Gandye, p.p. (1978) Public Examinations in Tanzania 1926-1976. Unpublished M.A. Disertation, University of Massey.

Gillette, A.L. (1977) Beyond the Non-Formal Fashion: Towards Educational Revolution in Tanzania. Amherst, Mass: University of Massachusetts Centre for International Education.

Gillette, A.L. and S.Spaudling (1975) The Experimental World Projects. Paris: UNESCO. ED - 75 (Mimeo)

Gluckmann, Max (1982) Politics, Law and Ritual in Tribal Society. Oxford.OUP.(1st. ed. 1965)

Goldelier, Maurice (1980) "The Object and Method of Economic Anthropology," in Sedon, David (ed) Relations of Production. Marxist Approaches to Economic Anthropology. London

Green, R. H. et. al.(1980) Economic Shocks and National Policy Making: Tanzania in the 1970s. The Hague: Institute of Social Studies.

Grol-Overling, A.C.(1969) "The School in CESO Primary Education in Sukumaland." Groningen, Nehterlands: Wolters - Noordnoff (Mimeo).

Habermas, J (1975)Legitimation Crisis. Boston: Beacon Press.

Hall, Budd (1975) Adult Education and the Development of Socialism in Tanzania. East African Literature Bureau.

Hanson,J.W. and C.W . Brembeck (eds) 1966. Education and the Development of Nations.
N.Y. Holt, Rinehart and Winston.

Harbison, F (1967) "The Generation of Employment," in Sheffield, James (ed) Education, Employment and Rural Development. EPH.1967.

Harbison, F and C.A. Myers (eds).1964. Education, Manpower and Economic Growth : Strategies of Human Resources Development. N.Y. Mcgraw Hill Book Co. Harrington, M (1976) Socialism. Boston. Quoted by Pratt. in Mwansasu and Pratt.

Harris, kevin (1982) Education and Knowledge. R and K Paul. London.

Hatch, John (1972) Tanzania. A Profile. Praeger Publishers. N.Y.

Hatch, John (1975) "Africa's Harvest of Hope," in The Guardian, London 11th Feb. 1975.

Hirschman, A.D.(1965) Journeys Towards Progress. N.Y. Doubleday.

Hood, Michael (ed)(1988) Tanzania After Nyerere Pinter Publishers, London

Hinzen, H and V.H. Hurisdorfer (eds)(1982) The Tanzanian Experience education for Liberation and Development. UNESCO Institute of Education, Hamburg.

Huq, M.S. (1965) Education and Development Strategy in South and South - East Asia. Honolulu. East-West Centre Press.

Hyden, Goran (1979) "Administration and Public Policy in Tanzania and Kenya" in Barkan, J.D. and J.J. Okumu (eds) Politics and Public Policy in Kenya and Tanzania. N.Y. Praeger.

Hyden, Goran (1980) Beyond Ujamaa in Tanzania: Underdevelopment and an Uncaptured Peasantry. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Hyden, G. (1979) "`We Must Run while others Walk': Policy Making for Socialist Development in the Tanzania-Type of Politics," in Kwan S. Kim et.al (eds). Papers on the Political Economy of Tanzania, 5-13. Nairobi. Heinemann.

I L O (1982) Basic Needs in Danger: A Basic Needs Oriented Strategy for Tanzania. Addis Ababa: ILO office, Jobs and Skills Program for Africa.

Ishumi, Abel G.M.(1974) Community Education And Development. Ph.D Thesis. Dept. of Education. Univerisity of Dar-es-Salaam. Ishumi, A.G.M (1984) The Urban Jobless in Eastern Africa. Scandinavian Institute of African Studies, Uppsala (1983-84) Ishumi, A.G.M (1984) "Educational Planning: Its Meaning and its Relevancy to Developing Countries," in Hetland A and A.G.M Ishumi Educational Planning in Developing Countries. Almqvist and Wiksell Inter. Stockholm, Institutional Frame Work for ESR: Adequecies and Inadequacies (mimeo).

Jencks, C. et al (1972) "The Quality of Data Collected by the `Equality of Educational Opportunity' survey," in Mosteller and D.P. Moynihan (eds) On equality of Educational Opportunity. N.Y. Basic Books.

Kamm, Mary (1977) "Problems of Youth and School Leavers," in The Young Child in Tanzania. T N S R C and U N E S C O. 1977.

Kaplan, I (ed) (1978) Tanzania. A Country Study. The American University. Washington D.C.

Karioki, J.N. (1979) Tanzania's Human Revolution. Pennsylvania State University Press. Park and London.

Kawawa, R.M. (1967) Speech to the Conference on Implementation of Arusha Declaration and the Policy Statement on ESR. April 13th.

Kenyatta, Jomo (1959) Facing Mount Kenya. London: Secker and Warburg.

Kerner, D.O. (1985) Reading at Home is Like Dancing in a church: A Comparision of Educational Opportunities in Two Tanzanian Regions. Paper Presented at AAAAM, Washington D.C. (December, 5, 1985).

Kilimhana, S.N.M.(1975) An Evaluation of the Kwamsisi Experimental Project in Tanzania. M.A. Dissertation. University of Alberta.1975.

Kimaro, I and A. Temu (eds) 1970 A History of Tanzania, EAPH.

King, K. (1984) The End of ESR in Tanzania?
Edinburgh University. Occasional Papers I Centre for African Studies.

Kinshaga, D.Y.1977 An Analysis of the Existing Primary School Curriculum in Relation to Rural Transformation in Mainland Tanzania. A Case Study of Kisiriri in Iramba District. M.A. Dissertation. University of Dar-es-Salaam 1977.

Kiros, F.G. (ed) 1985 Challenging Rural Poverty. Africa World Press. N.J.

Kitching, Gavin (1982) Development and Under-development in Historical Perspective: Populism, Nationalism and Industrialization. Methuen, London.

Kluchnikov, B.K.(1977)Education Reform: Definitions, Critical Synthesis of Major Problem Areas. Paris. UNESCO Report Studies.s.34.

Kopytoff, Igor (1964) "Socialism and Traditional African Society," in Friedland, W.H. and C. Rosberg (eds) African Socialism. Stanford.

Kurtz, Laura (1972) An African Education: The Social Revolution in Tanzania. Pageant Poseidon Limited. N.Y.

Langellier, Jean-Pierre (1980) "Tanzania - Africa's Conscience," The Guardian Weekly Nov. 16,1980.

Lema, A.A.(1972) Educationa For Self-Reliance: A Brief Survey of Some Self-Relience Activities in Some Tanzania Schools and Colleges. University of Dar-es-Salaam. Institute of Education.

Lema, A.A, (1973) Education for Self-Reliance: Old Attitudes Die Hard. Studies in Curriculum Development No. 3. (pp 29-46).

Leonor, M.D. (1983) Basic Needs and Employment: Unemployment and the Education System in Tanzania. ILO. WEP 2-32/WP-50.

Leys, C. (1976) "The `Overdeveloped' Post-Colonial State: A re-evaluation," in Review of African Political Economy (January - April) 5:39-48.

Liston, D.P. (1988) Capitalist Schools: Explanation and Ethics in Radical Studies of Schooling. Routledge. N.Y.

Locke, J. (1965) "The Second Treatise of Government" 1965. 4 and 34 in An Essay Concerning Human Understanding (ed) Maurice Cranston. London. Collier MacMillan.

Lofchie, Michael (1978) "Agrarian Crisis and Economic Liberalization in Tanzania," in Journal of Modern African Studies 16 (3) Sept. pp 451-75.

Lubasha, G.S. (1981) UPE for What?: An Economic, Social, and Educational Study to Solve the Problem of Primary School Leavers in Tanzania. M.A. Dissertation, Dept.of Education. University of Dar-es-Salaam.

Malekela, G.A. (1977) Occupational Expectations of Primary School Pupils and their Parents: A Case Study of Nshara Hai District, Tanzania. Unpublished M.A. Dissertation University of Dar-es-Salaam.

Malekela, G.A. (1983) "Socio-economic Status origins: The Case of Tanzanian Secondary School Students." Paper presented at Staff seminar, Dept of Education. University of Dar-es-Salaam.

Malekela, G.A. (1985) "After UPE what?" in UPE and Village Based Teacher Training Program in Tanzania. Ministry of Education Dar-es-Salaam.

Maliyamkono, T.L (1983) "Decolonisation and Self-Reliance," in John Simmons (ed) Better Schools: International Lessons for Reform. Praeger Publishers. N.Y. pp 249-288.

Mazrui, Ali A. (1972) Cultural Engineering and Nation Building in East Africa. Evanston: North Western University Press.

Mbilinyi, Marjorie (1973) "Education, Stratification and Sexism in Tanzania: Policy Implication," African Review 3(2): 327-40.

Mbilinyi, M.(1976) "Peasant Education in Tanzania," in The African Review, 6(2) 1976 pp 167-253.

Mbilinyi, M. (1977) "Basic Education: Tool of Exploitation or Liberation?" Prospects. Dec. 1977.

Mbilinyi, M.(1979) "Contraditions in Tanzania Educational Reform," in Coulson,(1979). 217-27.

Mbilinyi, M.(1980) "Education for Rural Life or Education for Socialist Transformation," in Studies in Curriculum Development. No.7. Inst of Edu. University of Dar-es-Salaam.

McClelland, D.C.(1961) The Achieving Society. Princeton, N.J.

McHenry, Dean (1979) "The Struggle for Rural Socialism," in Rosberg and Callaghy (eds) Socialism in Sub-Saharan Africa. University of California. Berkeley.

Meillassoux, Claude(1981) Maidens, Meal, and Money. Cambridge.

Meister, Albert (1966) East Africa: The Past in Chains The Future In Pawn. Walker and Co. N.Y.

Merrit, R.L. and F.S. Coombs (1977) "Politics and Educational Reform," in Comparative Educational Review, 24,(1) pp.247-275.

Meynes, P.(1973). "Some Aspects of Planning and Socialism in Tanzania," in Cliffe and Saul(ed) Socialism in Tanzania.Vol.2 Policies, EAPH. Dar-es-Salaam.

Ministry of Education Circular No 2 1967. Budget Speeches 1981-1982-1983-1984. Dar-es-Salaam. Government printers.

Ministry of Education United Republic of Tanzania. Educational Systems (1984) in Tanzania: Towards the Year 2000. Presidential Commission on Education. Dar-es-Salaam M of E (1981) Musoma Resolutions: Directive on Implementation of ESR, 1974. Govt.Printers. Dar-es-Salaam.

Ministry of Labour and Manpower Development (1984) Tracer Study of Secondary School Leavers. Dar-es-Salaam. Manpower Planning Division.

Mmari, G.V.(1977) "Attempts to Link-School with work: The Tanzanian Experience," in Prospects 7(3) 1977 pp. 379-88.

Mofett, J.B.(1968)"The Primary Schools of Lagos, Nigeria," in West African Journal of Education 12(1):29-33.

Mohiddin, Ahmed (1981) African Socialism in Two Countries. Croom Helm. London.

Montgomary, J.D. and M.J.Esman. "Popular Participation in Development Administration," in Journal of Comparative Administration, Nov.`71 pp.374-78.

Mopulu, H (1973) "Tradition And Quest For Socialism," in TAAMULI, 4(1) Dec.1973. University of Dar-es-Salaam.

Morris, Jon (1976) The Transferability of the Western Management Tradition into the Public Service Sector: An East African Perspective, Paper Presented to ICME (Mimeo)

Morrison, D.R.(1976) Education and Politics in Africa: The Tanzanian Case. Montreal: McGill-Queen's Univeristy Press.

Mosha, H.J.(1990) "Twenty Years After Education For Self-Reliance: A Critical Review," in International Journal of Educational Development 10 (1) pp. 59.67.

Moumouni, A. (1968) Education in Africa. London: Deutsch

Msekwa, P. and T.L. Maliyamkono (1978) The Experiments in educational Policy Formation in Tanzania Before and After Arusha. Dar.University of Dar-es-Salaam.

Mudoola, Dan (1985). "The Pathology of Institution Building - The Tanzanian Case," in Kiros Fassil (ed) Challenging Rural Poverty, 117-125.

Mueller, Susanne D. (1980) "Retarded Capitalism in Tanzania," in Ralph Miliband and John Saville, (eds) Socialist Register 1980, 203-26. London.Merlin Press.

Mukyanuzi, F. (1985) The Political Economy of Educational Reforms in Tanzania: The Secondary Education Curriculum and National Development. Ph.D. Dissertation. Stanford University.

Mullins, William A. "On the concept of Ideology," in Political Science in American Political Science Review Vol. 1. LXVI. No 2.

Muncie, P. (1973) Torches in the Night: Educational Experiences in Tanzania and the Ivory Coast. Washington,D.C.: World Bank. 1973.

Munslow, Barry (ed) 1986 Africa. Problems in the Transition to Socialism. Zed Books,N.J. U.S.A. 1986.

Mushi, Samuel (1971) "Ujamaa: Modernisation by Traditionalization," TAAMULI, 1 (2) Dar-es-Salaam. March, 1971.pp.13-29.

Mwansasu, B and C. Pratt (1979) Towards Socialism in Tanzania. University of Toronto Press. Toronto OUP. London.

Mwobahe, B.L.and M.J. Mbilinyi. (1975) Challenge of Education for Self-Reliance. Dar-es-Salaam Institute of Education.

Nadel, S (1942) A Black Byzantium London. Oxford University Press.

Ndunguru, S.(1976) Educational Essays for Teachers. East African Literature Bureau. Nairobi.

Nellis, John S.(1972) A Theory of Ideology : The Tanzanian Example. Nairobi.O.P.U.

Ngware, S.S.A.(1989) Tanzania's Educational Reforms, 1977-1987. Policy Analysis and Implications for Secondary Education. Unpublished Ph.D. Thesis. University of Minnesota.

Nkonoki, S.R. (1977) Education For Self-Reliance: An Analysis of Nyerere's Philosophy of Education and its Implementation in Secondary Schools. Ph.D. Thesis, Department of Education, University of Dar-es-Salaam.

Nkurumah, N. (1966) "African Socialism Revisited," in African Forum. 1(3) 1966.

Nyerere, J.K. (1966) Freedom and Unity. A Selection from Writings and Speeches. 1952-65. Dar-es-Salaam: O.U.P.

(1968) Freedom and Socialism. A Selection From Writings and Speeches 1965-1967. Dar-es-Salaam: O.P.U.

(1968) Freedom and Development. A Selection of Writings and Speeches (1968-73). Dar-es-Salaam: O.P.U.

(1977) The Arusha Declaration, Ten Years and After. Dar-es-Salaam: Government Printers.

Odia, S. (1971) "Rural Education and Training in Tanzania," in International Labour Review. Geneva, ILO, January.

Offe, Claus.(ed)(1975) Stress and Contradiction in Mordern Capitalism. Lexington, Mass. Lex Books.

Okoh, J.D. (1980) Julius Nyerere's Social Philosophy and its Implications for Education. Unpublished Ph.D. Thesis. University of Alberta.Oliver, Roland. (1952)

Oliver, Roland 1952. The Missionary Factor in East Africa. London,Longmans.

Omari, I.M. (1982) Diversification of Secondary School Curriculum and Learning Outcomes: Some Preliminary Results. Paper Presented at the Arusha Workshop on Decentralization.

Omari, I.M.et al.(1983) Univarsal Primary Education in Tanzania. IDRC/TS 42. Ottawa.

Omari, I.M. (1984) The Predicament of D and V of Secondary Education in Developing Countries. Experiences from Tanzania. Education Department. World Bank. Washington (Mimeo).

Omari I.M. and H.J. Mosha (1987) The Quality of Primary Education in Tanzania. Man Graphics, Nairobi.

Omwony-Ojwok (1977) "Review of Debate on Imperialism, State, Class and the National Question," in Yash Tendon (ed) Debate on Class, State and Imperialism. Tanzania Publishing House, Dar-es-Salaam.

Ottaway, Marina S.(1987) "The Crisis of the Socialist State in Africa," in Zaki Ergas (ed) The African State in Transition. MacMillan Press, London.

Ottaway, David and Marina (1981). Afrocommunism. N.Y. Holmes and Meier.

Pendaeli, E. D. (1983) The Diversification of Lower Secondary Education and Access to Higher Secondary Education. Unpublished Masters Thesis. University of Dar-es-Salaam.

Pendaeli, J.(1988). Critical Issues and Problems for the School Curriculum in Tanzania. (Mimeo).

Pratt, Cranford (1976). The Critical Phase in Tanzania 1945-1968: Nyerere and the Emergence of a Socialist Strategy. Cambridge, England: Cambridge University Press.

Psacharopolous, G.(1986) Curriculum Diversification, Cognitive Achievment and Economic Performance: Evidence from Columbia and Tanzania. The World bank. London.

Psacharopolous, G.and W. Loxley (1985). Diversified Secondary Education and Development: Evidence from Columbia and Tanzania. Baltimore: John Hopkins University Press.

Radcliffe-Brown, A.R. (1979) Structure and Function in Primitive Society. Lon. Preface in Fortes and Evans-Pritchart(eds) xi-

Rejai, Mustafa. "African Socialism: An Appraisal," in International Philosophical Quaterly. 9 (3).

Reporter, Kenya. July, 2nd. 1965.

Republic of Kenya. African Socialism. Quoted by David Court.1975.

Resnick, Idrian N.(ed) (1968). Tanzania: Revolution by Education. Arusha, Longmans.

Roberts, Margret (1965) "A Socialist Look at African Socialism," in Friedland and Rosberg, African Socialism. (eds).

Rodney, Walter.(1972). How Europe Underdeveloped Africa. Tanzania Publishing House, Dar-es-Salaam.

Rodney, Walter.(1974) Education and Black Struggle. Boston: Harvard Educational Review.

Rosenberg, C.G. and T. Callaghy (eds) (1979) Socialism in Sub-Saharan Africa. Berkeley, University of California. C.I.S.

Samoff, Joel (1979) "Education in Tanzania, Class Formation and Reproduction," in the
Journal of Modern African Studies. XVII, pp.49-69.

Samoff, Joel (1981) "Crisis and Socialism in Tanzania" in the Journal of Modern African Studies. XIX(2) June, pp. 279-306.

Samoff, Joel (1990) "`Modernizing' a Socialist Vision: Education in Tanzania," in Education and Social Transition in the Third World ed. by M.Carnoy and J. Samoff.

Santos, Theotonio Dos (1973) "The Structure of Dependence," in The Political Economy of Development and Underdevelopment. ed. by Charles Wilbur. N.Y. Random House.

Sarup, Madan (1978) Marxism and Education. Routledge and K. Paul.

Saul, J. S. (1972) "Nyerere on Socialism: A Review," in State and Revolution in Eastern
Africa. Monthly Review Press. N.Y.

Saul, J.S. (1990) Socialist Ideology and the Struggle for Southern Africa. Africa World Press, N.J.

Saudie, M. M. (1967) "Recent Trends in African Socialism," in African Quarterly. Vol.III (3) pg.265.

Saunders, M. (1982) "Productive Activity in the Curriculum: Changing the Literate Bias of Secondary Schools in Tanzania," in British Journal of Sociology of Education III (1) pp.39-55.

Schurmann, Franz. Ideology and Organization in Communist China. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Sheffield, James(1969) "Rural Education in Africa. A Status Report," in Rural Africana. No. 9. Fall.pp.9-12.

Shivji, Issa (1976) Class Struggle in Tanzania. Monthly Review Press,N.Y. Shivji, Issa(ed)(1985) The State and the Working People in Tanzania. Dakar: Codesria.

Sjoberg, Gideon (1963). Political Structure, Ideology and Economic Development. Paper Presented at Carnegie Faculty Seminar on Political and Administrative Development. Bloomington, Indiana: Indiana University.

Sprinzek, Ehud (1973) "African Traditional Socialism - a Semantic Analysis of Political Ideology," in the Journal of Modern African Studies. XI(4) pp.629 - 647.

Stabler, Earnest (1979) "Kenya and Tanzania: Strategies and Realities in Education and Development," in African Affairs. 78 (310) January.

Streeten, P. (1972). The Frontiers of Development Studies. MacMillan, London.

Svendsen, K.E.1967. "Socialist Problems After the Arusha Declaration," in the East African Journal. IV. (2).

Swantz, M.L. (1977) "Youth in Less Developed Coastal Areas: Bagamoyo District," in The Young Child in Tanzania.

T.A.N.U. (1954) The Proceedings of the National Committee Meeting, Musoma. Government Printers, Dar-es-Salaam.

TNSRC and UNESCO.(1977) The Young Child in Tanzania. Univ. of Dar-es-Salaam.

Univ.of Dar-es-Salaam (1976) Teaching Practice Study Exercise III.

Temu, E. (1985) Demands on the Public Sector for Trained Agricultural Economists in Africa. Paper Presented at the Agricultural Economists' Conference in Harare, Zimbabwe. 26 - 30 March.

Thomas, Clive (1978). "Class Struggle, Social Development and the Theory of the Non-capitalist Path," in Palmberg, 11-37.

Thomas, J.J. (1925) Education in East Africa. Edinburgh House Press, London. Report of The Phelp-Stokes Commission.

Tordoff, W. (1967) Government and Politics in Tanzania. MacMillan: London.

Toroka, S. (1973) "ESR: The Litowa Experiment," in Socialism in Tanzania. Volume II. Policies. by L. Cliffe and J.S. Saul eds. Pergamon, Oxford.

U N E S C O (1989) Education in Tanzania. Sector Review. Volume I and II Report 38. Paris (Education Financing Division).

United Republic of Tanzania (1969; 1976) Second and Third Five Year Development Plans. Government Printers.

Vacchi, L. (1973) Political Education in Tanzania. Terzo Mondo, Milan.

Valentine, T. (1983) "Wage Adjustments, Progressive Tax Rates and Accelerated Inflation: Issues of Equity in the Wage Sector of Tanzania," in African Studies Review.

Varkevisser, C.M. (1973) Socialization in a Changing Society: Sukuma Childhood in Rural and Urban Mwanza, Tanzania. The Hague: CSECS.

Verba, S. (1965) "Comparative Political Culture," in Political Culture and Political Development. by Sidney Verba and Lucian Pye (eds).

Weber, Max (1947) The Theory of Social and Economic Organization. (ed) Talcott Parsons. N.Y. Oxford University Press.

Weeks, Sheldon (1969) "Agricultural Education in Africa," in Rural Africana. No. 9. Fall 1969. pp.49-52.

Weiler, Hans (1981) The Politics of Educational Reforms: Notes on the Comparative Study of Innovations in Education. Stanford University.

Yeager, Rodger (1982) Tanzania. An African Experiment. Westview Press, Colorado.

Young, C. (1982) Ideology and Development in Africa. N.H. Yale University Press.

Zanolli, N.V. (1971) Education Towards Development in Tanzania. Basel: